

## BOOK REVIEWS

S.M. Ikram, *Modern Muslim India and the Birth of Pakistan*. Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore, 1977. Demy 8vo., pp. 535 with index and bibliography. Rs 60.

This is the third edition of the book which was first published as *Makers of Pakistan and Modern Muslim India* by the author under the pseudonym of "Albiruni" in 1950. It covers a period of Muslim struggle for freedom and a few years after Independence (1858-1951) This is a much better produced edition. The earlier book was planned as an account of the lives and activities of leading Muslim leaders who led the Muslims to the establishment of Pakistan. Subsequently it was enlarged and its scope widened. It still remains a biographical account, but many new chapters on the background and historical developments have been added.

S.M. Ikram was a member of the Indian Civil Service, but he kept his scholarly interests alive. Besides producing a number of books in Urdu, he devoted some time in organising this book. He has not presented any new thesis in this book, but has organised the details in a systematic manner and in a readable form. The reader will be able to get a clear picture of Sayyid Ahmad Khan's policies and the deeds and achievements of the followers of his school of thought. The chapter on religious groups is very interesting, but his analysis is not as deep or thorough as that of Aziz Ahmad in his books. The reason why Ikram's book seems not to have gone in depth is that he has based all his arguments on published works and has not gone to the original sources. He usually accepts the conclusions of these authors and rarely tries to confirm or reject those views on the basis of study of original sources. In a number of cases he is more of a eulogist than a critical analyst,

The book consists of fifteen chapters and three appendices. Chapters on "The Beginnings in Bengal," "The Religious Groups," "Emergence of the Muslim Majority Provinces" are very informative and much work can be done on these topics. Ikram has only touched some of the aspects. In his chapter on Quaid-i Azam,

Ikram describes the intrigue that was hatched to hamper his work and the stupendous efforts that he had to make to achieve Pakistan.

This book, based on secondary sources, is one of the best books, written on the struggle of the Muslims to achieve Pakistan.

DR S. RAZI WASTI

\* \* \*

Mehr Afroz Murad, *Intellectual Modernism of Shibli Nu'mani*. Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore, 1976. Demy 8vo., pp. 135, with an appendix and index Rs 13.50.

This small book is a slightly changed version of the author's M.A. thesis submitted to the Institute of Islamic Studies, McGill University, Montreal, Canada. The Author has studied in three chapters Shibli's intellectual personality as it appeared to her through his religious and political writings. Shibli was one of those intellectual giants that strode on the scene of Muslim intellectual world in India during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. He also became a controversial figure in his lifetime. He possessed a restless and mercurial soul and was also conscious of the changing pressures of his times and environs. Basically he was a liberal, but at times he appeared to be a reactionary reformer. He was a courageous man who did not feel hesitant to take up cudgels with Sayyid Ahmad Khan. In matters of theology, law and politics, he showed an increasingly realistic and modern liberal tendency. The author, however, suggests that Shibli, though a liberal, "generally emerged in the minds of Muslim posterity of India as a traditionalist, a defender of Islamic faith and history and the author of *Sirat al-Nabi* and *al-Faruq*". This,

she ascribes to the writings of his followers, like Sayyid Sulaiman Nadwi. Personally I see no reason in being so apologetic. If Smith and others have described Shibli as "an example of fairly conservative mind" or "an orthodox rationaliser," let them do so. The present-day generation of Pakistani and Muslim scholars should look at personalities like Shibli from a different angle. There was no harm in talking and writing about religion in the age in which Shibli lived, as it is not today. Why must we be so enamoured by Orientalists as to accept all their interpretations as gospel

truth? Despite the fact that the author considers her study as a mere "extended footnote to the work" of earlier scholars I consider this work a very useful one. In it she has analysed not only Shibli's intellectual achievement, but also discussed his liberal politics. As such this book can claim originality. Her style is lively and readable. This is the first full-length study of Shibli in English, written with great care and thoroughness. The author deserves commendation for this thorough and pains-taking study of a fascinating genius of his time.

DR S. RAZI WAS