# IQBAL REVIEW

**Journal of the Iqbal Academy, Pakistan**

**October 1997**

Editor

**Muhammad Suheyl Umar**

**IQBAL ACADEMY PAKISTAN**

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Title | : | Iqbal Review (October 1997) |
| Editor | : | Muhammad Suheyl Umar |
| Publisher | : | Iqbal Academy Pakistan |
| City | : | Lahore |
| Year | : | 1997 |
| Classification (DDC) | : | 105 |
| Classification (IAP) | : | 8U1.66V12 |
| Pages | : | 159 |
| Size | : | 14.5 x 24.5 cm |
| ISSN | : | 0021-0773 |
| Subjects | : | Iqbal Studies |
| | : | Philosophy |
| | : | Research |

# Table of Contents

**Volume: 38** **Iqbal Review: October 1997** **Number: 3**

# IQBALIAN IDEALISM AND ITS IMPACT ON THE MUSLIM WORLD TODAY

Dr. Javid Iqbal

Before assessing the influence of Muhammad lqbal's thought within the Muslim world today, it is necessary to provide an outline of his perception of Islam, Muslim nationhood, new Muslim society, Islamic state and the unity of the world of Islam.

Iqbal regards himself as "The Poet of Islam's Tomorrow." He advanced this claim when the Islamic world had been militarily overpowered and its political and economic destiny was in the control of the European Colonial Powers.

With the political expansion and economic penetration of the West in the world of Islam came new ideas like nationalism, patriotism, secularism, constitutionalism, etc. The impact resulted in the eighteenth century Muslim revival which, owing to its conservative nature, unsuccessfully resisted' the new ideas. But within a generation or so, out of this conservative background, emerged a group of reformers scattered over the Muslim world who took up the task of Islamizing these new ideas. Eventually this resurgence led to the development of two mutually conflicting interpretational attitudes conventional and reformist among the Muslim intelligensia each with its own notions as how to deal with the prevalent conditions.

Iqbal was acutely conscious of the reality of change. According to this philosophy "change" is the only "constant" or "permanent" feature in the whole of the created universe. Therefore he could not subscribe to the conventional viewpoint, which had made the old Muslim society static and immobile. But through reforming or reconstructing religious thought in Islam, he contemplated the creation of a dynamic and progressive new Muslim society.

In Iqbal's perception, Islam is not a religion in the ancient sense of the word. It is an attitude of freedom from narrow-mindedness and even of

defiance to the universe. It is a protest against all kinds of spiritual slavery of the ancient world.[1] Therefore according to him Islam is neither national, nor racial, nor personal but purely human. As a culture, it has neither any language nor any script nor any specific mode of dress.

According to the Western interpretation of "nationalism", a group of people having the same language, race and territory constitute a nation. But Iqbal is of the view that this definition of "nationalism" is narrow and anti-human. In his perception, any factor which develops among the people a sense of belonging to one another could constitute a nation. Advancing this argument further he held that Muslims constitute a nation on the basis of having a common spiritual aspiration, even though their languages or races are different and the territorities they occupy are geographically non-contiguous. Therefore Islam endeavors to transform and unify different peoples with various racial and linguistic backgrounds into a single human community (Ummah). Iqbal considers Islam as a nation-building force when he maintains that for the Muslims, Islam is their "nationalism" as well as "patriotism". His contemplated new Muslim society of the - future is to be founded on the political, cultural and economic unity of the Islamic world. On the basis of this reasoning, and following Syed Ahmad Khan, Iqbal was convinced that there were two nations in the Indian subcontinent Muslim and Hindus— and therefore territorial specification of Islam was necessary by carving out a separate consolidated Muslim majority state.

Iqbal evolved his philosophy of individual and collective ego in the background of his perceptions of Islam and Muslim nationhood. He was not a philosopher in the formal sense of the term. Nevertheless, he believed that each and every individual has numerous potentialities. If he is to become aware of even a single such potentiality within himself and endeavors to realize it, he could become a centre of latent power and attain uniqueness. According to him, a society consisting of such unique individuals is bound to be collectively unique. This is his vision of the future Muslim society.

What was to be accomplished by the new Muslim society? First: Iqbal laid emphasis on the need for the evolution of a new Ilm al-Kalam (Science

[1] Stray Reflections (A Note-Book of Allama Iqbal) ed. by Javid Igbal, Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore, 1992, p. 134.

based on rational interpretation of revelation) in the light of the discoveries of modern empirical sciences as well as the advancement of human knowledge. This was necessary for strengthening the faith of the younger generation of Muslims in the Qur'anic precepts. Second, he insisted on the abolition of the distinction between institutions of religious instruction and universities for teaching philosophy, literature, arts and other sciences. Third, he demonstrated through his analysis of history that Muslims were the founders of the experimental method or empirical sciences and contributed to the making of humanity. Therefore, he held that in the amalgamated centres of learning, the study of Islamic -sciences should be revived and their broken link be re-established with modern sciences and technologies.

According to Iqbal, modern Western civilization, particularly in the sphere of knowledge, was a prolongation of Islamic civilization. During the dark ages of Europe, Muslims were the torch-bearers of knowledge, but when Muslim culture sank back into darkness, Europeans took over these sciences and made further advancements on them. This ushered the era of enlightenment in Europe. Therefore, the acquisition of science and technology from the West does no amount to borrowing something from an alien culture, but taking back what was originally handed over by the Muslims to the Westerners.

Iqbal desired the awakening of the spirit of curiosity and inquisitiveness in the new Muslim society through the reacquisition of science and technology so that the process of research, innovation, discovery, invention and creativity could be recommenced in the Muslim countries.

In the Iqbalian view, a modern Islamic state is to be based on the principles underlying the pivotal article of Islamic Faith i.e. Tawhid (Unity of God) which, in practical terms, stands for human solidarity, human equality and human freedom. It is an effort to transform these universal ideals into space-time forces and an endeavor to realize them in a specific human organization. Iqbal regards the reformation of elected legislative assemblies in Muslim countries as a return to the original purity of Islam.[2] The Democracy

[2] The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, 1982 Ed. pp. 154, 157.

of Islam, according to him, did not grow out of the extension of economic opportunity, but it is a spiritual principle based on the assumption that every human being is a centre of latent power, the possibilities of which can be developed by cultivating a certain type of character.[3]

As for the responsibility of Muslims for protecting the rights of non-Muslim minorities in a modern Islamic state, Iqbal proclaims:

A community which is inspired by feelings of ill-will towards other communities is low and ignoble. I entertain the highest respect for the customs, laws, religious and social institution of other communities. Nay, it is my duty, according to the teachings of the Qur'an, even to defend their place of worship if need be[4]

The last sentence in the dated passage is based on Surah 22 verse 40 of the Qur'an in which it is laid down:

If Allah had not created the group (of Muslim) to ward off the others from aggression, then churches, synagogues, oratories and mosques where Allah is worshiped most, would have been destroyed.

In the early stages the jurists interpreted this verse as a command to the Muslim to protect the places of worship of the Jewish and Christian communities in the Muslim state being the "People of the Book" (Ahl-i-Kitab).

However, after the conquest of Iran, the places of worship of the Zoroastrians were also included under this protective clause on the ground that the jurists had declared them as "Like the people of the Book" (Ka-mithli-i-Ahl-i-Kitab). On the same principle the temples of the Hindus were granted protection during the Mughal rule in the India.

The modern Western civilization has dealt with the problem of religion through "secularism". There are two varieties of "secularism" developed in

---

[3] 3. Stray Reflections, p. 139.

[4] Discourses of lqbal, Ed. by Shahid Hussain Razzaki p. 62.

Europe after the Reformation and incorporated in the political orders of the Western countries. One type of secularism is based on the principle of "indifference to religion" and this is, the accepted norm in the capitalist democracies, Western Europe, Britain, U.S.A, India etc. The other type is founded on the principle of "suppression of religion" and for a number of years this policy had been followed by the so-called socialist countries including the former U.S.S.R. But from the persecution of minorities, particularly the Muslim in Bosnia, Chechnya, Palestine, Kashmir etc., it is evident that either of the forms of secularism is based purely on hypocrisy and double standards. Even otherwise, generally speaking, the attitude of "indifference to religion" has resulted in the dissemination of a kind of freedom which leads to "ethical waywardness" and treading on the rights of others. Furthermore, the recent developments in the former U.S.S.R. and other East European countries indicate that atheism cannot be imposed on a people from outside through state terror, and whenever such an attempt is made, it is bound to fail. Thus, it is clear that the existing types of secularism evolved by the modern Western civilization have not been able to solve the problem.

It is perhaps in this background that Iqbal rejects the contemporary methodologies of secularism, territorial nationalism, capitalism, atheistic socialism, sectarianism or religious conservatism as drawing upon the psychological forces of hate, suspicion and resentment which tend to impoverish the soul of man. A deeper analysis of his writings on this subject indicates that he recommends the adoption of the policy not of "indifference" or "suppression" but of "respecting and liberating all religions, faiths and creeds". He argues that the political philosophers of today must reconsider their approach to secularism and materialism in the light of the discoveries of modern physics. He state:

The ultimate reality according to the Qur'an is spiritual and its life consists in its temporal activity. The spirit finds its opportunities in the natural, the material, the secular. Al] that is secular is therefore sacred in the roots of its being. The greatest service that modern thought has rendered to Islam and as a matter of fact to all religions, consists in its criticism of what we call material or natural — a criticism which discloses that the merely material has no substance until we discover it rooted in spirit. There is no

such thing as profane world. All this immensity of matter constitutes a scope for the self-realization of spirit. All is holy ground.[5]

Iqbal further argues that since the Muslims believe that there can be no further revelation binding on man, they ought to be spiritually the most emancipated peoples on earth. He thinks that those who came within the fold of Islamic early stages could not comprehend the true significance of this basic ideas because they had just emerged from the spiritual slavery of pre-Islamic times and had no conception of spiritual freedom. However, he concludes, the modern Muslims are perfectly competent of appreciating this idea. Therefore, he wants them to reconstruct their social life in the light of ultimate principles and "evolve, out of the hitherto partially revealed purpose of Islam, that spiritual democracy which is the ultimate aim of Islam"[6]

It is interesting to note that in the modern Muslim political literature of South Asia, Iqbal is probably the only thinker who has used the expression "spiritual democracy" in order to define a. modern Islamic state. He also employs the expressions "spiritual slavery" and "spiritual emancipation" for describing the collective states of minds of fanatical ignorant religious folks as opposed to the tolerant enlightened religious people. "Spiritual democracy" of Iqbal obviously means "a democratic state which is based on the principles of respect and freedom of all religions". This concept of Iqbal is founded on Surah 5 verse 48 of the Qur'an in which God addressing man commands:

> For each of you we have appointed a law and a way. And if Allah had willed he would have made you one (religious) community. But (He hath willed it otherwise) that He may put you to the test in what He has given you. Therefore, compete with one another in good works.
>
> Unto Allah will ye be brought back and He will inform you about that wherein ye differed.

---

[5] The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam p. 155.
[6] Ibid., pp. 178-180.

If, according to Iqbal, the political message of Islam is to establish a "spiritual democracy" in any multi-cultural society where Muslims dominate numerically, then Iqbal's perception is a departure from the traditional notion, of Islamic state. But Iqbal points out the conventional literature on Islamic political order was compiled during the times when the Muslim world had been afflicted with perverse kind of monarchy and when the political ideals of Islam had been "repaganized". He proclaims.

> I consider it a great loss that the progress of Islam as a conquering faith stultified the growth of those germs of an economic and democratic organization of society which I find scattered up and down the pages of the Qur'an and the traditions of the Prophet. No doubt the Muslim succeeded in building a great empire, but thereby they largely repaganized their political ideals and lost sight of some of the most important potentialities of their faith.[7]

In regard to the legislative activity of the modern Islamic state, Iqbal's was of the view that the Pariah principles pertaining to worldly matters (Mu 'amalat) were subject to the law of change. They have to be reinterpreted through a continuous process of Ijtihad and made to confirm with the modern needs and requirement of the Muslim community. He declares:

> The claim of the present generation of Muslim liberals to re-interperet the foundational legal principles in the light o their own experience and the altered conditions of modern life is, in my opinion, perfectly justified. The teaching of the Qur'an that life is a process of progressive creation necessitates that each generation, guided but unhampered by the work of its predecessors, should be permitted to solve its own problems.[8]

According to Iqbal the power of Ijtihad should be exercised by elected Muslim assemblies in the form of Ijma' (Consensus of the community on the majority basis). In order to exclude or reduce the possibilities of erroneous interpretation, Iqbal suggest that the Ulema be nominated to constitute a

---

[7] Thoughts and Rejections of Iqbal, Ed. by S.A. Wahid, p. 168.
[8] The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, p. 168.

vital part of the legislative assembly helping and guiding free discussion on questions relating to law along with the contribution from laymen who happen to possess a keen insight into affairs. But Iqbal does not give the power of veto to the Ulema. He thinks that the only effective remedy for eliminating the possibility of erroneous interpretation is to reform the present system of legal instruction in the universities of Muslim countries, to extend its sphere and to combine it with an intelligent study of modern jurisprudence.[9] He is convinced like Pibli that if the reinterpreted socialistic or welfare- laws of Islam are implemented in the Muslim countries, their economic problems could be resolved.

Iqbal was greatly influenced by Syed Jamal-al-Din Afghani and his vision of the unification of the Muslim nationhood is to aspire for the realization of a unified Islamic world. He advanced his concept of Muslim nationhood at the time when the independent Muslim state were under the spell of territorial nationalism. Therefore, taking notice of this trend in modern Islam, Iqbal was of the view that for the present, every Muslim nation must sink into her own deeper self and focus her vision on herself alone, until all are strong and powerful to form a living family of republics. He points out:

> A true and living unity... is manifested in multiplicity of free independent units whose racial rivalries are adjusted and harmonized by the unifying bond of a common spiritual aspiration. It seems to me that God is slowly bringing home to us the truth that Islam is neither nationalism nor imperialism but a League of Nations whi h recognizes artificial boundaries and racial distincations for facility of reference only, and not to restrict the social horizon of its members.[10]

The Western powers had brought into being the League of Nations at Geneva during Iqbal life time. But lqbal was not satisfied with its deliberations so far as the Muslim World was concerned. Therefore, he felt

---

[9] lbid., pp. 173-176.
[10] Ibid., pp. 159.

that sometime in the future, the Muslim states may have create their own League of Nations and he even suggested Tehran as its seat.[11]

As far the influence of Iqbal on the Muslim world of today, it may be noted that the bulk of his poetic works is in Persian and the rest of them in Urdu. Some of his poetic works have been rendered into Arabic and Turkish. But in Turkey and the Arab World, particularly Egypt and Syria, his impact is confined to a limited circle of Muslim academicians or intellectuals who consider him as a poet of Islamic renaissance. Similar is his position in the Persian speaking people of the new Central Asian Republics.

His famous English prose work titled The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in lslam has been translated into Muslim languages like Urdu, Persian, Arabic, Turkish and Indonesian. But it is only in Iran that his poetic as well as prose works have been studied with greater depth. The Iranians claim that his thought was partly responsible for the recent Islamic revolution in Iran. The outstanding Iranian thinker Ali Pariati has been greatly influenced by Iqbal's ideas, and Imam Khaminaei, the present successor of Imam

Khomeini is a renowned scholar of Iqbal's poetry.

Among the Muslim of India he has been accepted as a great Urdu poet-philosopher, whereas in Pakistan he is revered and respected as the spiritual father of the country.

Some of the political leaders of the contemporary Islamic world are familiar with his name, including President Rafsanjani of Iran, who paid rich tributes to his memory at the OIC Summit held at Islamabad on 23 March, 1997.

However, it is not important to measure the extent of Iqbal's influence within the contemporary Muslim world on the criterion of a conscious in-depth study of his ideas. On the contrary, what is required to be assessed in the rapid spread of Iqbalian idealism all over the modern Islamic countries although some of them may have not even heard his name.

---

[11] Zarb-i-Kalim p. 147 in Kulliyat-i-Iqbal (Urdu) 1977 Ed.

The emergence of numerous free and independent Muslim nation-states, their endeavors to stand on their own feet educationally, economically and technologically, their bilateral or multi-lateral cultural, economic or military pacts with one another for mutual benefit and security, their aspirations to work out some kind of forum like OIC for unification, in order to strengthen Islamic solidarity and promote cooperation among Muslim states for the collective well-being of all of them, are all different dimensions of Iqbal's magnificent dream. Furthermore, wherever Muslims are still struggling for the realization of their right of self determination as a distinct national unit founded on a common spiritual aspiration, be it Bosnia, Chechnya, Kashmir, Cyprus, the Philippines or Palestine, and also wherever movements exist for reform on the basis of constitutionalism, democracy, social justice and for reinterpretation of Islamic law to suit the the modern needs and requirements of the Muslim community, one is again reminded of Iqbal's voice as spokesman of dynamic, progressive and modern Islam. Some of his dreams may have been realized, but in many respects he still remains the Poet of Islam's tomorrow.

The paper is based on the prose writings of Muhammad Igbal. But some major poetic works like Asrar-i-Khudi, Ramuz-i-Bakbusi (Persian), Bal-i fibril, Zarb-i-Kalim (Urdu) have also been consulted. " /he Glorious Qur'an" English translation by M. Pickthall has relied upon.

## NOTES

# ORGANIZATION OF THE ISLAMIC CONFERENCE (OIC)

## AN UNITED NATIONS OF MUSLIM COUNTRIES?

Abdullah al-Ahsan

Describing the contemporary trend in Islam and in an apparent effort to reconcile between Islam and Turkish poet Ziya Gokalp's (1874-1924) idea of nationalism poet philosopher Muhammad Iqbal said at the beginning of the second quarter of this century that:

> For the present every Muslim nation must sink into her deeper self, temporarily focus her vision on herself alone, until all are strong and powerful to form a living family of republics. A true and living unity, according to the nationalist thinkers, is not so easy as to be achieved by a merely symbolical over lordship. It is truly manifested in a multiplicity of free independent units whose racial rivalries are adjusted and harmonized by the unifying bond of a common spiritual aspiration. It seems to me that God is slowly bringing home to us the truth that Islam is neither Nationalism nor Imperialism but a League on Nations which recognizes artificial boundaries and racial distinctions for facility or reference only, and not for restricting the social horizon of its members.12

It is quite obvious that Iqbal wanted to see manifestation of Islamic brotherhood aim cooperative material progress of the Muslim ummah vis-a-vis Europe. This dream for a League of Nations13 of Muslim countries seemed to have materialized when the Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) was founded in 1970 in response to a decision taken at the First

---

[12] Muhammad Iqbal, The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, Edited and Annotated by M. Saeed Shaikh. 2nd ed. (Lahore: Iqbal Academy Pakistan and Institute of Islamic Culture, 1989): 126.

[13] The term league of nations represent, for us, the idea of ummah or an United Nations of Muslim countries. Iqbal must have used the term league of nations because the League represented the family of nations because the League represented the family of nations when he delivered the above lecture.

Islamic Summit Conference held in 1969 in Rabat, Morocco. Echoing the dream of the poet-philosopher the Muslim leaders declared:

It is our conviction that the Ummah of 1000 million people, composed of various races, spread over vast areas of the globe and possessing enormous resources, fortified by its spiritual power and utilizing to the full its human and material potential, can achieve an outstanding position in the world and ensure for itself the means of prosperity in order to bring about a better equilibrium for the benefit of all mankind.14

Along the same line during the fifteenth hijra centenary celebration Muslim heads of state and governments further declared:

We consider that the innate qualities of the Muslim Ummah point to the way to unity and solidarity, to progress and achievement, to prosperity and power. It possesses the Book of God and the Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him). In them can be found a complete way of life leading us, [and] guiding us along the path of goodness, righteousness, and salvation.... It [the Qur'an and the Sunnah] enables us to break the shackles of subservience and mobilise in us the spiritual strength to utilise to the fullest extent our inherent capabilities.15

But has the OIC fulfilled the dream of the poet-philosopher or the desire of the Muslim ummah? Is the OIC serving the purpose for which it was created? What has it achieved in almost three decades of its existence? What did the ummah expect from the OIC? Was this expectation too unrealistic? How far away is the OIC from its declared goals? This paper proposes to discuss these questions in the following pages. Major OIC activities on political, economic, and cultural issues will be briefly discussed in examining its efforts to achieve its goals.

The conflict in Palestine has been generally considered by the OIC as one of occupation of Muslim lands by foreign forces and during the early years of its existence the OIC extensively discussed the Palestinian issue. In

---

[14] OIC, The General Secretariat, "Declaration of the First Islamic Summit Conference," Organization of the Islamic Conference: Declarations and Resolutions of Heads of State and Ministers of Foreign Affairs Conferences 1389.1401H., 1969-1981, n.d.: 24

[15] OIC General . Secretariat, "Mecca Declaration," OIC Declarations and Resolutions.:718

fact, the OIC itself was established in the first ever held Islamic Summit Conference in Rabat, Morocco, in response to a Jewish arson attack on the Bait al-Aqsa . mosque in Jerusalem (1969) under Israeli occupation. It decided to station its head office in Jerusalem after it is free from Israeli occupation. Therefore, the OIC decided to fight Israeli aggression until the Palestinian "rights to freely exercise sovereignty over their land and national resources," and to "establish their independent state in Palestine with Jerusalem its capital." The OIC also resolved to achieve its goals by mobilizing all available resources of its member countries against Israel in the Political, diplomatic, military, economic, financial and cultural fields. It even declared jihad which it thought was a "duty of every Muslim, man or woman, ordained by the Pariah and glorious traditions of Islam", and called upon Muslims "living inside ales outside Islamic countries, to discharge their duty by contributing each according to his capacity, in the cause of Allah the Almighty, the Islamic brotherhood and righteousness."16

In reality, however, the OIC left the Palestinian people alone to fight Israel to achieve these goals. Because the fear of retaliation by Israel and its allies, no other Muslim or Arab country came to assist the armed struggle of the Palestinians against the Zionist state. Pointing out to the Israeli military action against Palestinians in Lebanon in 1982, the Palestinian leader Yasser Arafat said, "[The PLO forces] was besieged for 83 days in Beirut while no one extended any help or support. It was then besieged in Tripoli - a joint Arab-Israel blockade (pointing out to Syrian action against the PLO) while neither Arab not Muslim moved a finger".17

The frustrated PLO leader gradually alienated himself from the original OIC decisions on the Palestinian issues and attempted to negotiate with Israel directly. In fact, the process of negotiations with Israel by OIC countries began in 1978 when Egypt, an important member-state of the OIC, signed an accord, known as the Camp David Accord, with Israel. Initially the OIC reacted angrily and suspended the membership of Egypt from the organization "up to the time when the reason that provoked this suspension

---

16 See Abdullah al-Ahsan, Ummah or Nation? Identity Crisis in Contemporary Muslim Society. (Leicester: The Islamic Foundation, 1992): 114

17 Arabia (August 1984): 7

are eliminated.18 It is interesting to note that within few years the OIC re-admitted Egypt without it abandoning its policy toward Israel. In reality, it seems that Egypt convinced other OIC member states to adopt its policy of "reconciliation" toward Israel.

Under the circumstances the PLO sacrificed the idea of the Palestinian "rights to freely exercise sovereignty over their land and natural resources." It also struck a deal with Israel, an entity OIC does not yet recognize as a state, without even discussing the ideal of Jerusalem being the capital of the Palestinian state.

Was this the dream of Iqbal? Are the Palestinians happy about the deal? No. Press reports suggest that even the Palestinian negotiators are not satisfied with this deal with Israel. Palestinian negotiators themselves have categorically mentioned that they agreed to Israeli occupation of their land because they could no more fight Israeli aggression alone.

Afghanistan is another Muslim territory which was occupied by the former Soviet Union in 1979 and the OIC has dealt extensively. Immediately after the Soviet invasion of the OIC resolved to expel the puppet regime in Afghanistan from its membership in the organization. It also urged "all states and people throughout the world to support the Afghani people, and provide assistance and soccer to the refugees [a reference to displaced Afghani people due to the invasion.]"19 However, it should be noted that the OIC resolution on this issue was not unanimous as was in the case of Palestine. Pro-Soviet OIC members including the PLO opposed the resolution arguing that the Afghani government was still led by puppet Afghan nationals. It is also noteworthy that although the OIC resolution on the subject expressed support for Afghan people and the refugees, it failed to categorically support the mujahidin forces actively involved in the struggle against the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan. Individual member countries, however, offered assistance to the refugees as well as to the mujahidin which was effective in overthrowing the pro-Soviet regime in Afghanistan. Soviet occupation of

---

[18] OIC Resolution 8/10-P (Political). For a detailed discussion see, Abdullah al-Ahsan, Ummah or Nation?:113-118

[19] Quoted in Abdullah al-Ahsan, OIC: Introduction to an Islamic Political Institution,. (Washington D.C.: I.I.I.T., 1988): 63-64

Afghanistan has now ended. But the point to note here is that O1C failed to fulfill the expectation of the Afghan people.

This reflects that the OIC has generally failed to identify problems of a particular member state as a common problem of the Muslim ummah. It, as an institution, failed to share the grief and pain of. foreign occupation with Palestinian and Afghani peoples. In spite of its declared commitment to achieve strength, dignity and prosperity of the whole Muslim ummah, when attacked by anti-Muslim forces, it left the immediate victim to fight the enemy alone. Other Muslim nation-states have not wanted to jeopardize their national interests for the sake of fellow Muslims. It is interesting to note that this failure did not deter the OIC to adopt resolutions supporting security of Muslim nations. It resolved and reiterated time and again that the OIC wanted "to promote Islamic solidarity among member states and strengthen the straggle of all Muslim peoples to safeguard their dignity, independence and national rights.[20] But no member country wanted to risk their interests by declaring jihad against the Soviet Union when it invaded Afghanistan.

The failure of OIC in siding with its members states or with Muslim minorities against external enemies was nakedly exposed in the Bosnian crisis in former Yugoslavia. In the beginning of the crisis most Muslim countries were not even ready to listen to tile Muslims voice from Yugoslavia because of the lather's leading role in the Non-Aligned Movement. When it became clear through the Western media that Muslims were the piling victim in the conflict, the OIC issued an ultimatum to the aggressor and to the international community through the United Nations. The OIC demanded aggression against Muslims be stopped. It also demanded that the UN lift arms embargo over Muslims and allow them to defend themselves. But the deadline passed without notice and OIC remained silent and this proved to be very costly for Bosnian Muslims.

The OIC has not only failed to support its members countries against external aggression, it also suffered a severe set-hack in resolving conflicts within its member states. In the recent Iran-Iraq conflict (1980-89) and Iraq-Kuwait conflict (1990) the OIC failed to play the role of a mediator. in reality, the OIC seemed to side with one or the other conflicting parties.

---

[20] Foreign Minister's Conference resolutions, 13/13-P, 16/11-P, 17/14.

The OIC has had major problems in dealing with matters involving Muslims in non-member countries. Although Muslims in non-member countries have no status in the OTC charter and are not officially represented in the OIC structure, the organization has frequently shown its concern for them. The OIC noted that, "Muslim minorities in some countries of non-Muslim majorities do not enjoy the political and religious rights guaranteed by international law and norms" and appealed to "countries with Muslim minorities to respect those minorities and their culture and belief and grant them their rights in accordance with the UN charter and the Universal Declaration on Human Rights."[21] It also called upon its member states to "manifest support and assistance to the people under the yoke of colonialism and racism." It never raised the question of Muslim suffering in the former Soviet Union, or China, or India. When in 1983 in Assam state of India many Muslim women and children villagers were massacred by Hindu fanatics the OIC did not even protest to India.

The OIC has generally failed to resolve any political crisis of Muslim nations. Occasionally member states have voiced concern about Muslim problems such as in Afghanistan and in Palestine, but the OIC has hardly taken a collective stand on any political issue. In this sense the OIC has been a failure. If one compares the role of the OIC with that of the United Nations, one clearly notes that the latter also generally failed to resolve many political crises such as the conflict between India and Pakistan on Kashmir. But one must also admit that the UN has been more successful in resolving conflicts even between two Muslim countries than the 01C. For example, the UN has been more successful in getting the conflicting parties, Iraq and Iran, into negotiations. Also in Bosnia, whatever has been achieved to restore peace in the area, has been achieved through actions of the United Nations with the support of other international organizations such as the EC and NATO.

The United Nations addresses not only political problems of member-states, it also attempts to coordinate economic and cultural activities of member countries. Similarly the OIC also has established a number of subsidiary and supporting organs to improve economic relations and foster closer cultural ties among its member states. The OIC accused the developed

[21] See Abdullah al-Ahsan, Ummah or Nation?.. 118.

countries for not having political will to transfer technology to Muslim countries and decided that, "it was necessary for Islamic countries to resort and foremost to the mobilization and to the re valorization of their national resources, to ensure the economic and social welfare of their people."[22] It is generally agreed that the OIC countries jointly have a tremendous potential for economic growth because they constitute capital-surplus countries on the one hand and capital scarce labor surplus countries on the other. Natural resources are in abundance in OIC countries; so is tile trained manpower. But it seems more likely that OIC countries themselves lack the political will to initiate effective cooperation for economic development within the OIC community. For example, the OIC formulated a "General Agreement for Economic, Technical and Commercial Cooperation Among the Member States of the Islamic Conference." This was aimed at providing "necessary arrangements, guarantees and incentives to encourage the transfer of capital and investments among themselves." This was designed also to promote the socioeconomic development of all Islamic countries and to open up new avenues for the optimum utilization of the economic resources available within the Islamic World. The Agreement urged member states to explore and identify the possibilities of investing in joint projects and encourage maximum food production to satisfy the food requirements of the Islamic World.[23] But in reality the OIC failed to achieve any substantial progress on the basis of this Agreement.

Let us examine one of the most important areas of economic development in the light of this Agreement. In a resolution in 1978 the OIC noted that most member countries depended on external sources to meet part of their food requirements even though many of them possessed vast areas of arable and grazing land. In fact, according to one study, the OIC countries have the potential to produce annually 75 million tons of grain by the year. 2000, and this can be done by cultivating only 50 million hectares out of 2200 million hectares available to these countries.[24] This study was supplemented by another study called "the Food Problem in Islamic

---

[22] Ibid.,:129.

[23] Ibid.,:129-130.

[24] Ahmad S. Heiba, "Agricultural Resources in the Muslim World: Capital and Future Growth," in The Muslim World and the Future Economic Order. (London: Islamic Council of Europe, 1977), pp. 296-315.

Countries and Proposals for Future Action" by the Ankara based OIC affiliated institution the Statistical,

Economic and Social Research and Training Center. But in practice the OIC has not been able even to hold a meeting of the Agriculture ministers of OIC countries for many years. The meeting was first scheduled to be held in Egypt then to Mali but could not be held because of lack of response from member countries. The Agreement prepared by OIC experts on mutual coordination was not ratified by adequate member states for many years and, therefore, the Agreement could not be put into operation.

This pattern of behavior among OIC countries reflect a lack of commitment in implementing OIC decisions on the part of national elites. But is the lack of commitment common to all international organizations? Such does not seem to be the case with the European Community. The economics of EC countries are more uniform than those of OIC countries; all are developed industrialized economics, with highly trained manpower. Although all the OIC countries have developing economics, there are capital-rich as well as capital-poor countries among them. More important, capital-poor countries possess enormous manpower, and some also have huge cultivable land areas and other resources which could be exploited for economic growth.. It is the EC however, that has developed more - effective means of cooperation for development than OIC countries.

The OIC has suffered similar failure in coordinating cultural activities among OIC countries. It pledged to coordinate member countries' efforts in the field of education and culture, and consolidate Muslim culture and strengthen Islamic solidarity. On the pattern of the United Nations it established many affiliated and supporting organs including the Rabat based Islamic Educational, Scientific and Cultural organization (ISESCO) to achieve its cultural goals. It blamed European countries for colonizing Muslim countries and for deliberately alienating young Muslims from their tradition. The Director General of ISESCO in its journal Islam Today declared that:

ISESCO was established on firm cultural premises, and not on the flimsy ground of politics. Had this been the case, it would have become entangled in inter-state differences and conflicts of interest… Instead it

emerged as the true expression of Islamic revival and as tool for promoting and expanding Islamic Knowledge while enhancing its adaptability and its responsiveness to the challenges of progress and evolution.[25]

In reality, however, the ISESCO did nothing to achieve its goals. On the contrary despite the organization's non-political character, the Moroccan King used the platform at a 1983 ISESCO conference to attack another OIC member country[26] Still leaders of 01C countries continued to emphasize the need for Muslim solidarity in the modern world. Turkey, which resolved in the beginning of the present century to break- away from the Muslim ummah by abolishing the Khilafah, again decided to work for an united platform of all Muslim countries. One of its former presidents said:

The Islamic world is in dire need of solidarity and this can be achieved by culture which is the basic element in the formation of a society. To realise the idea of the solidarity of the Muslim ummah, we have to obtain the goal of cultural solidarity ... We must also remember that we are confronted with many complex problems each claiming a priority but the culture should merit our utmost attention.[27]

These claims of the OIC leaders and officials do not seem to have been realized in practice. Muslims do not seem to have overcome the problem of national interests over the interest of the ummah. What is the solution then?

The question we need to ask in the present context is whether the Muslim society will be able to develop such a system that will enable its members to choose between the ummah and the nation. But again the question is how will the Muslims develop this mechanism?

In Islam, theoretically speaking, one definitely finds an all-encompassing ideology. It accommodates other identities within its fold (49:13) and it has the potential to inspire and guide its adherents. Most importantly, a community established in the light of Qur'anic teachings existed in history and the Muslim community today views it as an ideal community. But it is

---

[25] Abdelhai Boutalib, "Editorial", Islam Today, 1:9.

[26] The king attacked Iran on this occasion. For detail, see Abdullah al-Ahsan, Ummah or Nation?:125-120.

[27] Quoted in Ibid.,:127.

also a fact of history that this ideal community existed only for a short period of time. And with the development of nationalism the Islamic ummah identity has lost the status of the supreme identity of Muslims. Many contemporary Muslim thinkers and scholars have noted this dilemma of the Muslim community and have put forward ideas for its solution. A Pakistani intellectual, Altaf Gauhar, has said:

Western cultural imperialism has been able to influence and undermine our beliefs, values, attitudes and manners and the task before us is to reassert our identity and to reach for our destiny. I am not advocating revivalism. Societies move forward not backward. They move forward through a sustained process of cultural assimilation, cohesion and continuity. The past cannot be revived but it can be restructured and this we cannot do unless we rediscover and reinterpret the beliefs and the values enshrined in the Holy Qur'an and made available to us as a living and everlasting model in the life of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him).[28]

It is perhaps fairer to say that Muslims themselves have not been able to adjust to the developments and discoveries in Europe rather than saying that Western cultural imperialism has been able to undermine Muslim beliefs and values. It is easier to find a solution to the problem if the root cause is identified within the community instead of blaming others.

Gauhar's idea of the progress of societies reminds us of the Contain view of societal development. This French philosopher, frequently referred to us the Father of Sociology, believed that theology had been superseded by a positive stage of development. He also believed that "the highest progress of man and society consists in a gradual increase of our mastery over all our defects of our moral nature." Based on theories Physics and Biology, Auguste Comte (1798-1857) laid the foundation of the modern study of human behavior and became the Father of Social Sciences.

Gauhar holds the view that Qur'anic beliefs and values should be reinterpreted but he does not explain how he would like interpret the Qur'an. In interpreting the basic beliefs and values of any belief or ideology one must

---

[28] Altaf Gauhar, "Islam and the Secular Thrust of Western Imperialism," in Islam and Contemporary Society. ed. S. Azzam. (London: Longman, 1982),:228.

bear in mind that there are foundational features in every ideology and that no ideology can afford to loose such characteristics. As for the Qur'anic ideology, there are some basic beliefs enshrined in the Qur'an; for example to believe in the Unseen is a pre-condition to receive guidance (2:3) from the Qur'an. Therefore, Gauhar's position on the issue demands more clarification.

In our view, a reinterpretation of certain practices of the early Muslim community in the light of Qur'anic values will be acceptable to a modem Muslim society. Here one has to understand properly the difference between Qur'anic values and their interpretation by the early Muslim community. For example, on the question of representative government the Qur'anic value is "to run their affairs in consultation among themselves (42:38)". The early Muslim .community practiced this instruction in various ways. The first caliph, Abu Bakr, assumed the responsibility after a general consultation among leading Muslims of Madinah and later the rest of the community gave consent to his appointment. The second caliph, 'Umar was nominated by the first caliph before his death and the community accepted the nomination. Umar nominated a committee of seven leading members of the community and the committee then voted the third caliph to power. Based on the verdict of the same committee, the fourth caliph assumed the responsibility of the caliphate and the community accepted it.

This question of representative government is one of fundamental importance for the Muslim community today. Muslims are divided on this question. If a solution to this problem is found it will be easier for the Islamic ideology to claim the supreme loyalty of modern Muslims. In interpreting this issue, however, one has to bear in mind the Islamic practices of choosing a leader.

The Pre-Islamic Arabs were known for their egalitarian character and their bloodties. Generally after the death of a tribal leader, leading members nominated an elderly wise person among themselves as the leader of the tribe and the rest of the tribal community would give their allegiance to the newly-elected leader. The tribal leader in return use to decide on affairs of the community after consultation with experienced and wise members, usually clan chiefs, within the community. Islam broke this structure. It considered tribal and blood-ties to be of secondary importance, and established itself as

the supreme identity, but it nevertheless retained the principle of consultation in running the affairs of the community. Now the Muslim will adopt a parliamentary or a presidential form a government or they will develop a new institution capable of running the affairs by consultation of community members is an issue to he decided by the Muslims themselves.

With the introduction of Western parliamentary systems in some Muslim 'countries, however, as Fazlur Rahman has pointed out, the lawmaking has become the business of lay parliamentarians. But there are large-scale protests from the Ulema and their supporters that law making must be vested in the Ulema institutions.[29] This is because Muslims have not yet decided whether their supreme loyalty lies with Islam or to their nation-state identity. In our opinion, there is no easy solution to this problem. Failure Ragman has rightly suggested that:

The only way to produce genuine Islamic law is to enlighten public conscience, particularly that of the educated classes, with Islamic values. This, in fact, underlines the necessity of working out Islamic ethics systematically from the Qur'an and making such works accessible to the general reader. There is no short cut to this process for the production of Islamic law.[30]

Muslim established the Organization of the Islamic Conference (OIC) to reassert their identity in recent history. But, as we have noted earlier, this political institution has had little effect in achieving collaboration among Muslim nation-state. The collaborative achievement of any group needs a stropping social band; in modern times, for example, nationalism created this bond among Europeans. In Muslim countries, too, a strong bond was created against European colonialism; but in formulating this bond, secular nationalism and the Islamic ummah both played equally important roles. After the creation of independent nation-states, Muslims were confused.

---

[29] Fazlur Rahman, lslam and Modernity.. Transforming an Intellectual Tradition. (Chicago Press, 1982): 256.

[30] Ibid.:156-7.- cohesion and continuity. The past cannot be revived but it can be restructured and this we cannot do unless we rediscover and reinterpret the beliefs and the values enshrined in the Holy Qur'an and made available to us as a living and everlasting model in the life of the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him). It is perhaps fairer to say that Muslims themselves have not been able to adjust to the developments and discoveries in Europe.

Neither secular nationalism nor the ummah could form the basis of any group feeling; therefore, a strong feeling of individualism dominates Muslim society today.

Once the hierarchy of identities is clearly defined, the OIC will need to restructure its form if it wants o play role of United Nations of the Muslim ummah. The failure of its resolutions suggests that the OIC cannot be effective as a structure where the components are more powerful than the mother organization. Fruitful cooperation on the platform of the OIC can take place only if the ummah is given priority by Muslims. Muslim society needs to change as it did under its Prophet; in his time the ummah replaced tribes; today, it needs to replace the nation-states. Nation-states do not need to be abolished; rather, like the early Muslim community, modem Muslims need to change the hierarchy of their identities.

This change, however, will not be easy to achieve. For any fruitful cooperation it is necessary to understand the dilemma of the existing situation. Once this is properly understood, it will be easier to determine a realistic goal. Muslim intellectuals need to re-evaluate lessons from the full range of their history. When the ummah was first established under the leadership of the Prophet, it replaced the tribal customary law. Muslim intellectuals need to study the character of law in pre-Islamic Arabian society in order to understand how Islam modified that law to conform with the Islamic concept of tawhid (Oneness of God). It is also necessary to understand the local Arabian customs which were accommodated within Islam, and similarly it is necessary to understand how incorporated other cultures, specifically the dominant Byzantine and Persian Muslim intellectuals must understand the nature of these cultural interactions in history in order to accept or reject the teachings of European civilization. However, this will be possible only after a clear of their loyalties. Muslim intellectuals must decide about supreme loyalty - whether it lies with the Islamic ummah identity or the ideas of European civilization.

## NOTES AND REFERENCES

# ISLAM AND THE WEST YESTERDAY AND TODAY

Seyyed Hossein Nasr

When discussing this most important and timely issue, before anything else and beyond all current passions and prejudices, one must pause and ask what we mean by the two terms Islam and the West: Which Islam and which West are we considering? Is it traditional Islam as practised by the majority of Muslims, the Islam of pious men and women who seek to live in the light of God's teachings as revealed in the Quran and in surrender to His Will? Or is it modernist interpretations which seek to interpret the Islamic tradition in view of currently prevalent Western ideas and fashions of thought? Or yet, is it the extreme forms of politically active Islam, which in exasperation, before dominance by non-Islamic forces both outside and inside the borders of most Islamic countires, take recourse to ideas and methods of certain strands of recent Western political history, including in some cases terrorism which is against Islamic Law, but which was not invented by them?

Nor is the reality of the West homogeneous in any way. In fact, practically the only political unity observed in the West these days appears in the hatred against Islam as shown in the case of Bosnia and Chechnya where one observes, with very few exceptions, the uniformity of silence, indifference, and inaction by various voices in the West in the face of the worst kind of human atrocities. Otherwise, the position of forces and diversity of what is usually called the West is so blatant as to hardly need being mentioned. But since it is ignored in many quarters which speak of global order based on what they call Western values, it must be asked if the West is characterized by Trappist and Carthusian monks or European and American agnostic or atheistic "intellectuals" on university campuses or in the media. One wonders if the Westerners are those who still make pilgrimage to Lourdes in the thousands, or those who journey, also in the thousands, to Las Vegas or the birthplace of Elvis Presley. this diversity and even confrontation, within the West is of the greatest importance not only for those in Europe and America who speak of confrontation with the Islamic world on the basis of the idea that there is an at least relatively unified

West, but also for the Muslims, at least some of whom are in general fully aware of deep divisions not likely to be integrated into unity soon but in fact on the verge of creating disorder and chaos within the very fabric of Western societies.

Nor is the diversity in the two worlds of the same degree. The vast Majority of the Islamic world still lives within the Islamic world-view. Everyone considers the Quran as the Word of God, the Prophet 'as His messenger, and the reality of God, His Names and Attributes as unquestioned realities. In contrast, in the West, beyond common commercial interests of various nations and groups which unify them, there is much greater division, concerning the most fundamental issues such as the reality or denial of the reality of God, the origin of man, the nature and origin of ethic, and even the sacredness and the origin of life itself over which some people are willing to kill those whom they consider to be participating in murder by terminating the life of a foetus. Muslims might be fighting on the question of political authority and the types of laws which should govern Islamic society, but very .few differ concerning the belief that God is still sitting on "His Throne" (al-'arsh) and is the ruler of the universe. On the contrary in the West there is less political fighting today after several centuries of bloody revolutions and upheavals, but there is also the deepest struggle and almost revolution on the question of values and ethices, not to speak of theology itself. On both sides of the debate concerning Islam and the West, it is important to remember these and many other dimensions and forms of diversity, although in this essay it is not possible to deal in depth with them, Lest one forgets, it must be recalled that even on the question of the nature of the Bible and its meaning, there is more difference between people of the Bible belt and many sceptical and deconstructionist professors in universities in that very region than there is between the views of the former and what Muslims consider the Bible to be throughout the whole of the Islamic world.

*.*.*

Such was not the case in days past, especially during the European Middle Ages when the West faced the Islamic world for the first time. First of all, this was a period in which the West and the Islamic world shared the most important of all principles, namely the acceptance of the Divine Reality

beyond all worldly concerns and principles, beyond individualism and an earth-bound humanism. Secondly, the two civilizations, respected each other even if enmity existed between them on a certain plane. The two made their own arms and were more or less evenly matched on the military and political planes in sharp contrast to what is observable today. If the West called Muslims heathens, it nevertheless respected Islamic civilization to the extent of emulating much of its science and philosophy, art and 'architecture, literature, and mystical symbols as well as some of its major institutions such as colleges of education. Even the medieval blue mantles of the Holy Virgin bear pseudo-Arabic epigraphy as ornamentation which looks like Arabic without actually being so, A Dante would incorporate' the structure of the Islamic spiritual universe into the architecture of that most Christian of poems, The Divine Comedy, which recapitulates the whole vision and experience of medieval European man, and a Roger Bacon would wear Islamic dress once a year at Oxford when he was lecturing on Islamic illuminationist doctrines. Despite theological anathema cast against Islam and the Crusades which caused great death and destruction, medieval Europe; looked with respect upon the only "other" it knew, that is, Islam and its society and civilization.

The open hatred against Islam, both intellectual and theological, really began with the Renaissance which also deplored its own medieval past. The writings of such major figures as Petrarch, which were central in the formation of the world-view of the Renaissance, show a venom and hatred against Islam and Islamic learning not to be found in any major medieval authors. This was the period of humanism in the non-religious sense of the term, anthropomorphism, opposition to the certitude brought about by faith, individualism based upon rebellion against all higher authority and also Eurocentrism all of which have characterised the Western world-view ever since. Now, these ideas stood not only against the West's religious heritage, but even more so against Islam which has always severely opposed any titanic and Promethean view of man and has emphasised this humble state before the grandeur and majesty of the Divine, seeing man at once as the servant of God ('abd Allah) and His vice-gerent (khalifat Allah) on earth.

It was during this period that the two sister civilizations parted ways and, based upon the religious opposition to Islam in the Middle Ages, a new and

much more embracing wave of hatred was created against all things Islamic, resulting in an attitude of detestation, an air of superiority as well as apprehension which have survived sometimes even consciously in the mainstream Western attitude toward Islam to this day when there is no comparison between the military and material might of the West and that of the Islamic world. Therefore, although the opposition to Islam in the West begins in the period of crystallization of Western civilization in the Middle Ages when Islam was the only "other" for the West, the seeds of the deep hatred and air of superiority of recent centuries must be traced to the Renaissance and its aftermath, to a period of history when the West set upon an path of secularizations, worldly power and unprecedented commercialism and' cultivated a new image of man which was diametrically opposed to all that for which Islam stood and still stands.

This period provided the basis from which the modern West looked upon the Islamic world during the colonial period which in a sense still continues in new ways in many places to this day, at, least economically, technologically and even culturally. In modern times however, a anew element entered upon the scene. Instead of simply casting anathemas upon Islam as a Christian heresy, new analyses of Islam began on the basis of either missionary prejudices or secular rationalism which had developed in the West and which, combined with superior military power, became a formidable instrument for the dissection and ultimate strangulation of religions and religious cultures in the name of a supposedly universal science. The Muslims could not study and present their teachings and views concerning Christianity anywhere in the West, whereas Westerners took it upon themselves not only to analyse and criticize Islam as they willed, but even to force their teachings upon Muslims themselves through schools created for either Christian or Western secularist education and supported by Western economic and political power. The Quran was and continues to be analysed and criticized in the West not as the verbatim Word of God, as Muslim believe, but as simply a human compilation to be rent asunder by rationalistic and historicists methods. It is as if Muslims were to search for the DNA of Christ's blood and try, God forbid, to match it with the blood of Joseph and then come up with all kinds of theories which they would teach in exclusive schools in the West, supported by oil money, in which the

most intelligent Western students would study in order to qualify for the best jobs.

It is in the light of this whole lack of parallelisms and complete inequality on the material plane, in which the West dictates, more or less, the agendas of the Islamic countries and judges them only on the basis of the extent to which they accept passing Western norms, now called euphemistically global, that the present relation between Islam and the West must be viewed. Many new elements have arisen of late, including the revival of Islam within the Islamic world and the pressure of the West for complete cultural domination while the Renaissance paradigm, which has dictated the modern Western view of things, is itself falling apart along with ever increasing social chaos. Still, the historical background of the relation between Islam and the West in the medieval, Renaissance and the more recent modern period must always be kept in mind because they constitute a depository of historical memories to which interested parties and groups can always appeal to fan the fire of hatred and to create a false image of a powerful enemy as if Islam today had the comparative power vis-a-vis the West as did the Umayyads or the Ottomans.

It is in the light of the historic past that one must pose the question as to what constitute the real problems today as far as the relation between Islam and the West is concerned. If in this analysis we address mostly the Western rather than Islamic components of this confrontation which one hopes will become more and more a dialogue, it is because we are obviously addressing a Western audience here and also because there is not common measure between the threats that the modern West poses for the whole existence of Islam and its civilization and the threats, in reality and no as propaganda carried out by some of the media, which Islam poses for the West.

*.*.*

The basic reality underlying the relation of Islam and the West is the fact that, in contrast to earlier Western expectations, the Islamic religion is still fully vibrant and Islamic civilization still alive even if greatly weakened. In contrast to all those late nineteenth and early twentieth century Western students of Islam, especially missionaries, who predicted the imminent demise of Islam, the religion shows much more vitality today than many

others. The very existence of the Islamic world which negates so many assumptions of the post-medieval and modern Western world-view such as individualism, secularist humanism, the superiority of human rights over divine rights and humanly devised laws over Divine Law, appears as a formidable challenge to a West which considers its own historical development as the only acceptable path to follow for all other peoples on the globe. Otherwise, they are branded as medieval, backwards and identified with all kins of other pejorative connotations prevalent in the modern world. Were Islam to have simply surrendered to Western patterns of thinking and acting, as do so many Muslim modernists, there would have been no confrontation between the two worlds. The reason for the conflict is the very reality of another civilization which wishes to follow its own principles and develop according to its own inner life and dynamic rather than on the basis of externally imposed norms which, according to many voices, now threaten the West itself. Today, the situation is not like the period of the Cold War when the West and the Communist worlds were threatening each other's very existence, for the Islamic world cannot and does not threaten the West militarily, politically or even economically in any conceivable way. On the contrary, the West; controls the most vital economic resources of Muslim nations and benefits from all conflicts in that world through the sale of vast quantities of arms and practically dictates its wishes in many parts of the Islamic world.

Rarely in debates about the threat of the Islamic world do the Western media present the real issues of basic importance in Muslim eyes such as the loss of Muslim lands, especially in Palestine, on the basis of exclusive historic claims, denying the claims of the other side. These historical claims are in fact of such a nature that were they to he pursued elsewhere they would; through the same logic, require non-native Americans to return to its original inhabitants much of the land many of them captured only a century or two ago through one of the most successful conquests in human history of the type that some now call "ethnic cleansing". How tragic it is in fact that Jews and Muslims could have lived in harmony with each other in days of old but cannot do so in the future if one accepts this exclusivist logic without considering the views of the other side of the confrontation. other issues include the fact that many nations in the West not only control the most important economic asset of much of the Islamic world, namely: oil, but also

want in a thousand and one ways to recover the money they have paid for the oil, whether it be through the sale of arms or the creation of safe markets.

Nor is the West, in the sense of Western governments and of course not well-meaning individuals and organisations, seriously interested in the welfare of the Islamic world, unless it coincides as is to be expected with its own geopolitical and economic interests as seen so clearly in the attitude of the West towards democracy in the Islamic world or the unbelievably hypocritical manner in which concerns for human rights are applied whenever it is to the interest of this or that power but never when it goes against the commercial interests of those powers. How many people who keep talking about. Islamic terrorist threats ever bother to ask why a twenty = year old person should, at the prime of his youth, give up his life so easily and so voluntarily. What is lacking that causes such extreme actions? Terrorism of any kind, whether committed by Muslims, Christians or Jews, is heinous and against the teachings of all three religions. When it does occur, it is necessary not only to condemn it, which one must, but also to go behind the immediate events and ask why such acts are being or have been carried out. Today, as far as the Islamic world is concerned, the causes behind such terrible acts are the losss of hope, unbearable pressures often supported directly or indirectly by the West, and desperation before forces which are destroying one's religion and civilization. Hatred is a fire that consumes and annihilates but the fire cannot be put out unless one enquiries about its causes. Otherwise, as soon as one fire is put out another is ignited.

There is no possibility of creating understanding between the West and the Islamic world until on the Western side people realise that the very absolutisation of the West's particular world-view at a particular moment in time combined with powerful economic "interests", which are usually against the interests of others, bring about impatience with and even hatred of other world-view. This has happened to such an extent that today many people in the West who are opposed to friendship' with the Islamic world, because of their own political or economic agendas, are against any mention of the harmony and peace which dominated over most of the life of Jews and Christians within the Islamic world before modern times. They even seek to arouse Christian and Jewish enmity against Islam while many of them are not themselves for the most part serious followers of either religion.

As for Muslims, they must stop identifying the aggressively secularist forces and crass commercial interests of the West with the whole of the West and remember that although the West is predominantly secularist, there has survived in the West to this day important Christian and also Jewish elements whose world-views, despite transient worldly interests in some quarters, are close to that of Islam. Between the Islamic world and the secularist West there cannot be a deep harmony and accord, because there are no common transcendent principles between them no more than there are between Hindus and Confucians or Buddhists and the secularistic world-view. There can only be peace based upon mutual respect on the human level. Needless to say, this respect is not given by many Westerners to any Muslims who, rather than emulating a West lost to an even greater degree in the maze of its own errors, seek to live Islamically in a serious manner. Nor are they given by most Muslims to Westerners with spiritual principles with the major difference, however, that Islam is not a threat to the Western way of life:but only to Western interests within the Islamic world itself. Tapes of the Quran are not about to invade the airwaves of Europe and America as the crudest products of Western pop culture are invading the East while Western secularism is seeking in a virulently aggressive manner to impose not only its technology but also its half-dying world-view, through that technology, upon the non-Western world, especially the Islamic.

*.*.*

It is here that, for people of good faith on both sides of this divide, and also for Christians living in the Islamic world and Muslims living in the West, a more profound question, as far as its long term impact is concerned, arises. It is the question of understanding and accord between Islam and Christianity, and to the extent possible Judaism, both across the frontiers of the West and the Islamic world and also within their borders. The Muslims whom the Serbs are massacring in the name of Christianity have a lot more in common with the Serbs as far as religion is concerned as exemplified by such Orthodox masters as St. Maximums the Confessor and St. Gregory of Palmamas than do the Serbs with many not only secularised Westerners but also completely modernised Christians some of whom admit freely that they do not even believe in the virginal birth of Christ or his historical authenticity to which Muslims cling as truths revealed in the Noble Quran. To talk of the

West and Islam and to identify characteristically the modern West with Christianity, which it has enfeebled to the degree observable today, is to gloss over a cleavage which would make all serious mutual understanding well-nigh impossible.

It is true that modernism has marginalised Christianity to an even greater degree since the Renaissance. Yet, Christianity, as well as Judaism in the West, continue to survive as living realities and if one looks at the situation in depth, one sees that they have great deal more in common with Muslims who believe in God, accept the moral injunctions of the Ten Commandments, and seek to live a life centred upon prayer and the reality of the other world to which Christ referred in that most forgotten of his utterances: "Seek ye first the Kingdom of God," than with people whose mother tongue is English, French, German, or some other European language but who share nothing of the Christian world-view whether it be of this world or the next. If a new awareness be created of this truth in the context of the present anti-Islamic current in the West, which speaks sometimes as if we were living at the time of St. Bernard of Clairvaux rather than of deconstructionism, relativism and a general hatred for serious religion which is tolerated only if completely divorced from public life, there would be a greater possibility of serious accord between most of the Islamic world and at least a West if not what is called the West defined by economic and geopolitical interests which are pursued at all costs whether these "interests" also accord with the interests of other or not. The achievement of this awareness is so laudable that it must be pursued fully by all people of good faith on both sides despite many obstacles on the way.

On the Christian side the first important consideration is of course a theological one. Despite so many ecumenical meetings since the Second World War between Christians and Muslims sometimes in the accompaniment of Jews, few Christians accept Islam as an authentic religion or revelation and the Prophet as the receiver of a major message form Heaven coming after Christ. There is much diplomatic courtesy but little theological acceptance especially by the more traditional and conservative elements of Christianity who art in fact closest to Muslims and best understand the meaning c.f. Sacred Scripture which is immutable and of Divine Origin and of ethical laws which, coming form God, are not meanest

to evolve with "the times" but to determine "the times" whenever and wherever they might be. This tragic paradox is similar to the case of the environment where the conservative Christians, who emphasise more than others the sanctity of human life form its conception in the mothers' womb, are much more indifferent to forces which are destroying the whole natural environment and the web of life that supports also human life, than many of those who would have difficulty with the very notion of the sacred. Granted that accepting the authenticity of Islam is more difficult for Christianity than the acceptance of the authenticity of Christianity is for Islam, which, while denying the Trinity and Incarnation, accepts the Divine Origin of the Christic message and considers Christ as the supreme prophet of inwardness preceding the Prophet of Islam; nevertheless. the question of mutual acceptance must be faced squarely: The greatest support in. the world today for traditional Christian and also Jewish beliefs comes form Islam and in fact throughout the ages Islam has permitted its Jewish and Christian minority in its midst to practise their religion freely as witnessed by the depth of piety and authenticity of eastern Christianity and Oriental Judaism today.

The task that lies ahead is for religious leaders of the three religions to realise and have the courage to assert these truths: despite the tragic problems of Palestine which has cast such a shadow upon Muslim-Jewish relations and a triumphalism in certain quarters which would still seek to prove the glory of Christianity through the fact that it was the religion of a civilization which became the most powerful but at the same time most secularised civilization in the world. From the Islamic point of view how tragic it is that while Muslims protected the Jewish people throughout most of their history and provided a haven for them after their expulsion from Spain after the Reconquest, they have had to pay so dearly for the barbaric atrocities of Hitler. Likewise, how sad it is to observe that while even at the height of their power, and before the modern colonial period, the Muslims never performed "ethnic cleansing" against the many Christian minorities in their midst, they now have to suffer a new wave of ethnic cleansing similar to that of Spain after 1492 while the official modern West, and of course not the many concerned Westerners, the West which declares loudly to be the champion of human rights, looks on without taking a single serious step because those being cleansed in Bosnia or massacred in Chechnya are precisely Muslims and not Christians and Jews. Despite these tragedies which

have darkened the scene, the attempt must nevertheless be made by Christian and Jewish leaders on one side and Islamic leaders on the other to reach a profound accord not on the basis of a secularistic humanism which has already demonstrated its poverty, nor of simple political niceties carried out for the sake of expediency, but one the foundation of the certitude that the followers of these religions are all the children of Abraham and pray to the same God. Muslim leaders, as well as Jewish and Christian ones, bear the deep responsibility of using every effort possible in this direction. More specifically, Muslims, often wary of ecumenical discourse because of their subsequent results and effects, must realise how difficult the task of the acceptance of Islam as an authentic revelation is for a serious Christian theologian and not to simply castigate the Christian because he or she cannot accept the authenticity of the Islamic revelation as easily as can Islam the revelations of Judaism and Christianity.

A second major obstacle which affects the whole of the modern West and even much of modernised Christianity and to some extent Western Judaism is the assumption that all civilization must follow the secularizing trajectory of Western history since the Renaissance. In fact, much of the dialogue carried out between Christians and Muslims today is coloured by the presence of that silent third partner which is anti-religious secularism. The debate is not like the one in which Nicholas of Cusa participated at the end of the fifteenth century. How easier would it have been, in fact, if a Ghazzali, a Maimonides, and a St. Thomas were to carry out religious dialogue! From the Islamic point of view what is difficult is to understand how various tenets of Christianity are changing so rapidly to the extent that some want to change the name and gender of Christ whom they now call Christa. When modernism began, Christianity, especially in its Catholic form, stood as the critic and opponent of modernism, whereas .now many voices in the churches have become accomplices to the spread of the very ideas which have opposed the most fundamental tenets of the authentic Christian faith. The result is the constant change of even basic elements of the faith so that it is difficult to understand with whom one is dialoguing. On the one hand Christianity presents itself to Islam as a powerful spiritual force which in reality still dominates the West and its value-system, and on the other hand much of Christian theology is changing with incredible rapidity and what has

survived of Christian ethics in Western society is disappearing with an unprecedented speed.

The present situation is one in which Islam still sees God as sitting upon "His Throne" (al-'arsh) ruling over the universe and Islamic society as one in which the practice of religion is so intense as to incorporate the whole of life and where the vast majority of Muslims still perform their daily prayers, fast and perform other rites promulgated by the Divine Law (al-Shari'ah). In the West in contrast many question the very nature and function of God and in many European countries only about 10% of the people attend church at least once a week. Rarely is this great difference of actual practice of religion taken into account in current inter-religious dialogue and the agenda is carried out in which many Christians simply identify themselves with the West as if the case of religion in the two worlds were the same. It is as if a country in Africa or Asia were to carry out trade talks with the United States without any attention paid to the present disparity in economic activities in the two countries.

As in the case of trade, so in the case of religion, the actual religious situation must be considered and such baseless slogans as Islam being medieval and Christianity modern put aside at least by serious Christian thinkers. When France was medieval, it was called the elder daughter of the Church and, produced great theologians, Christian art and deep piety whereas today only 11% of French people even go to church while St. Thomas Aquinas has been succeeded at the Sorbonne by men such as Derrida and Foucault and the Notre Dame has been ' superseded" by the Centre Pompadour Christian thinkers, at least Catholic and orthodox ones, should be the last to try to look upon Islam in a pejorative and degrading manner by calling it medieval or expecting Islam to undergo a so-called from which would simply follow the path of the West ending up with an officially Lutheran Sweden in which church attendance a few years ago was less than 5%. A new appreciation of the eternal values of religion and the sapience which lie at its heart must be cultivated to allow serious dialogue to take place with Islam, one which would also strengthen what remains of traditional religions in the Occident.

Finally, a third major obstacle to be confronted is missionary activity, not as it was practiced in the days of old, but as it has been practiced by

Western Christian missionaries since the colonial period and continues to be practiced today. Both Christianity and Islam are travelling religions with claim to bear global message and neither religion can demand from the other to discontinue "preaching unto the nations." In the days of old, the material power behind the religious message of the two religions was more or less the same in total contrast to what one observes today where Western Christian missionary activity in the Islamic world is accompanied often, but not al ways, by enticement of the most worldly kind, usually relying upon the products of the very civilization which has marginalised Christianity. There is usually the Bible in one hand and syringes or sacks of rice in the other along with a schooling system that is more successful in secularising than Christianising its students. There are of course remarkable exceptions but not all the missionaries are a Pere Foucault who, living in poverty, went into North African desert to be a witness of Christ among Muslims. Rather, in many areas missionary activity continues to be the instrument of Western secular interests as it was during the colonial period. Almost everywhere in Africa and Asia converted populations are as much protagonists of the secularised modern West as they are of the message of Christ, which they often understand in an already secularised form.

It is interesting to note in this context that eastern Christians, whose aggressive missionary spirit is not due only to Christianity but also to the Graeco-Raman civilizations for which everyone other than Christian and Jewish heresy which was Marxism and Communism and continues to be seen in the zeal with which secular humanists, no longer defending Christianity, go about with the same missionary zeal within the Islamic world to convert the Muslims to the secularist perspective. These several types of missionary activity in fact meet in some places such as in American and European institutions of learning in the Islamic world, many of which started as Christian missionary schools and are now supposedly bastions of secularist education.

To understand how great an obstacle is the missionary issue in the context of its being wed to the modern West and its being supported by great wealth created by means of modern finance and technology which, to put it mildly, have little to do with Christian poverty, one should look for a moment at the situation if roles were reversed. How would devout Christians

feel, if Islam carried out missionary activity not from the position of worldly weakness as it does now as Christians did in the Roman Empire, but from the position of incomparable economic strength. How would they react, if Muslims invited Christians to dialogue while promising anyone who embraced Islam free oil for their cars, free hospital care and access to an educational system which would guarantee them high positions in their countries whose governments were so much under the influence of the Islamic world that they could not stop such types of aggressive missionary activity.

There is no doubt that these obstacles exist but from both the Western Christian and Muslim side there must be an attempt to overcome them if there is to be any real accord and peace between they two sides. The Muslims, especially, while acting from the background of much greater weakness politically, economically and militarily, must nevertheless open all the doors possible to genuine dialogue and understanding with those Christians who put the kingdom of God above that of Caesar. How sad it is that many of the devoutest Muslims are distrustful of even well-intentioned Christians whom they identify simply with the modern West concerning which they have the right to be suspicious; and how tragic that in the West the more conservative and traditional a Christian, the more he or she is likely to be ignorant of Islam while some leaders of such groups describe Islam in terms of the anti-Christ: Ecumenism then often remains in the hands of those who are willing to change the very foundations of their faith to being about worldly understanding with followers of other religions or one might say these who would readily sacrifice that peace "which passeth all understanding", that is, peace with God and in God, for a worldly peace which God does not allow anyway under these conditions for there can never be peace on Earth without harmony and peace with Heaven.

* **

In conclusion, it is necessary to assert once again that for those seriously concerned with the future of humanity, and not simply with passing exigencies, egotistical calculations and short term "interests", the question of Islam and the West must be cast in a new mould. Both sides must understand that their cannot be an integration of two diametrically opposed world-views, that is, Islam and modern secularism, but, as mentioned, at best

mutual and not simply one sided respect on the human level and the creation of a modus vivindi based upon lack of aggression of one side against the other which includes refraining from plundering the wealth and the land and seeking to demolish the culture of the other side. But both Islam and the West must also understand that there can be and in fact needs to be a true meeting of minds and hearts between Christians, Jews and Muslims who after all share many fundamental principles of there respective world-views and who all face a much greater danger of a mortal threat form Western secularist culture including its outposts in the Islamic world than they do from each other.

To accomplish this end the atmosphere must be cleared through-earnest effort on all sides and such terms as fundamentalism, extremism, radicalism, etc. be again studied and defined not in the light of immediate political interests but of the truth. The practice of first anathematising and demonising a word and then simply using it against whomever one does not like at the moment is hardly the way of achieving any understanding or accord. What is needed is indeed the truth of which Christ spoke as being immanent to this nature, and Muslims identify as one of the Names of God. It is only the shining of the light of truth upon the dark clouds of today's horizon that can make possible an accord between the people of faith in both worlds. Furthermore, one hopes on the-basis of such and accord that a way of living and acting between Islam and the West would come about based upon mutual respect rather than greed parading as human concern or hatred passing itself as religious righteousness. In any case, as Christians know well, what God has united should not and cannot be rent asunder by human beings. The destinies of the West and especially the Christian West, as well as Judaism, and Islam are intertwined and connected by profound bonds which cannot be severed in the long run and can only be temporarily loosened only at great cost to all. Let us hope that the current situation will provide the opportunity for people of good intentions on both sides to pursue the vital issue of the relation between Islam and the West in the light of permanent truths and not transient whims and fancies based upon the desire for power, greed and self-assertion.

# SOURCES OF ISLAMIC LAW – A NEW APPROACH

Muhammad Hamidullah

I shall sum up first my conclusions and then I shall state my arguments: The habitual division of the sources of Islamic Law into four canonical roots' (usul), viz: the Qur'an, the Hadith, the Consensus, and the analogical deduction, was nothing but the first attempt on the part of the pioneers in the field to classify them; otherwise these very authors, the most orthodox of the Muslim jurists of classical times, have always accepted and in fact utilized at least a dozen more sources as fully canonical, for the-laws regulating the life of the faithful in all its different aspects. I am not speaking here of the anti-Qur'anic local customs, which have from time to time prevailed among groups, newly converted to Islam, and dating from pre-conversion days, particularly with regard to inheritance and other personal laws. I am concerned here only with the laws considered as 'Islamic' by the doctors of Fiqh.

## JURISPRUDENCE

Law in the human society is almost as old as society itself. Nevertheless it is curious enough to remark that the ancients rarely thought of the Jurisprudence, of the science of law, as distinct from laws themselves. The Romans have a just claim in antiquity to a place of honour in the history of law, on account of their legislation and their judicial institutions.

The oldest work on jurisprudence in Islam is the famous ar-Risalah by the Imam al-Pafi'i, an Arab author, born in the year H.150 (767 of the Christian era). Several eminent jurists are known before him among the Muslims, who have left works on the Islamic law, such as Zaid ibn 'Ali, Abu-Hanifah, al-Awza' i, Malik, Abu-Yusuf, al-Paibani, etc.; some vague references are made (e.g. Ibn Khallikan, S Abu-Yusuf) that they had produced works on Usul al-Fiqh (Islamic jurisprudence), yet neither have these works come down to us, nor do we know whether they treated the subject under consideration or dealt really with the canonical proofs to support the opinions of their masters, that is the traditions of the Prophet, to

supplement the Ray (opinion) and personal preference. The first extant systematic monograph on the science of law in Islam is this Risalah, which we owe to al-Shafi' i.

In this work he recognizes clearly the division of the sources of Islamic law into four. So, speaking of the lawfulness of the analogical deduction as the sources of law, he writes: 'If they ask me, how can you say that in the absence of precision in the Qur'an, the Sunnah of the Prophet or the Consensus one should have recourse to qiyas (deduction)?' (cf. Risalah, chapter Ijma'). A few pages afterwards he elaborates the use of the deduction and subdividesit, recognizing for instance the validity of Ittihad—which he uses as a technical term for a particular kind of analogical deduction_and rejecting Istihsan (which resembles somewhat equity in English law), which his teachers and adversaries of the Hanafite school employeed very much (cf. the same work, chapters Ijtihad and Istihsan).

This brief allusion suffices to show that al-Pafi' i was not the first Muslim jurist to have discovered and recognized that the Islamic laws originate from four canonical sources. Certainly his teachers, like Abu-Yusuf and al-Paibani and even Abu-Hanifah, and perhaps also the older jurists, such as Hammad, have had a clear idea of this state of affairs; yet if they have thought of it, it is our author who provided it with a scientific basis and created a new science which is called Usul al-Fiqh (literally, the roots of law; an expressive term by which the science of law is known among the Muslim).

Since then hundreds of works have been written on the Usul al-Fiqh in all the important Muslim languages) _Arabic, Persian, Urdu, Turkish, etc_and so many authors have ceaselessly discussed the topic of the canonical sources of law, yet no school of Muslim Jurisprudence, Sunni or Shi 'ite has ever found it justified to transgress this number 'four' for the sources of the Islamic law. Yet in reading the works of these same authors, the student who wants to determine the recognized sources of law is continuously astonished to find that rules are extracted by these authors not only from the Qur'an, the Hadith, the Ijma' (consensus), and the qiyas (analogical deductin), but also from a variety of other sources. It is precisely this point which is to be discussed here.

## RECOGNIZED YET UNNOTICED SOURCES

1. Let us begin first with the time of the Prophet himself. There is no need to point out that Islam began in fact as protest against the religious notions prevalent at the epoch of Muhammad, and there was no question of conceding equality to adherents of these other ' religions' with the Muslims: Before Islam the city of Madinah had known no State organization of any kind. It was the Prophet who gave it its first State-form; and, what is more, a written constitution: Its text has fortunately been preserved in tow. Now, in this constitution — of a rather federal type_ the Prophet organized not only
the Muslims of the region (Meccan refugees and Madinite Arabs) but also the Jews and such Arabs as had not yet embraced Islam. Article 25 of this constitution says; 'And the Jews of Banu-'Awf shall be considered as one political community along with the Believers (ummat ma'a almu'minin); for the Jews their religion, and for the Muslims theirs…..' This is the version transmitted by Ibn-Ishaq (Ibn-Hishsham), which one tries to render as ' a separate community yet allied to the Muslims'; this in order to avoid embarrassment. Yet the text of this clause transmitted by Abu-'Ubaid (in his Kitab al-Amwal, - 517) does not give even this much of latitude, the term employed there being ummat min al-mu'minin (a community forming part of the Believers, i.e. Muslims). This is a political document, conserving an international bilateral treaty. It does not concern religious affairs, but only wordly ones. Let us wait a bit before concluding anything from this clause of the constitution of the City-State of Madinah.

It is evident that a Muslim cannot behave in a manner endangering the life of another Muslim. Yet let us refer to the famous armistice of al-Hudaibiyah of the time of the Prophet, in which it was stipulated: 'Whoever from among the Quraishites will come to Muhammad without the permission of the chief of his family (waliy),— i.e: of course a Muslim refugee,_he [i:e: Muhammad] shall send him [i.e. the refugee] back to them [i.e. the Quraishites]; yet whoever from among the companions of Muhammad comes to the Quraishites, they shall not return him'. (For the text and sources see my al-Watha' iq as-Siyasiyah, No.11)

The only conclusion permissible in both the cases cited above, viz. the clause in the constitution and the clause in the armistice, is that 'Necessity knoweth no law', but demands concessions: To avoid a greater evil one

chooses the lesser of the two. It is thus that one accepts an unfavourable treaty; and the treaties must be faithfully executed. Not only in the time of the Prophet, but also in all epochs, international treaties have been concluded by Muslim States, and such an important jurist as al-Paibani devotes scores of pages on the point in his al-Siyar al-Kabir, and declares the validity of treaties and their pre-eminence over normal law.

2. It is well known how the Caliph 'Umar 1st had ordered his lieutenants to conserve almost the entire legal system of the conquered countries with regard at least to land revenue, in Iraq for instance. The Sassanid revenue law became, by a stroke of the pen, Muslim law on the subject, atleast in one part of the realm. Of course there was nothing in the Sassanid law which would have been against the Islamic law (the Qur'an and the Sunnah), and the Muslim government had complete liberty to handle the situation as it judged best. What I want to emphasize, however, is the point that the Caliphal, Orthodox government of 'Umar 1st did not hesitate to be inspired by foreign, non-Muslim laws. The word 'source' means nothing else in this connexion than the place wherefrom one gets the first idea of a rule, of a law. Our authors go much farther, and they are unanimous in laying down that 'all that is not forbidden by law the Qur'an and the Sunnah_is permissible' (al-Asl al-Ibahah). One sees how great a facility this doctrine does give to the perpetual infiltration of foreign influences and customs, judged by Muslim judicial and legislative authorities as good.

3. I shall cite another instance of the time of the same great Caliph, 'Umar 1st. In fact, according to the Kitab al-Kharaj of Abu-Yusuf, Caliph 'Umar was asked for instructions by customs officials of a frontier region as how to treat the foreign merchants coming with commercial goods in the Islamic territory. The reply sent to the customs official at Manbij (on the Byzantine frontier in Asia Minor) has been preserved, and it reads: 'Behave in the like manner as the government of these foreigners behaves with regard to Muslim merchants going to their country; levy on these merchants the same customs duty as their government levies on our countrymen; and if you do not know the same, then levy 10 per cent. ad valorem.' In other words, reciprocity is a perfectly valid source of Islamic law, at least in certain matters, even if it were at the expense of the uniformity of a law in the Islamic territory, at a given epoch.

4. In all times and climes subordinate officials have received instructins from superior authorities in administrative matters. The instructions issued by competent authorities are compulsorily followed by the State officials and constitute a valid source of the Islamic law, especially if there are no protestations and no ulterior abrogations. We have to distinguish this category from those mentioned above, viz. international treaties, reciprocity, etc., since these:instructions may not only answer the questions raised by the subordinates, but may also be based on original initiatives taken by the superior authorities themselves in order to ameliorate existing conditions. Such official instructions remain valid and in force, at least so long as the rule of the chief concerned continues.

5. For the Imam Malik the usage of the inhabitants of the holy city of Madinah (' urf ahl al-Madinah) possesses a high legal value: Although it was not inspired at all by, yet it reminds us of, the parallel Roman conception, the consuetudo populi romani, the custom of the inhabitants of Rome. According to the Malikite school, in the absence of precision in the Qur'an and in the Hadith, the usage of the inhabitants of Madinah has a priority over all the rest of the sources inclusive of analogical deduction.

The pious argument of Malik is that it must be admitted that the usage in question dates from the time of the Prophet and had his approval. (Needless to add that Malik means the usage of his own time, when even certain companions of the Prophet were still alive, and the generation of the so-called Followers of the Companions, the Tabi'un, was in full vigour.)

6. Needless to add that the schools of Islamic jurisprudence born outside Madinah, such as Hanafite, Shafi' ite, Hanbalite among the Sunnis, even theShi' ite and other schools, do no recognize this pre-eminence of the customs of the inhabitants of Madinah, in spite of the very high authority of the Prophet which Malik invokes and seeks to attribute to them. Nevertheless these schools, in their turn, do not hesitate to find in oidinary customs of any place a valid source of Islamic law, under certain restrictions of course. So, in their different nuances, the terms ' urf, 'adah, 'ta'amul etc., have been employed by the orthodox jurists to say that, in the absence of precision in the text (of the Qur'an, etc.), it is the custom which prevails and not the rigorous analogical deduction of a juridical nature. In the compedia of Islamic law one comes across almost in every page such expressions, to

wit, 'although the qiyas is this, yet the usage, the custom or the habitude of the people is that'. Evidently these customs and usages differ from place to place and from epoch to epoch; and one can easily glean a good number of cases where old customs were replaced by new ones when one compares the works of older authors such as al-Sarakhsi with later ones such as al-Haskafi and al-Pa' mi.

7. The theory of ' umum al-balawa' is entitled to a separate section, distinct from the foregoing one. This term signifies a bad habit in which everybody indulged, a reprehensible thing hardening in time into the general practice of an entire population. This kind of predominant usage is considered as tolerable, even if we do not attribute to it a greater validity. Even the most strictly orthodox jurists, especially of later epochs, refer to them and recognize them as a valid source of Islamic law. Such predominant customs bring into desuetude even the most formal texts of law, and thus acquire an authority which nobody would concede them ordinarily. Of course our authors do not recognize the source as valid except in matters of rather insignificant, worldly affairs of everyday life; yet this does not refute my thesis that there are many valid sources of the Islamic law other than the four principal sources 'recognize' by our respectable and respected precursors.

8. I may also refer to the procedure of legal fictions which scarcely conceal the real intentions. For instance, according to the Islamic notions, it is inadmissible to bar the hearing of a plaint on the sole ground of long delay. The notion was purely of Occidental origin, yet it was considered necessary to adopt it in Islamic countries for civil cases. So in the famous Turkish codification of the Islamic law, the Majallah al-Ahkam al 'Adliyah, it is expressly mentioned by the most orthodox and pious ulema of the epoch how they have succeeded in reconciling the irreconcilable and achieved the object. They premise that, according to the theory as also to the practice since all time, the head of the State is competent to determine the powers of different judges; therefore the Sultan has ordered that the ordinary courts and tribunals of the realm should refuse to hear time-barred plaints the hearing of which is reserved to the head of the State himself. Ostensibly the Sultan promised to hear such cases, yet practically he never entertained such

plaints. With such fictions the practical reasons prevailed over the theory, and the Islamic law was changed though not \ abrogated'.

9. I may make a passing reference to the different categories of opinion, deduction, equity, and others which our classical authors distinguish under the names istihsan, istishab, masalih mursalah, and ijtihad (in the particular sense in which al-Shafi'i uses it, and which signifies to him something different from what others understand thereby): In such cases, the jurists renounce the strict application of the logical conclusions, and prefer such rules as are based on salus populi or general well-being of the public and other reasonable considerations. Our authors speak of them under the chapter of qiyas even though they are in a way an abnegation of qiyas.

10.The same remark applies to certain pre Islamic laws, called sunan man lean qablakum. This refers to laws of the people possessing a Divine Book: According to Islam, laws enunciated by the prophets of yore, since Adam down to Jesus Christ, are as much valid for and applicable to Muslims; except in so far as they have been abrogated by succeeding prophets, particularly Muhammad. Eminent traditionists, such as al-Bukhari and al-Tirmidhi, relate words and practice of the Prophet of Islam to this effect; and the Qur'an itself is very express on the subject. If we read in the Hadith that in the absence of express revelation the Prophet used to prefer the practice of the Jews and Christians to that of the pagan Arabs, his compatriots; we read in the Qur'an where after citing fifteen prophets, God addresses these words to Muhammad and to his followers: 'So follow their guidance ' (fa-bihudahum 'ugtadih, Qur'an 6.90). However, there was the problem of ascertaining these laws of the ancient prophets, the Qur'an itself having formally declared that these older scriptures had been corrupted for one reason or another; and in fact the very raison-d'etre of the new religion, Islam, would cease to exist if the authenticity of the extant scriptures were admitted without demur. Islam came, according to its followers, to restore in its pristine purity the eternal law of God revealed to the successive prophets in the past, and renewed every time when the tragic and pathetic history of the fratricidal race of man caused the loss of these sacred books, through burning, oblivion, etc., without the possibility of recovering them intact. In these circumstances, the recognition of the laws of the older prophets is practically confined to those expressly mentioned in the Qur'an, or in the

Hadith or traditions attributed to Muhammad. To give an example, the lex talionis of Moses is referred to in the Qur'an (5:45); and as there was no other verse in the holy text declaring its abrogation—as is the case with certain other rules—this Mosaic law has passed into the Islamic jurisprudence with as much validity as rules expressly ordained for the Muslim in the holy writ possess.

## UNRECOGNIZED SOURCES

Evidently I cannot include in the above list the customs of certain groups of Muslims, particularly with regard to the disposal of property through inheritance, wills, etc., which customs not only contravene the Qur'anic prescriptions, but also are not acted upon by the rest of the Muslims in the world: One comes across such usages among the Berbers of North Africa, among Indonesians, &c. As for the Sub-Himalayan continent, its inhabitants have not developed even uniform customs. So, in Haiderabad, for instance, Muslims had no non-Islamic or anti-Islamic customs, as far as personal law is concerned; on the contrary, in the Punjab the daughters and sisters did not inherit; in Malabar the nephew (sister's son) inherited to the exclusion of the son of the deceased; in Bombay no property of the deceased was distributed, but kept for the benefit of the heirs in common (the so-called joint-family system). Such customs have obviously no room in the fabric of the Islamic law, and cannot claim a place in the rightful sources of Muslim law.

## CONCLUSION

Even excluding the non-Islamic customs of which I have just taken notice in the preceding paragraph, we have seen that, apart from the four 'canonized' sources of the Islamic law, viz. the Qur'an, the Hadith, the Ijma', and the Qiyas, there are about a dozen other sources which have been utilized by the jurists for extracting laws although they pass into silence over them in the chapter where they enumerate the lawful sources of the Islamic law. The Imam al-Shafi'i did the pioneer work, and Muslim law will ever remain grateful to him, even as the general law of the world to which he gave the new science of jurisprudence; yet it does not and should not mean that the sources of the Islamic law are only four in number.

# "THAT I MAY SEE AND TELL": SIGNIFICANCE OF IQBAL'S WISDOM POETRY

**Muhammad Suheyl Umar**

It was Ahmad Shawqi, the famous Egyptian poet and an older contemporary of Iqbal who, while paying his homage to Iqbal made an extremely perceptive remark: His words fervently spoke of the high esteem and regard in which Iqbal was held in the eyes of the Egyptians: At the same time, perhaps incidentally, his remarks convey to us in a remarkably revealing manner the real significance of Iqbal's poetry in particular and his message in general: Shwaqi said:[31]

> Iqbal was unique among the Muslim poets in the sense that, while almost all of his contemporaries were singing praises of the high ups or indulging in indolent love poetry. central to the conscious concerns of Iqbal were the issues that were of vital importance to the Muslim Ummah, both on the theoretical as well as the practical level.

In these remarks Shawqi has used the construct "conscious concerns" in order to bring out the characteristic features of thought which, in his view, distinguished Iqbal from his contemporary poets and thinkers. It is the same expression, which, in our view, provides the key to understand the phycodynamics of Iqbal's mind, and leads us to appreciate the reasons for which Iqbal's poetry has become significantly important and meaningful for us.

In the perspective of Islamic metaphysics the phenomenon of consciousness, discerned in the world in a hierarchical manner, is a

---

[31] I am indeed to my teacher and one of the greatest living authorities on Iqbal, Mirza Muhammad Munawwar to have informed us, during his class lectures, of the views of the Egyptian intelligentsia about Iqbal.

manifestation of the Divine Consciousness. The most central and total manifestation of the Divine Consciousness, a self-disclosure (tajulli) of the Divine Attribute of Knowledge ( Wm), is the human intelligence. In the same way, it is only man, which has the gift of speech because he alone among earthly creatures is made in the image of God in a direct and integral manner. It is the summit and perfection of human intelligence and, therefore, of human consciousness. Speech is as it were the immaterial, though sensory, body of our will and

our understanding.[32] Similarly, human speech or human language attains to its full plenitude or perfect deployment in poetry. if the summit and perfection of human consciousness is human language then poetry or the poetic art could like wise be termed as the summit and perfection of human language: This necessarily entails that, not only in the Islamic traditional perspective but also in the traditional oriental theories of art, poetry is a conscious activity never separated from the Intellect, "Art has to do with cognition".[33] it is never envisaged as " emotions recollected in tranquillity "or " a spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings".[34] According to this

---

[32] It may, however, be remembered that speech is not necessarily exteriorised, the articulated thought also involves language.

[33] St. Thomas Aquinas, Summa Theologica, Ill. 33.1.

[34] See Lyrical Ballads, ed. R. L. Brett & A. R. Jones, Methuen & Co Ltd. London,1963,p.260.These famous lines from Wordsworth are cited here only as a representative sample of the way the modem, reductionasist conception of poetry exhibits itself. Parallel examples could be given from every branch of art in which the artistic activity is reduced to even more inferior phycisms. They all have a common characteristic that, in these theories, the artistic activity is truncated to a segment of the human soul and confined to the limitations of the human domain, cut off from intellectual vision and spirituality. Thus, to quote S. H. Nasr, "poetry, rather than being a vehicle of a truly intellectual knowledge, becomes reduced to sentimentalism or a means of expressing individual idiosyncrasies and forms of subjectivisms." Islamic Art and Spirituality, Islamic Text Society, Cambridge,1987,p.91. An other authority who had covered the philosophic and religious experience of the entire premodern world, the great oreintalist A. K. Coomaraswamy has expressed some thing similar in this regard. He remarked, " As humanists and individualists it flatters us to think that art is the expression of personal feeling and sentiments, preference and free choice, unfettered by the sciences of mathematics and cosmology. But mediaeval art

perspective, poetry is not the expression of the subjective experiences of the separated ego of the poet, but the fruit of a vision of a reality, which transcends the being of the poet, and for which the poet must become the expositor and guide.[35] This does not mean — we add by way of a word of caution — that consciousness should•be reduced to rationality alone i.e: discursive though[36] or reason severed from its transcendent poetic roots, since, to borrow the words of Iqbal, " The Total reality… has other ways of invading our consciousness"[37] ; there are "non-rational modes of consciousness"[38] ;" there is the possibility of unknown levels of consciousness"[39] and "there are potential types of consciousness lying close to our normal consciousness".[40] How do these "other ways of invasion " relate to poetry ? lqbal tells us that the questions that call for an intellectual vision of reality for their answers are, "common to religion, philosophy and higher poetry."[41]

---

was not like ours "free " to ignore truth." See his Christian and Oriental Philosophy of Art, Dover, N.Y.,1956, p.29.

[35] See S. H. Nasr, Islamic Art and Spirituality, Islamic* Text Society, Cambridge,1987,p. 93.

[36] Which is, as if, a reflection of the Intellect on the mental plane.

[37] Muhammad lqbal, The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam,(referred to as Reconstruction, here after)lqbal Academy Pakistan /Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore, 1989,p.13.

[38] Ibid p.14.

[39] Ibid. p.37.

[40] Ibid. p.

[41] His complete statement reads as follows. " What is the character and general structure of the universe in which we live ? Is there a permanent element in the constitution of this universe ? How are we related to it? What place do we occupy in it, and what is the kind of conduct that befits the place we occupy ? These are the questions that are common to religion, philosophy and higher poetry. But the kind of knowledge that poetic inspiration brings is essentially individual in its character; it is figurative vague and indefinite." Reconstruction, op. cit. p.l.

In order to elucidate my point further I quote here, not from the theorists of literature but from the poets themselves. Jami referred to the same doctrine when he sang the following verses:

What is poetry? The song of the bird of the Intellect.

What is poetry? The similitude of the world of eternity.

The value of the bird becomes evident through it,

And one discovers whether it comes from the oven of a bath house or a rose garden:

It composes poetry from the Divine rose garden;

It draws its power and sustenance from that sacred precinct:[42]

a

Likewise, Milton in his Paradise Las! (Book 11-17; Book III -51) wrote of a vision which would then be translated into poetry.

And chiefly thou O Spirit, that dost prefer

Before all Temples th' upright heart and pure,

Instruct me, Jbr thou know 'st:

…

So much the rather thou celestial light

Shine inward and the mind through her powers

irradiate, there plant eyes, all mist from thence

Purge and disperse, that I may see and tell

---

[42] Jami, Sisalat al-Dhahah, cf. Nasr, Islamic Art and Spirituality, Islamic Text Society,Cambridge,1987, p.91.

Of things invisible to mortal sight.[43]

Valmiki, who composed Ratnayana, is reported to have been ordered to record a vision granted to him. "Then only, after concentrated meditation, when the whole story lay like a picture in his mind, he began to shape it into shalokas"[44]

Dante in his Divine Comedy says in the same vein

I am one who hearkens when

Love inspires me, and I put thought into word

After the mode which He dictates within me: "[45]

It is, therefore, significant and not a matter of mere coincidence that the words which denote poetry or poetic activity in all the major Islamic languages[46] and the word which denotes consciousness (shu 'ur) share the

---

[43] John Milton, The Complete Poetical Works of John Milton, Houghton Mifflin Company,Mass.,USA,1941,p155 and I99;Nasr, op.cil. p.96.

[44] See A.K.Coomarasawamy and Sister Nivedita, Myths of the Hindus and the Buddhists,-New York, 1914, pp.23-24,cf. Nasr,op.cit.,p.93. Also see A. K. Coomarasawamy, Christian and Oriental Philosophy of Art, Dover, N.Y., I 956,p.53-55.

[45] Dante, "Purgatorio ",XXIV.52-54, The Divine Comedy, translated _ by Laurance Binyon in The Portable Dante, ed. Paolo Milano, The Viking Press, New York,1995,p.312. Other authorities are no less explicit about these traditional dicta: Plato says " In the making of thing by art, do we not know that a man who has this God for his leader achieves a brilliant success, whereas he on whom Love has lay no hold is obscure ?" (Symposium 197 A). Plotinus is in complete agreement when he adds crafts such as building and carpentry take their principles from that realm and from the thinking there"(Enneads, V.9.11) ;" My doctrine is not mine, but His that sent me... He that speaketh of himself seeketh his own glory ", (John VII. 16, 18.)" Lo, make all things in accordance with the pattern that was shown thee on the mount " (Exodus, XXV. 40.)

[46] In Arabic, Persian it is the word shi'r, as well as its various constructs and derivatives which denote poetry. Similar is the case of Urdu, Turkish and most of the regional languages of the Islamic lands. Poet, in all these languages, is called sha'ir which again is a derivative

common triliteral verbal root sh, ':r which means ' to become aware of', ' to be conscious of'. The same conceptual underpinning is evident in the traditional definitions of poetry that are found in the classical works on literary theory and compilations of the technical terms.[47] For the purposes of our present study, however, we have fashioned afresh these definitions which does, not make them better but merely make these more elaborate and easily accessible. The need for this reformulation[48] is rooted in the fact that lqbal, though standing as an out post of the sensibility and the world view which the great masters[49] of traditional Islamic literature adhered to, was at the same time a man of the modern age.[50] The definitions are listed here in their

---

form of the same root implying " the conscious one, some one who is aware, the person with cognition ".

[47] For example see Kushshafu Lstilahat a!- Funun, rpt. Suhail Academy, Lahore, 1993,Vol. I,pp.744-46. This is the finest and the most detailed encyclopaedia of the technical terms used in the Islamic sciences that the Muslim scholars have produced over the centuries. For an account of the views of al- Farabi and Ibn Sina see S. Kamal, The Poetics of Alf~.nabi and Avicena, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1991; Also see S.H. Nasr and O. Leaman (eds.) History of Islamic Philosophy, Routledge, London, vol. 2, p.970; Mansour Ajami, The Alchemy of Glory: the Dialectic of Truthfulness and Untruthfulness in Medieval Arabic Literary Criticism, Washington, 1988, pp.55ff; H. Corbin, Avicena and the Visionary Recital, Irving, 1980. Also see Ibn Qutaybah, Kitab al-Shi'r Wa '!-Shu'ura for the classification of poetry according to the Islamic poetic canons.

[48] For this formulation we are indebted to our colleague Mr. Ahmad Javid who is himself a first rate poet of the Urdu language, a fine metaphysician and an expert in Iqbal studies, Kalam and Sufism.

[49] Like 'Attar, Sana'i, Rumi,.Jami.

[50] This point has always been emphasised in most of the studies of lqbal's mind and art. As a random sample read the following. "A typical example of modern use of traditional forms is the poetry of Mohammed Iqbal, who utilised mainly forms inherited from Persian and Urdu poetry...He used traditional imagery but filled it with new content, and it seems clear that his listeners would scarcely have accepted his daring message had he told it in free verse or in images taken from English or German tradition. People —literate or illiterate—were so used to certain rhythms, rhyme forms and images that their use facilitated Iqbal's work tremendously", Annemarie Schimmel, The Two Colored Brocade, Chapel Hill, 1992, p.35. From the other end of the world we hear the comment," like Abraham, he came out of the fire alive, that is, with his Muslim identity intact despite his Western education and his

hierarchical order, which is also the order of their scope and level of comprehensiveness.

What, then, is poetry,?

1- Language, in-formed[51] or moulded by metrical structures[52] and rhythmic patterns, is called poetry.

2- Language, in-formed by metrical structures and rhythmic patterns and manipulated in an excellent and beautiful manner, is called poetry.

3- Language, in-formed by metrical structures and rhythmic patterns and manipulated in an excellent and beautiful manner, is called poetry provided it does not take place involuntarily.[53]

4- Language, in-formed by metrical structures and rhythmic patterns and manipulated in an excellent and beautiful manner, is called poetry provided it does not take place involuntarily.[54] The content, which is thus expressed beautifully, pertains to the formal aspect of beauty (jamal suwari).[55]

---

engaging the West in the frontier of philosophy." Anwar Ibrahim, The Asian Renaissance, Time Books, K.L./Singapore, 1996,p,35.

[51] This is a rather unusual usage of the word which is now a days used without a hyphen. However it conveys very well the idea of "shaping, giving form to, fashioning ".See Nasr, op.cit.p.90 ; Oxford Dictionary, Oxford University Press,Vol.I,1971,p.1341; lI"ebster's New Universal Unabridged Dictionary, 2nd edition, Dorset & Baber, 1972, p.940.

[52] The word commonly used to denote the idea of metre (hahr or wazn in Arabic and Persian) is mawzun which means to weigh or measure '.See Finn Thiesen, A Manual of Classical Persian Prosody..., Wiesbaden,Harrassowitz,1982 ; Wright,A Grammaer of the Arabic Language,vol.11,last chapter. In so far as number and measure are nothing but expressions of unity, they constitute the essence of rhythm as the "formal " pole of poetry. Number must be understood as the expression of Unity with in multiplicity ; it is the very "vibration" of the One. In this regard see Ray Lavingston, The Traditional Theory of Literature, Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, l 962.

[53] Bi 'l-gasd, that is, an act of one's own volition, some thing accomplished on purpose.

[54] It was, perhaps, this level of poetic activity to which Dr Schimmel has directed her following remarks in her fine study of Persian poetry. “There are brilliant-looking verses

5- Language, in-formed by metrical structures and rhythmic patterns and manipulated in an excellent and beautiful manner, is called poetry provided it is not involuntary and manifests beauty of expression. The content, which is thus expressed beautifully, pertains not to the outward form of beauty (jamal suwari) but to the beauty[56] of the inner meaning Mama! ma '~rawi).[57]

What distinguishes lqbal from other Urdu poets is that his major works, unlike any other Urdu poet, fall under the last of the definitions of poetry that we have listed above which, in fact, is the highest class of poetry.[58] This

---

which express no real feeling and have no content what ever — yet which fulfil all the necessary conditions of poetry. The reader will encounter this kind of poetry more often than might be expected." The Two Colored Brocade, op.cit, p38.

[55] That is, the sublimation of the sensible or the sense data (mahsus) into a more subtle and refined form or a higher integrated pattern.

[56] That is to say that as the impression or rather the imposition of the ma'na increases the outward form becomes more transparent and reveals more readily its inner meaning. Since we are dealing with poetry here, it would mean that, in the case of this highest level of poetry, the ma'na comes to dominate totally over surah (outward form) and remoulds the outward form from within (without,of course, destroying the poetic canons).
Beauty, in this perspective, is, then, the attractive power of perfection. For a further discussion on the point see Coomaraswamy, op.cit. P.34. Plato, in Cratylus, 4l6 c has made the same point. Also see Dionysius Areopagiticus, De div. nom. IV.5 and Lanka vatara Sutra, 11.1 18-9.4

[57] That is, the transmutation of the intelligible (ma'qul) into the quasi- sensible or the transmutation of the sensible into the intelligible. In this case the spiritual and the intellectual principle imposes its harmony upon the conceptual modalities of the human soul (mind i.e. discursive thought is included in the faculties of the human soul in classical terminology). If the soul fails to receive the imprint of Beauty, that is, if it is excluded from the orbit of the human receptivity of Beauty the totality of the poetic phenomenon becomes some how lacking.
There is yet an other, rather esoteric, definition of poetry that we have left out from the purview of our present discussion. It reads as follows. "Poetry is the beauty of expression as well as the manifestation of Beauty. It is the total and perfect expression of the manifest which is always rooted in that which is completely unmanifest." This is to say that it is rooted in the ineffable Principle, the Silence, which is the alpha and omega of all poetry and all music.

[58] Obviously, this should not be taken to mean that Iqbal did not try his hand on versification pure and simple or that the other Urdu poets did not reach the heights of

point, perhaps, needs further elucidation. Proceeding against the backdrop of the definitions that we have formulated, we can say that the Urdu poetry[59] of the Indian subcontinent, at the time when lqbal emerged on the literary scene, could be grosso modo classified into four categories[60]:

I- Contemplative or higher poetry[61] in which the inner meaning (ma'na) dominates over the outward form. In the every day language this kind of poetry[62] is called the poetry of ideas and concepts e.g. parts of the poetic works of Mir and Ghalib.[63]

II- Poetry where the process of sublimation of feelings, sentiments and the sense impressions is the dominant motif e.g. most of the poetic works of Mir[64] and some of the lyrics of Ghalib.[65]

---

excellence. It is a question of the predominant characteristic only, otherwise examples of "language informed by metrical structures and rhythmic patterns-" abound in Iqbal's Bayiyat (disowned verses) and, on the other hand, first rate poetry is to be found in all the great poets of Urdu.

[59] The reason that we talk here of Urdu poetry only while 55% of Iqbal's poetic works are in Persian is, precisely, that in the days of Iqbal, and even afterwards, the Persian poetry cultivated in India, as well as in the Persian speaking lands, failed to produce any specimens that could be said of genuine significance and real poetic worth.

[60] The classification is for the ease of discourse, otherwise there are always emphasis shifts and overlapping.

[61] This is the name given to it by Iqbal. See note 8.

[62] When we say poetry it is presumed that it observes the canons described in the definitions, the difference arising from other distinguishing factors as well as from the level of consciousness and perfection to which a certain poetic composition may attain.

[63] In the same category one has to include those verses, lyrics, odes. Poems and epics which are either didactic or versify some historical or mythological story adapted for the purpose.

[64] See Mohammed Sadiq, A History of Urdu Literature, 2nd edition. Oxford, Karachi,1984 ; Ali Jawwad Zaidi, A History of Urdu L,itcrulure, Sahitia Academy, Delhi,1993.

III- Poetry of lexical and linguistic techniques i.e: poetry which incorporates the appropriate skills like play on words, use of proverbs, adages and other linguistic resources and devices, Poetic works of Dhawq[66] and Dagh[67] provide examples of this kind of Urdu poetry.

IV- Poetry of literary embellishment and rhetorical devices. Most of the poetry of the Lucknow school[68] falls into this category as does a part of Mu'min's[69] poetic works and Mathnawi Gulzar-i-Nasim.[70]

Iqbal is neither the poet of sublimation, nor of the lexical/linguistic techniques and resources nor of the literary embellishments and rhetorical devices though he uses all these elements in a consummate manner. Iqbal's poetry belongs, essentially and predominantly, to the first category.[71] He is a poet of intellectual-conception and intuition-expression[72] where in the ma'na (inner meaning) dominates totally over the surah. It is, however, still different from the Urdu poetry of the_ same category, both in its.inner dynamics and the content of the inner meaning. While Iqbal's poetic master pieces were a fruit of an intuitive vision associated with the realm of the intelligibles[73] in the

---

[65] Ibid.

[66] Ibid.

[67] Ibid.

[68] Ibid.

[69] Ibid.

[70] Ibid.

[71] Some critics have found in this fact a matter of reproach. From their point of view, which is typically modern, poetry is a matter of feelings and sentiments. Since Iqbal untiringly repeated some basic ideas, used a comparatively smaller number of poetic symbols and there is a complete absence of allusions to erotic subjects in his verse, he should be regarded as a thinker and not a poet.

[72] We shall explain these terms during the course of our discussion.

first place, the ideas and concepts that were prevalent in the works of the other poets were, by and large, conventional ideas shunted off from Sufism and the Illuminationist schools. The pshyco-dynamics of the common run of the poets was different in the sense that it stemmed from a different level of the artist's being, At this point we encounter the question of the levels of consciousness which is central to the gradation of poetry into hierarchical levels, ranging from the most mundane and facile versification to the most sublime degree of in-spired poetry[74] keeping ourselves with in the same perspective but making our terms of reference more concise, we can say that poetry could be considered as the response or activity of a part of our being which, manipulated by the faculty of imagination, manifests itself in linguistic patterns. Those who represent the poetry of lexical/literary techniques and rhetorical devices or, in other words, the skilful craftsmanship of the poetic art, bring into play their rational faculties only and, to a certain extent, the lower reaches of imagination. It is a response born of the cerebral and discursive part of their being. Poetry of sublimation of feelings and sentiments is born of the response of the passional soul or the psychic activity surging and overflowing from the emotive self.[75] Contemplative or higher poetry[76] is the response of the Intellect[77] i.e. born of intellect.' The

---

[73] Primary or secondary (ma'qulat ula and ma'qulat thaniya) respectively, in the terminology of Muslim philosophy.

[74] Some of the leading authorities on the religious sciences have given the title of "the poet of inspiration "to Iqbal. See Amin Ahsan 1slahi, " Dr. Iqbal — The Poet of Inspiration ", Iqbaliat, (Urdu) Vol.27, No. 4, January,1987,pp.13 ; " Al- Sha'ir al-Mulham ", Iqbaliat (Arabic),1992, pp. 149 ; Abu 'I - Hasan 'Ali Nadavi, Rawa'i' lgbal, Dar al-Fikr,Damascus, 1960, ; Nuqush -i - Iqbal, Karachi., 1973.

[75] This is the kind of poetry which, in all probability, Wordsworth had in view when he defined poetry. This also explains the remark made by John A. Haywood, "The fact is that by accepted Islamic poetical canons, Wordsworth's poetry would rate very low — much lower than Shelley's — whereas to most English tastes these two poets are rated almost equal. " See John A. Haywood, " The Wisdom of Muhammad Iqbal — Some Considerations of Form and Content ", in The Sword and the Sceptre, ed. Dr. Riffat Hasan, Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore, I977, pp.162-175.

[76] The terms in-spired poetry or wisdom poetry as well as other terms shall become clear as we go along.

reason Iqbal's poetry has to be considered as contemplative or higher poetry is, precisely, that the response is born of his intellect. His life is, as if, in the realm of the intelligibles and his faculties entertain their imprint, the ideas, in the way ordinary people receive the effects and impressions of events and sense data. What do we mean, then, by the entertainment of ideas ? It is the intuition of things as they are on higher than empirical levels of reference. Before we go any further, we feel that this calls for a word about the terms that we have used in the foregoing remarks since we are aware of the fact that the same terms do not always carry the same signification for every one especially in our times when their is hardly any agreement over the technical terms used in various disciplines, and more markedly, in the field of literature. Moreover it is important for the understanding of the doctrine of art that we have adopted as our point of departure and which provides the theoretical underpinning to our evaluation of lqbal's art and thought.

The terms "intuition" and expression are used here as the equivalents of "conception" and "generation " and in using these we are not thinking either of Bergson[78] or of Croce. By "intuition" we mean an intellection extending beyond the range of dialectic to that of the eternal "reasons"[79] It is therefore a contemplation rather than a thinking. Contemplation, in turn, implies to raise our level of reference from the empirical to the ideal, from observation to vision, from any auditory sensation to audition and so on. The poet, thus, " taking ideal form under the action of the vision while remaining only potentially 'himself.[80]' This is what we saw in the case of the verses quoted earlier from Dante.[81] We must emphasise that contemplation is an act and

---

[77] It must have been evident by now to the reader that we make a distinction between reason and intellect in the sense that, to use the expression of Rumi, 'aq/-i-juz'i (delimited reason) has defamed the intellect ('uql-i-ku//i).See S.H.Nasr,Know/edge and the Sacred, rpt,, Suhail Academy, 1988; Martin Lings, "Intellect and Reason ", Ancient Beliefs and Modern Superstitions, rpt., Suhail Academy, I988.p57.

[78] H.L.Bergson, Creative Evolution, tr. Arthur Mitchell, London, 1911, p.1, pp.187-88.

[79] St.Augustin, De Trin.IX.6, lI, cf. Gilson, Introduction an' l' etude de St.Augustin, 1931 'p.121.

[80] Plotinus, Enneads, VI.4. 2.

not a passions[82] and, contrary to what modern psychology says, we do not see in " inspiration" the uprush or inrush of an instinctive and subconscious will. " Inspiration", in the terms of our perspective, is an elevation of the artist's being to super-conscious and supra-individual levels.[83] In this the poet or artist is not a passive instrument. "He" is much rather actively and consciously making use of "himself" as an instrument.[84] Inspiration and aspiration, therefor, are not exclusive alternatives.[85] It seems that the caricaturing of in-spired poetry of the 20th century surrealists with their "automatic writing " stems from a confusion, which they made between the light of the super conscious with the darkness and the chaos of the subconscious.[86] Therefore the man incapable of contemplation, in the sense described above, can not be an artist but a skilful. workman. It is demanded of an artist to be both a contemplative and a good workman.[87] This is precisely what we had in mind when we tried to formulate the definitions of higher poetry, in the earlier part of our paper, to which Iqbal's major works conform.[88]

---

[81] See note 15.

[82] Free thought is a passion, however; it is much rather the thoughts than ourselves that are free.

[83] What is for the psychologist the "libido" is for the other" the divine Eros".

[84] Body and mind are not the man, but only his instrument and vehicle. The man is passive only when he identifies himself with the psychophysical ego letting it take him where it will.

[85] Because the spirit to which both the words refer cannot work in the man except to the extent that he is "in the spirit ".

[86] The great mistake of the surrealists is to believe that profundity lies in the direction of what is individual, that it is this and not the universal, which is mysterious, and that the mystery grows more profound the more one delves in to what is obscure and morbid: this is mystery turned upside down and therefore satanic, and it is at the same time a counterfeit of the "originality"— or uniqueness — of God.

[87] Best of all if, like the angels, he need not in his activity " lose the delights of inward contemplation".

Let us now briefly consider how the form of the artistic creation — in the case of the poet, a verbal crystallisation— is evoked ? Human activity, in this regard as in others, works in a manner analogous to the Divine Activity, the Act of the Logos. The human operation reflects the manner of operation in divinis. The art of the human artist is his creation as the universe is the divine creation. The intuition-expression or, in other words, conception-articulation, of an imitable form is an intellectual conception horn of artist's wisdom just as the eternal reasons are horn of the Eternal Wisdom.[89] The images arise naturally in the spirit, not by way of an aimless inspiration, but in purposeful and vital operation "by a word conceived in the intellect".[90]

The words “conceived in the intellect" come from a statement of St. Thomas Aquinas[91] and we have so far only alluded to the doctrines of the Christian and Hindu literary traditions just because we regarded it more opportune for the present audience and occasion, Moreover we have not quoted from Iqbal's poetic works either. This was, in the first place, to escape the charge of circular reasoning[92] and, secondly, to place Iqbal in a more universal and richer perspective. At this point, however, we find ourselves facing such strikingly close similarities of the doctrines mentioned above with the doctrines of the Islamic poetic tradition, to which Iqbal was a direct heir, that we find it impossible to silently pass over it.

According to Firdawsi, Sana'i, 'Attar, Sa'di, umi, Jami and other masters of Persian literature, poetry is the fruit of a vision that is articulated by the poet. To quote their exact formulation," it is conceived in the intellect and

---

[88] This does not, obviously, mean that Iqbal was a man devoid of volition, sentiments. Feelings and emotions, merely a cerebral. No one is like that. It,is only a question of emphasis and predominance which, in the traditional scheme of the division of human types, is described as the janunic, the bhuktic and the karumic. All we want to say is that Iqbal was a jananic or, if one prefers that, a pneumatic.

[89] The conception of an imitable form is a "vital operation" that is to say a generation, St. Bonaventura, In Hexaem,coll,20,n.5.

[90] Per verbann in intellectu conceptum, St. Thomas Aquinas, Sum. Theol., I. 45. 6c.

[91] Ibid.

[92] i.e. classifying or defining Iqbal by quoting Iqbal himself.

then born through the wisdom of the poet".[93] The word used for wisdom is hikmah (sapiential wisdom) and the intellect is referred to by the words " 'aql, zanair, ail or jam etc."[94]

One of the greatest authorities of Islamic metaphysics and sufism is Shaykh Muhyi al- Din Ibn 'Arabi who wrote not only several hundred prose works, but also three divans of poetry and many thousands of additional verses scattered through out his prose writings. As the greatest Muslim theoretician of imagination, he was able to utilise—with perfect awareness of what he was doing—the possibilities of poetical expression gained through imaginal perception.

For the Shaykh as well, the subject matter of poetry is not:something that one thinks about as one might think about a problem in dogmatic theology. Rather it is something that is seen with the inner eye and heard with the inner ear. Only then is it described.[95]

---

[93] They all use various expressions but the meaning is almost always the same.

[94] 'Attar, Asrar Nanrah, p. 186; Musibut Namuh,p.48,50,367 ;Diwan,p.800; llahi Namah,p.366; Sana'i, Hudiqah al-Hagiqah,p.406,408. In this regard the remarkable detailed studies of Nasr Allah Pourjawadi are extremely informative and illuminating. See his Bu-i Jan, Tehran, 1387 and Naqd -i- Falsafi-i shi'r a_ A'u_ur i 'Attur, Tehran 1995.
For Suharwardi's formulations on art and aesthetics see Oeuvres philosophiques et mystiques, (ed. S. H. Nasr) Paris, I977;W. Thacksten, (tr.) The mystical and Visionary Treatise of Suhrawardi, London, I982:For Muhammad Ghazzali, see R. Ettinghausen, "AIGhazzali on Beauty," in Art and Thought, Luzac, London, 1947,p. 160: For Ahmad Ghazzali, Majmu'ah Athar-i- Farsi, Tehran, 1370s. especially his Sawanih, (pp.93-190 loc.cit.) translated into English by Nasrullah Pourjavadi, London, 1986: Rumi, to give just one example of his formulation from among his large opus, speaks of the modus operandi of traditional art in the story of the Greek and the Chinese painters in exactly the same vein, see Mathnawi, Bk I, 3465-85 (also see Bk IV, 733; Bk V 372): For an other of Jami's formulations see Lawa'ih, tr. Whinfield and Kazvini, London, 1978. For a comprehensive survey of these formulations see S. H. Nasr, " Islamic aesthetics" in A Companion to World Philosophies, Blackwell, 1996, pp.448-459.

[95] For a detailed elucidation of the issue see W.C.Chittick, "Revelation and Poetic Imagery" in imaginal Worlds, State University of Newyork Press, 1994, 67-77. This doctrine of the imaginal world and its significance for artistic creation received further elaboration in the works of Mulla Sadra. “It underlies the belief among so many Islamic artists, from poets to

So whether we call it higher poetry[96], designate it as the poetry of gnomic wisdom[97], give it the title of sapiential or contemplative poetry[98] or classify it as in-spired poetry[99], all these appellations refer to one and the same reality which is situated at the junction between the form and essence and opens onto the Infinite. It is an activity in which the human poet is but the imitator of the Divine Poet since his "logical"[100] utterance is simultaneously a "poetical "[101] work.[102]

To return to what we have earlier said. we repeat that the " vital operation"[103],of which Iqbal's poetry is a manifestation, is an intellectual conception born of the poet's wisdom. Thus it does not come as a surprise

---

miniaturists, that traditional art involves an "alchemy" that transforms the corporeal into the spiritual and the spiritual into the corporeal. The alchemical process of spiritualizing the material and materializing the spiritual, for all of its significance for Islamic art can be fully understood in the context of Islamic thought only in the light of the metaphysics of the imaginal world which was to receive its final elaboration in the hands of Mulla Sadra."

[96] This is how Iqbal designated it. See note 11.

[97] The title given to this genre by Haywood, see note 76.

[98] This my preferred expression for it.

[99] The epithet used by S. H. Nasr, op.cit. p.90.

[100] Meaning here “stemming from the logos ".

[101] Referring here to poiesis.

[102] In their essence, "poetry “and "logic "are one and the same.”According to traditional doctrines, logic and poetry have a common source, the Intellect, and far from being contradictory are essentially complementary. Logic becomes opposed to poetry only if respect for logic becomes transformed in to rationalism, and poetry. Rather than being a vehicle for the expression of a truh intellectual knowledge, becomes reduced to sentimentalism or a means of expressing individual idiosyncrasies and forms of subjectivism." Seyyed Hossein Nasr, Islamic Art and Spirituality, Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987, p, 91.

[103] The conception of an imitable form is a "vital operation" that is to say a generation. This statement, already quoted above, comes from St. Bonaventura.

when we find Iqbal singing in the same vein: "Poetry is the heir of' prophecy"[104] or when he refers to himself as " of one voice with the trustworthy Gibra'il"[105] or declares that "poetry that communicates the message of eternity is either the song of Gibra'il or the trumpet of Israfil".[106] By doing this he places himself squarely in the traditional continuity of Islamic literature[107], draws the sap of poetry from it and eventually becomes perhaps the finest flower that blossomed in the withering garden of traditional Islamic poetry. This point has been well made in the study made

---

[104] Javid Nana, tr. A.J. Arberry, Unwin, London, 1966, p.65.

[105] Zabur-i 'Ajam, in Kulliyat -i Iqbal, Iqbal Academy,1994, p.430. Gibrail is the angel of revelation in the Islamic angelology.

[106] Zarb-i-Kalim in Kulliyat -i Iqbal, l qbal Academy, 1994, p.644.

These are only representative samples otherwise much more could he cited from him on this point. See "Hikmat-o-Shi'r" in Kulliyat -i Iqbal, Iqbal Academy,1994, p.262; "Rumi" in Kulliyat -i lqbal, Iqbal Academy,1994, p.335; "Asrar-o-Rumuz" in Kulliyat -i Iqbal, Iqbal Academy,1994, p.30,52; pertinent is also the following quotation from his prose "Or perhaps our chief want is rather for the poet of the new age than for its prophet— or for one who should be poet and prophet in one. Our poets of recent generations have taught us the love of nature, and enabled us to find in it's the revelation of the Divine. We still look for one who shall show us with the same clearness the presence of the Divine in the human — We still need one who shall be fully and in all seriousness what Heine playfully called himself "Ritter Von dem Heiliegen Geist", one who shall teach us to see the working out of our highest ideals in the everyday life of world and to find in devotion to the advancement of that life, not merely a sphere for an ascetic self-sacrifice, but a supreme object in the pursuit of which all thoughts, all passions, all delights may receive their highest development and satisfaction", Sayyid Abdul Wahid, Thoughts and Reflections of Iqbal, pp. 95,96.

[107] Many tine studies have appeared which focus on this aspect of continuity. See Annemarie Schimmel, Gabriel's Wing, Iqbal Academy, Lahore, 1989; Two Colored Brocade, op. cit.; Mirza Muhammad Munawwar, Iqbal ki Farsi Ghazal.

by John Haywood[108] which, however, focuses mainly on the formal aspect of this continuity.

Iqbal is in the long line of Classical Islamic poets (and I do not use the term "Islamic" in the narrow religious sense). Indeed, he is perhaps the last great Classical Islamic poet....The scholar familiar with the poetical classics of Arabic and Persian has the feeling, after reading Iqbal, that he is very much in the same tradition. Indeed, the last way to think of Iqbal is as a Pakistani poet. Rather does he speak for Islam universally and for the common ground between Islam and the other major world religions...[109]

a large proportion of the verses in his work are truly gnomic poetry — "hikmuh " wisdom in the highest sense of the word. Moreover, they are not wisdom only to Muslims, or to Orientals, but to men of every creed and race. This is one of Iqbal's great achievements that he bridged the gap between East and West, and gave utterance to the common ground in the great religious and philosophical systems of the world.[110]

In the context of the issue of formal and spiritual continuity that we have just mentioned the question that is often debated in tribal studies is that whether Iqbal was Classical in both matter and manner or in style and imagery only! In other words, did he express new ideas, new matter in a classical manner? Old symbols - new message; traditional forms, modern content! A definitive answer to this problem requires further research and comparative studies with the great figures of the Islamic tradition that could reveal the intellectual aspect of this continuity. In my view. however, he represents a continuity of both form and content. To maintain this position one has to explain for the differences that exist between the content of his poetry and that of the classics of the Islamic literary tradition. In this regard, some scholars have also pointed out, often in a manner of reproach. that much of Iqbal's poetry focuses on the problems and concerns of his own

---

[108] See John A, Haywood, " The Wisdom of Muhammad Iqbal — Some Considerations of Form and Content ", in The Sword and the Sceptre, ed. Dr. Riffat Hasan, Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore, 1977, pp.162-175.

[109] Ibid.p.162

[110] Ibid.p.172-73

community. It is also something, which, at least apparently, runs contrary to universality, which is fundamental to sapiential poetry.

The key to the understanding of this problem again lies in the doctrine of art that we have tried to expound in its essentials. Poetry "has something to say "which " cannot be said." It "has something to say": it may not he didactic in the negative sense oI' the word but, if genuine, it is also the result of a kind of necessity, the outcome of a "pressure" or a "need" to crystallise a "meaning" into a "form". Then, an invisible spiritual, universe governs every sector of humanity. This spiritual universe not only determines the form, language and symbolism that the poetic inspiration of that sector of humanity has to take but also the "pressure" and the "need" that arise from the specific cosmic conditions pertaining to it. The specificity of this "urgent" and "necessitating" character of inspiration, under which the poetry of that particular sector comes into existence, does not prevent the poetic expression to be any thing less than perfect and to fulfil the first and the main criterion of art i.e. nobility of content.[111] On a secondary and contingent level the question of social responsibility also enters into consideration.[112] As an applied side of sapiential doctrines and art, practical wisdom has always occupied its legitimate place in human collectivities and a poet, being a responsible member of the collectivity, has to participate in it and to undertake it as a part of his human and spiritual vocation. It is, therefore, neither the question of a dichotomy nor a contradiction of the claims of universality. It is rather the other side of the same intellection, which is turned towards more practical and immediate issues of human existence. Here, poetry is "given to" or rather "imposed upon" the poet. Consider the case of Shaykh Mahmud Shabistari, the author of Gulshan-i Ric (The Secret

---

[111] Perfect art can be recognised by three main criteria — nobility of content, this being a spiritual condition apart from which art has no right to exist ; exactness of symbolism...and purity of style and elegance. See F. Schuon, Language of the Self Ganesh,Madras, 1954,pp.122-135.

[112] A contemporary poet such as Rilke is still very aware of this aspect when he writes to a young would be poet. "This most of all: ask yourself in the most silent hour of the night: must I write? Dig into yourself for a deep answer and if the answer rings out in assent, if you meet this solemn question with a strong simple I must', then build your life according to this necessity." Rainer Maria Rilke, Letter to a Young Poet, Random House, N.Y., I987, p.6.

Rose Garden) which is one of the greatest masterpieces of Persian Sufi poetry. He was asked about some extremely sophisticated and subtle theological and esoteric questions. In his own words:

*Everyone knows that during all my life, / have never*

*Intended to compose poetry.*

*Although my temperament was capable of it, rarely did*
*I choose to write poems.*

Yet in spite of himself, Shabistari, in a period of few days, and through direct inspiration (ilharn) composed one of the most enduring and widely read masterpieces of oriental literature.[113]

This brings its to consider, at the end of this paper. the question of' the purpose or "use" of sapiential poetry. Let us have, first of all, a look at a few representative statements of Iqbal on the question.[114] He said:

> I have no interest in the art of poetry, but I have some special objectives. To achieve these ends I have chosen the medium of poetry because of the state and conditions of this country.[115]

---

[113] See Muhammad Lahiji, Sharh -i Gulshan-i Raa, Tehran, 1337, p.41.

[114] See Schimmel, Gahriel's Wing, op.cit.pp.61-72.

[115] A letter written in 1935, see Iqbal Nama, Ed. S. 'Ata Ullah, Lahore, Vol. I. See also the following quotations; "In poetry, literature for the sake of literature has never be enemy aim. There is no time left to me to attend to the delicacies of art. The purpose. Is to revolutionise modes of thinking. That is all. Keeping this principle in view I try to express what I find useful. No wonder if the coming generations may not recognise me as a poet." (Iqbal Nama, Ed. S. 'Ata Ullah, Lahore, Vol. 1, p. 108); "I have never known myself as a poet. Therefore I have no rival competitors and I do not recognise any as such. I have no interest in the art of poetry. Yes, I have some specific goals to achieve, which I always keep before me. I took to poetry to explain these goals with reference to the conditions and traditions obtaining in the country, otherwise

*You will not find any good coming from that low-minded person*

> All human art must be subordinated to this final purpose (i.e. life) and the value of every thing must be determined with reference to its life-yielding capacity The dogma of the art for the sake of art[116] is a clever invention of decadence to cheat us out of life and power.[117]

Iqbal is again in conformity with the traditional theory of literature here. Coomaraswamy tells us that " It is the same if we read the scriptures of any tradition or the authors like Dante or Ashvaghosha who tell us frankly that they wrote with other than "aesthetic" ends in view".[118] Since, according to the Hindu tradition, the purpose of art and, of course, poetry is " to know immortal through mortal things"[119] and the Christian doctrine announces that " the invisible things of God " (that is to say the ideas or eternal reasons of things, by which we know what they ought to be like) are to be seen in the things that are made".[120] Dante could say, "The whole work was undertaken not for speculative but a practical end... The purpose of the whole is to remove those who are living in this life from the state of wretchedness and to

---

*Who accuses me of writing poetry?*
Iqbal! Alamo, Ed. S. 'Ata Ullah, Lahore, Vol. I, p. 195.

[116] The error in the thesis of "art for art's sake" really amounts to supposing that there are relativities which bear their adequate justification within themselves, in their own relative nature, and that consequently there are criteria of value inaccessible to pure intelligence and foreign to objective truth. This error involves abolishing the primacy of the spirit and its replacement either by instinct or taste, by criteria that are either purely subjective or else arbitrary. F. Schuon, loc.cit.

[117] Translation taken from Schimmel, Gabreil's Wing, op.cit. p.62.

[118] A. K. Coomarasawamy, C'hristian and Oriental Philosophy of Art, Dover, N.Y., 1956, p.25.

[119] *Aitareya Aranyaka,* II. 3.2:*Aitareya Brahmana,* VII.10; *Katha Upanishad,* II.10 b.

[120] Rom. I. 20. St. Thomas Aquinas repeatedly compares the human and divine architects: God's knowledge is to His creation as is the artist's knowledge of art to the things made by art. See his *Sum. Theol.* I. 14.8:I. 17,I ; I. 200. 2; I. 45. 6;I-III. 13. 2 ad 3.

lead them to the state of blessedness".[121] Ashvaghosha declared[122] his purpose in the following manner:

> This poem, pregnant with the burden of Liberation, has been composed by me in the poetic manner, not for the sake of giving pleasure but for the sake of giving peace, and to win over other-minded hearers. If I have dealt in it with subjects other than that of Liberation, that pertains to what is proper to poetry, to make it tasty, just as when honey is mixed with a sour medicinal herbs to make it drinkable. Since I beheld the world for the most part given over to objects of sense and disliking to consider Liberation, I have spoken here in the garb of poetry, holding that Liberation is the primary value.

Plato was also explicit on the point since the Muses are given us "that we may use them intellectually, not as a source of irrational pleasure but as an aid to the revolution of the soul within us, of which the harmony was lost at birth, to help in restoring it to order and content with its Self ".[123]

We need not expand on it because it is evident that, according to the traditional theory of literature, the foundations of art lie in the Spirit, in metaphysical, theological and mystical knowledge, not in the knowledge of the craft alone nor yet in genius, for this may be anything at all in other words the intrinsic principles of art are essentially subordinate to the extrinsic principles of a higher order. Art is an activity, an exteriorisation, and thus depends by definition on a knowledge that transcends it and gives it order; apart from such knowledge art has no justification: it is knowledge which determines action, manifestation, form and never the reverse.

Sapiential poetry. Then, is a means and a vehicle for the expression of truth and it complements logic in that it deals with forms of knowledge which are not accessible to the unaided logical faculties of man. Also this

---

[121] Cf. Commaraswamy.*op. cit.*, p.54.

[122] Ashvaghosha, *Saudarananda,* colophon, cf. Coomaraswamy, *op.cit.* p.54.

[123] *Timaeus* 47 D, cf. Coomaraswamy, *op.cit.* p.55

poetry brings about the transformation of the soul and its sensibilities in a manner which is not possible otherwise. It causes an assent in the soul of man and in this regard it has an almost alchemical quality about it, a power to transform knowledge, making it a "tasted " fruit which is digested and which transforms one's being. thus. through its re-echoing of the fundamental truths of our existence aids man to return to the higher states of being and consciousness.

Finally, art, even the highest as in the case of sapiential poetry, is only the means to an end. It is a manner of "seeing through a glass, darkly," and although it is far better than not to see at all, the utility of every art must come to an end when "vision is face to face".[124]

*A finite image of Infinity:*

*This is the nature of all poetry.*

*All human work to its last limit tends;*

*Its Archetype in Heaven never ends.* [125]

---

[124] I Cor. 13. 12

[125] F.Schuon, *The Garland -Poems*, Bloomington:Abodes,1994,p.85.

# HAMMER - PURGSTALL AND THE MUSLIM INDIA

**M. Ikram Chaghatai**

**I**t is commonly stated that Dr. Adolf Scharf, Austria's third postwar president, identified the year 1943 as the time during which he realized that Austria was no longer part of a greater Germany, and that the idea of a Republic of Austria as an autonomous and permanently separate European state was a viable concept. Exactly after twenty years in 1963 questions were being raised about the autonomy of Austria's literature and a conservative critic like Herbert Eisenreich asked, '1st Osterreichs Literatur eine osterreichische Literature?"[126] Before this time - even in the high years of the Habsburg Empire - it was never really established as a certainty that Austrian literature was a separately viable tradition. However, in those prosperous years of the Second Republic, the autonomous Austrian literature became an irrefutable certainty.

Like the Austrian literature, it seems rather difficult to draw a line of demarcation between the tradition of oriental studies in Austria and other neighbouring German-speaking regions, as their close political, cultural and diplomatic contacts were firmly established with Ottoman Empire that knocked the doors of the eastern Europe. The deeply-rooted influences of the Ottoman Turks on the social and intellectual life of these areas are still very easily discernable in the family and place names in some of the dialects of present-day Austria. In this common historical background of the whole German-speaking world, the strong wave of orientalism crossed the geographical boundaries and a very unique German tradition evolved which was unable to confine to any present German-speaking country.

The pioneering efforts for establishing this tradition firmly were made by Joseph von Hammer-Purgstall, an indefatigable Austrian orientalist who has been very rightly designated as the father of oriental studies in German-speaking areas. His services to oriental studies in general resembled those of

---

[126] "Das schopferische Misstraueg oder Ist Osterreichs Literatur eine österreichische Literatur ?" an essay in his Reaktionen, Gütersloh 1964, pp. 72-105.

Sir William Jones (1746-1794) in England and Silvestre de Sacy (1758-1838) in France. His German translation of Diwan-i-Hafiz[127] inspired Goethe[128] (1749-1832) to write his West-ostlicher

Divan[129] and also prompted Friedrich Ruckert (1788-1866), an excellent German poet,[130] for wonderful translations of the reputed Persian poets like

---

[127] Der Diwan von Mohammed Schemsed - Din Hafis. Aus dem Persischen zum erstenmal ganz übersetzt. 2 vols. Stuttgart and Tubingen: Cotta, 1812 and 1813 (actually published in 1814).

[128] See, Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie (56 vols., 1875-1912), art. "Goethe"; Nouvelle Biographie Universelle (46 vols., 1852-1866), art. "Goethe"; Encyclopaedia Judaica (10 vols., 1928-1934), art. "Goethe".

[129] Its ed.: West - oestlicher Divan, Stuttgart, in der Cottaischen Buchhandlung 1819; in collaboration with H.H. Schaeder, edited and explained by Ernst Beutler, Leipzig: Dietrich, 1943; critical ed. with textual commentary by Hans Albert Maier, 2 vols. (vol. I: textual history, vol. II: commentary).Tubingen: Niemeyer, 1965; Eng. tr. by John Weiss under the title Goethe's West-Easterly Divan, Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1877; Edgar Lohner (ed.): Studien zum West-östlichen Divan - Goethes, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1971; Wolfgang Lentz: Goethes Noten and Abhandlungen zum West-östlichen Divan, Hamburg: n.d. [1958].

[130] Anton Schlosser: F. Rückert and Jos. Frhr. von Hammer-Purgstall. Vier Jahrhunderte dt. Kulturlebnes in Steiermark, Graz and Leipzig 1908, pp. 152-168; for Rückert's life and translations, see Annemarie Schimmel - Tari: F. Rückert, Dichter and Orientalist, Istanbul: Universitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Yayinlarindan, 1956; Ibid.: Friedrich Rückert 1788-1866 Ubersetzungen persischer Poesie. Ausgewahlt und eingeleitet von A.S., Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1966: Rumi (pp. 12-15), Firdosi (pp. 16-19), Sa' di (pp. 20-28), Nizami (pp. 30-33), Hafis (pp. 34-45), Dschami (pp.46-55); Ibid.: Orintalische Dichtung in der Ubersetzung Friedrich Rückert, Bremen: Shünemann, 1963; Helmut Prang: Friedrich Rückert. Geist und Form der Sprache, Selbstverlag der Stadt Schweinfurt (in Kommisson bei Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden), 1963; Friedrich Rückert. Dreiundsechzig Ghaselen des Hafis. Mit einer Einleitung von J. Ph. Bürgel. Hrsg. von Wolfdietrich Fischer, Wiesbaden: In Kommission bei Otto Harrassowitz, 1988Rückert zu Reihen. Eine Schriftreihe der Ruckert - Gesellschaft, Band 1); Friedrich Rückert, im Spiegel seiner Zeitgenossen rind der Nachwelt. Aufsatze aus der Zeit zwischen 1827 rind 1986. Hrsg. von Wolfdietrich Fischer, Wiesbaden: In Kommission bei Otto Harrassowitz, 1988; W. Fischer and R. Gömmel (Hrsg.): Friedrich Rückert. Dichter rind Sprachgelehrter in Erlangen. Neustadt a,d. Aisch 1990; Hartmut Bobzin: "70 Ostliche Rosen. Unveroffentlichte Hafis-Ubertragungen Rückerts" (in: Gott ist

Rumi, Hafiz and Firdausi, and it happened when they met in Vienna in 1818.[131]

Hammer gained wide fame for his monumental contribution to Turkish, Arabic and Persian studies, showing his scholarly acumen, versatility and encyclopaedic knowledge of the languages of the Muslims. The European historians of the oriental studies have paid a rich tribute to him for his remarkable services, rendered for the promotion of these studies in German-speaking countries.[132] In addition to this, he was aware of the literary and cultural achievements of the Indian Muslims and he mentioned, though briefly, about them in some of his books. He had also very close connections with some scholars, residing in India, and the learned institutions, functioning in the different parts of the Subcontinent. Hammer's personal and scholarly contacts with the South-Asian Subcontinent are not widely known and in this paper an attempt has been made to bring into light the material, based mostly on the newly-found sources, delineating his connections, particularly with the Muslim India.

(2)

Before this, it will be appropriate to give a brief sketch of Hammer's life:

Born on 9 June 1774 in Graz; son of Josef Hammer who was a government servant; took his early education in a native school where his main interest was in geography; after the gymnasium came to Vienna in 1787 and was admitted in the Oriental Academy which was founded by Maria Theresia in 1754 for educating the "Sprachknaben"--young noblemen trained in oriental languages and then appointed in the diplomatic service in Turkey; learnt here Islamic and classical European languages alongwith other subjects like law, mathematics, logic, physics, geography and history(1789-1799); attained mastery over the three major Islamic languages (Arabic, Persian and

---

schön and Er liebt die Schönheit. Festschrift fir A. Schimmel... Hrsg. von Alma Giese and J. Ch. Bürgel, Bern etc.: Peter Lang, 1994, pp. 53-70).

[131] Johann Fuck: Die arabischen Studien in Europa bis in den Anfang des 20. Jahrhunderts. Leipzig: Harrassowitz, 1955, pp. 167-168.

[132] For example, see Fick, op. cit., pp. 158-166.

Turkish) which helped him to be appointed officially the helping interpreter ("Hilfsdolmetscher"); sent on a special mission to Egypt in February 1800 because of his capabilities and subsequently took part in an English campaign against the French in the eastern Mediterranean; spent five months (November 1801 to April 1802) in England and worked in the Oriental collections of London and Oxford; in 1802 he was sent to Istanbul as the legation secretary; returned to Austria in 1807 where he served many years (1811-1836) as interpreter of the court; married Karoline von Kenikstein (1797-1844) in 1816 who was a daughter of a Jewish banker;nominated as the Privy Councellor in 1817 and in 1825 became the Knight; on inheriting estates in Styria in 1835 he was ennobled and retired from the diplomatic service; in the same year inherited all the_ possessions of Hainfeld in east Styria from his childless old friend countess Johanna-Anna Purgstall where most of his scripts, letters and other documents are still housed; in 1847 the Austrian Academy of Sciences (Vienna) was founded and he was elected its first president; died at the age of 83 on November 1856[133] and buried in a graveyard of Weidling near Vienna; inscriptions on his grave in ten occidental and oriental languages (Arabic, Persian and Turkish) are reminiscent of his widely-reputed scholarship;[134] was honoured with nineteen medals, two

---

[133] For the life and works of Hammer - Purgstall, see, Hans Giebisch and Gustav Gugitz: Bio-bibliographisches Literaturlexikon Osterreichs von den Anfangen bis zur Gegenwart.Wien: Verlag Brüder Hollinek, 1964; Ch. Bucher: Das dichterische Werk des'. Fr. Hammer - Purgstall, Diss. Wien, 1949; H. Sevimcan: Hammer- Purgstall und der Orient, Diss. Wien, 1956; Baher Mohammed Elgohary: Joseph Freiherr von Hammer - Purgstall, 1774-1856 Ein Dichter rind Vermittler orientalischer Literatur, Stuttgart: Akademischer Verlag Heinz, 1979; Helga Kavalirek: Die Infragestellung des klassischen Kulturideals im Werk Von Hammer - Purgstall. Versuch einer Kulturgeschichtlichen 'Einordnung. Diplomarbeit. Klagenfurt, 1984; Thomas Krivda: Studien über Joseph Freiherr von Hammer - Purgstalls Leben und Werken. Diplomarbeit, Universitat Wien, 1986 (typed script); Herbert König: Die Korrespondenz an den steirischen Orientalisten Joseph Freiherr von Hammer - Purgstall, Graz: Univ. Geisteswiss. Diss. 1985; Allgemeie Deutsche Biographie, vol. 10 (Leipzig, 1879), pp. 478-485; Neue Deutsche Biographie, vol. 7 (Berlin: Duncker und Humblot), pp. 593-594 (Werner Welzig); Osterreichische Biographisches Lexikon, 1815-1950, Bd. II (Graz- Köln: Verlag Hermann Böhlaus Nachf.), pp. 165-168 (with bibliography); A Schimmel: "Ein unbekanntes Werk Joseph von Hammer - Purgstalls" (in: Die Welt des Islams, xv/1-4, 1974, pp 131-145); S. Reichl: Hammer-Purgstall. Auf den romantischen Pfaden eines dsterreichischen Orientforschers. Graz 1973.

honorary doctorates (Graz and Prague) as well as the membership of about fifty world-wide academies and learned institutions; more than seventy-five books (some contain upto ten volumes) and hundreds of articles have been listed by the compilers of his autobiography[135] and Index Islamicus, 1665-1905[136] respectively.

(3)

It is not evident when Hammer became acquainted with the cultural heritage of Indian Muslims, as his early writings upto the year of 1800 and even his autobiography (Erinnerungen aus meinem Leben, 1940) provided no information in this respect. The available biographical material gives only the first instance of his acquaintance with India when he met an Indian traveller named Mirza Abu Talib Khan[137] (1752-1806), who sailed from Calcutta to Europe in 1799 and on his return to India stayed for a few months in Turkey. His meetings with Hammer took place probably on November 1802 in Istanbul where the later was an Austrian Councellor. A minute account of Abu Talib Khan's Travels in Persian entitled Masir-i-Talibi fi Bilad-i-Ifrangi[138] was completed in 1804 which is not only an interesting

---

[134] See, Hammer- Purgstall in Klosterneuburg - Weidling. Ein Fruher durch die Hammer - Purgstall - Gedenkstätten in Klosterneuburg-Weidling. Hrsg. von Kulturreferat d. Stadt Klosterneuburg unter Mitwirkung von Erwin Mehl. Klosterneuburg 1959 (pp. 51).

[135] Erinnerungen aus meinem Leben 1774-1852. (=Erinnerungen), Bearb. Reinh. Bachofen von Echt. Wien: und Leipzig: Hölder - Pichler- Tempsky, 1940, pp. 571 - 575, "Die Publikationen Hammers".

[136] Compiled by W. H. Behn, Adiyok: Millersville, Pa., 1989, with index.

[137] See, Biographic universelle (Michaud), vol. I, Paris 1843, pp. 85-87 (H. Audiffret); T.B. Beale: An Oriental Biographical Dictionary, Repinted: New York 1965 (London, 1894), p. 32; C.A. Storey: Persian Literature. A Bio-bibliographical Survey, vol. I (Reprinted: London 1989.) pp. 144-46, 704-705, 878-879 (cited other sources); Encyclopedia of Islam (Leiden), 1st ed., 1:102, 2nd ed. 1:123 (C. Collin Davies); D.M. Marshall: Mughals in India. A Bibliographical Survey, vol. I, Bombay etc., 1967, pp. 41-42; Prof. Humayun Kabir: Mirza Abu Talib Khan, Patna: Patna.University, 1961, pp. 28 (- The Russell Lecture, 1961); Encyclopedia Iranica, I: 389-390 (M. Baqir).

[138] Persian text: edited by Mirza Husain 'Ali (author's son) and Meer Qudrat ' Ali. Calcutta 1812; edited by Hasan Khidyujam, 2nd ed. Teheran 1363 shamsi (1st ed. Teheran

but in many ways a most illuminating work, written in a spirit of sincerity and candor. This travelogue is, no doubt, the first authentic source about the high literary attainments and attractive personality of Hammer when he was only 28 years of age and also indicates the friendly relationship between them. Hammer was so impressed by his Persian poetry that he translated some of his odes and sent them for publication to various European journals. The English translation of the relevant passage of Masir-i-Talibi is as follows:

"From the society of Mr. Himrou [Hammer] I derived much satisfaction. He is a young man of a most amiable disposition and enlightened understanding: he is by birth a German, but speaks the Latin, French, English, Greek, Turkish, Arabic and Persian languages. .He was formerly employed as interpreter by Sir Sidney Smith, and was his constant companion during the siege of Acre. He is now in the service of the Emperor of Germany, who constantly retains a splendid embassy at the Turkish Court. This gentleman translated several of my odes, into English, French, and German; and sent them to London, Paris, and Vienna. He visited me daily, and introduced me to his excellency the German Ambassador. By means of this introduction, I had an opportunity of seeing, at his Excellency's routes, not only all the ladies belonging to the different European embassies, but also a great number of Greeks and Armenians. The Ambassador and his lady are very highly esteemed in Constantinople; and, judging from their conduct, and that of some others of their countrymen whom I have met with in the course of my travels, I conclude that the Germans stand very high in the scale of polished nations."[139]

---

1352 shamsi); English tr. From the MS.), Travels of Mirza Abu Taleb Khan in Asia, Africa, and Europe, during the years 1799, 1800, 1801, 1802 and 1803. By Charles Stewart, 2 vols., London 1812, 2nd ed. in 3 vols. London 1814; French tr. (from the English tr.) Voyages de Mirza Abu Taleb Khan,.. par M.J.C.T., 2 vols., Paris 1811, 2nd ed. Voyages du prince persan Mirza About Taleb Khan ... par M. Charles - Maio, Paris 1819; Dutch tr. (from the English tr.), 2 vols., Leuwarden 1813; German tr. (from the French tr.) by Georg Eedel, Vienna 1813 (pp. 660); Urdu tr. (only one vol. ) by Mirza 'Ali Raza Mahzun, Muradabad: Barbs Press, 1904 (pp. 444) and by Dr. Sarwat 'Ali, New Delhi: Urdu Development Bureau, 1984.

[139] Charles Stewart, vol. III, 1814, pp. 76-77; Persian text of the relevant passage, pp. 373-374 (Teheran ed.); French tr. (Paris 1811), vol. II, pp. 144-145; Urdu tr. (Sarwat 'Ali), pp. 288-289.

Reciprocally, Hammer also mentioned this prominent Indian traveller and historian in his autobiography while narrating the events of the last three months of the year 1802 in Constantinople, but rather briefly and stressed more on the correct pronunciation of his name. Here, an English translation of the concerned passage is given:

"[I met with] an English shipbuilder named Crosby. Next day at his table I made an interesting acquaintance with a Persian fellow called Mirza Abu Talib Khan who was returning to India from his English journey. He mentioned me in his Travels which has been published in Persian in India and its English and French translations in Europe. By the mistake of the translator, the three consonants of my name (i.e. HMI?) are contracted in one with the following connecting particle (i.e.U) and a vowel inserted, originated from my name, Himru, what subsequently remained for me as the nickname."[140]

This friendship continued even after the death of Abu Talib Khan in 1806. The first Persian edition of his 'Travels' was published posthumously in 1812 from Calcutta and his son, Mirza Husain Ali, was responsible for editing 'it correctly.[141] This edition was sent to Hammer, perhaps by the traveller's son, who might have known his father's friendly relations with Hammer. Very soon, a German translation of this Persian text by Georg Eedel came out from Vienna[142] which was reviewed by Hammer in the fourth volume of his journal Fundgruben des Orients[143] (=Fundgruben) in 1814. In this review, the Persian text of the passage, with his own German translation, relating to his meetings with the traveller in Istanbul was given

---

[140] Erinnerungen, op. cit., pp.138-139

[141] Calcutta 1812, in one vol. of large size.

[142] Title: Urtbeil der persischen Reisenden Mirsa Abu Thalib Chan uber Deutsche, aus seiner zu Calcutta im Jahr 1812 erschienenen Reisebeschreibung. Ubersetzt von Georg Eedel, Wien 1813.

[143] vol. - IV, pp. 459-460. Persian text relating to Hammer (p. 459) and its German tr. (p. 460). In a footnote (p. 459), Hammer corrects that he is an Austrian, not German, as stated by the traveller.

and also clarified that Abu Talib Khan erroneously understood both Germany and Austria as one country and Vienna as the capital of Germany. He' strongly recommends to correct this geographical blunder. It can also be mentioned here that in the third volume of his Fundgruben in 1813, Hammer published the Persian text (with English translation) of the verses of Abu Talib Khan which he composed in praise of Lady Elgin's beauty.[144]

It will also be worthwhile to note here that Abu Talib Khan published the Persian text of Diwan-i-Hafiz from Calcutta in 1791 and he might have mentioned this edition during his meeting with Hammer who, after some years, translated it in German. It is a conjecture, but still worth a thought.

(4)

Hammer's intention to bring the East and the West closer, scholarly and intellectually, is explicitly reflected in a journal entitled Fundgruben which he started in 1809 with the financial ' support of his intimate friend Grafen Wenzeslaus von Rzewusky (1765-1832), a Polish orientalist. With the Arabic sub-title it has taken this Quranic verse as its motto:

(Say, To Allah belongs both East and West. He guides whom He will to a straight path, 2:142) [145]

This Journal comprises only six volumes and the last was published in 1819. As Maxime Rodinson explains that it was especially the first European journal in which the Western orientalists and the Eastern scholars collaborated and took interest in the past as well as in the present.[146] It is also considered as a reliable source of Goethe's West-ostlicher Divan[147]. In the first volume of this Journal, Hammer introduces it in these words:

---

[144] Fundgruben des Orients, vol. 3 (1813), p. 40.

[145] Explanatory English Translation of the Meaning of the Holy Qur'an ... By Dr. Muhammad Taqui-ud-Din Al-Hilali and Dr. Muhammad Muhsin Khan, Ankara 1978, p. 21.

[146] La fascination de l'Islam, Paris: Francois Maspero, 1980, p. 80 (paperback); Eng. tr. Roger Veinus, London: Seattle, 1987.

Eng.tr. "This Journal will comprise everything which always comes from or with reference to the East. Oriental translations, treatises, remarks, reports, extracts, notices, descriptions, sketches and essays of all kinds [will be published] in the current European languages. Although, majority of the members of the Society are German-speaking and the Journal will get the articles written in excellent German language, but we will also publish the articles in French, Italian, English, Spanish and Latin while the oriental lover's acquaintance with the current European languages must be presumed. Our Journal will be a point of unity for the lovers of oriental literature, not only in Europe but also in Asia."[148]

A cursory look of the contents of all six volumes of the Fundgruben shows that much space was devoted to Turkish, Arabic and Persian studies in comparison to Indology and cultural or literary history of the Muslim India. Despite Hammer's brief review on Abu Talib Khan's Persian travelogue (referred above), some of the Arabic, Persian, Sanskrit, Bengali and 'Hindustani' (which means Urdu) publications of the Fort William College (Calcutta) have been listed with brief critical remarks. Furthermore, the grammatical and lexicographical works of some British associates of this College like J.B. Gilchrist (1759-1841), M. Lumsden (1777-1835) and Thomas Roebuck (1781-1819) have also been referred,[149] appended with

---

[147] Ingeborg H. Solbrig: Hammer- Purgstall und Goethe. "Dem Zaubermeister das Werkzeug". Bern and Frankfurt /M.: Verlag Herbert Lang, 1973, pp.87-165.

[148] Vienna, 1809, pp. I-II,III.

"Diese Zeitschrift soli Alles umfassen, was nur immer aus dem Morgenlande kömmt oder auf dasselbe Bezug hat. Orientalische Uebersetzungen, Abhandlungen, Bemerkungen, Nachrichten, Auszuge, Notizen, Beschreibungen, Zeichnungen, und Aufsatze aller Art, in den gangbarsten Sprachen Europa's. Denn, obwohl die meisten Mitglieder der Gesellschaft Deutsche sind, and die Zeitschrift vorzuglich deutsch geschriebene Aufsatze erhalten wird, so sollen doch auch französische, italienische, englische, spanische und lateinische aufgenommen werden; in dem die Bekanntschaft mit den gangbarsten Sprachen Europa's bey dem Liebhaber der orientalischen vorausgesetzt werden muss." (pp. I-II). "Unsere Zeitschrift soil ein Vereinigungspunkt werden für die Liebhaber orientalischer Litteratur, nicht nur in Europa, sondern auch in Asien." (p. III).

[149] Vol. II (1811). In a letter (dated 11 March 1810) of Mr. Renouard, a fellow of Sidney College, the following book of Gilchrist is reviewed:

useful information about the early history of this College which was established for" an abundant and regular supply of public officers, duly qualified to become the successful instruments of administering the Government in all its extensive and complicated branches."[150] Undoubtedly, the details provided in the three volumes of Fundgruben about this College

---

The British Indian Monitor, or the Anti-Jargonist Stranger's Guide and Oriental Linguist by John Borthwick Gilchrist, 2 vols., 1807-1809 (pp. 275-276).

In another letter of 5 October 1811, Mr. Renouard remarks that "The College of Calcutta, which still exists on a reduced scale, gave rise to many works, chiefly poems, accompained by translations, for the use of the students — and also with a view to the literary improvement of the natives. Amongst the latter, the Hindustani translation of the Koran deserves notice. A part of it was printed, but I fear it has not been completed. As the writers in native Indian languages are so little known, the names of most of the works in printed Hindustani at Calcutta, would probably not be interesting to you." (vol II, p. 195).

In vol. III (1813) of Fundgruben some of the new publications of the Fort William College (Calcutta) in Arabic, Persian, 'Hindustani' etc. are reviewed under the title "Intelligence of oriental Literature from Calcutta" (pp. 277-278). It begins with:

"The professor Lumsden of the Persian and Arabic languages having nearly completed his grammar of the first, has commenced one of the second. Other helps also towards the acquisition of its grammatical principles (i.e. of Arabic grammar), agreeably to the system of instruction used by the natives, will speedily be published."

In vol. IV (1814) another heading "Indian Litterature. Extract of the discourse of the R.H. Lord Minto at the public disputation of the students of the College of Fort William at Calcutta, delivered the 20 Septemeber 1813" (pp. 178-181) in which the brief information of the various scholarly projects of Lumsden (Professor of Arabic and Persian), Captain Roebuck (Assistant Secretary and Examiner), Dr. Carey (Professor of Bengali and Sanskrit), Mr. Coolbrooke (Vocabulary of the Panjabi language') and Captain Lockett is given.

In the same volume, a review of the "Catalogue of Oriental Works published and completed at Calcutta from September 1812 till September 1813" deserves special attention which contains significant information about the Arabic, Persian and Urdu books of the first decade of the Fort William College.

[150] Objectives of the establishment of the College of Fort William (Calcutta), as stated in the Minutes of Lord Wellesley, Governor - General, dated 18 August 1800 and 25 July 1803. See, Thomas Roebuck: The Annals of the College of Fort William, Calcutta 1819, p. 35.

are very significant for its early period and these are yet to be utilized by any historian of Urdu or Hindi literature.[151]

(5)

In the same period, another quarterly journal came out from Vienna in 1818 under the title Jahrbucher der Literatur (=Jahrbuchcr) and ended in 1849 after having published 128 volumes in toto.[152] It covers largely the literary scenario of the European countries, but occasionally devotes special section for the Eastern literature,:almost following the same tradition which was set up by Fundgruben whose last sixth volume appeared in the same year when this Journal commenced. Almost at the end of every volume, there was a special section for providing literary information and comprehensive reviews on the new books. Usually these reviews were arranged either according to their subjects or the countries from where the books under review were published. Among the contributors of the Journal many distinguished savants of the various disciplines are included, such as the philosophers like Arthur Schopenhaur (1788-1860), August Wilhelm von Schlegel (1767-1845) and the oriel,' lists like Jean Pierre Abel Rernusat (1788-1832), Julien Heinrich Klaproth (1783-1835) and Gusl,r. Leberecht Flugel (1802-1870).

---

[151] Fuck, op. cit., pp. 135-140; Roebuck, op. cit. ; Muhammad Atique Siddiqi: Gilchrist awr us ka Ahd (Gilchrist and his Age,), in Urdu, Aligarh 1960 (2nd ed., Delhi 1979), pp. 135-184; Muhammad Sadiq: A History of Urdu Literature, Karachi: OUP 1985 (London 1964); A. Schimmel: Classical Urdu Literature from the Beginning to Iqbal. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1975.

[152] A quarterly journal, published from Vienna in Gothic script; at the end of every volume a special section was reserved for reviews under the title "Anzeige - Blatt für Wissenschaft und Kunst" (in the first four volumes) and from the fifth to the last volume under "Intelligenz - Nachricht der Verlagshandlung". The editor of this Journal was Matthaus von Collin (1779-1824), a poet, aesthetician and brother of the dramatist Heinich von Collin (see, Osterreichische Biographisches Lexikon, op. cit., I (1957), p. 151). He was a professor of history and philosophy in Krakau in 1808 and then returned to Vienna. He was an intimate friend of Hammer (see Erinnerungen, pp. 177, 180, 182, 205, 232, 241). Goethe obtained the early volumes of this Journal from Clemens Wenzel von Metternich-Winneburg (1773-1859), an Austrian diplomat and statesman, cf. Ingeborg H. Solbrig, op. cit., p. 251.

From the very beginning, Hammer was closely associated with this Journal and regularly contributed articles and detailed reviews on almost every aspect of Islamic literature and learning, particularly his deep and very informative studies of the books published from Calcutta and the travelogues relating to the different parts of the Subcontinent which were mostly written by the European travellers like Hugel, Moorcroft, Orlich etc[153] Some lexicographical, philological and grammatical works of the Persian language by the Indian Muslims attracted his attention and his reviews gave an impetus to others for undertaking their serious study.[154] Here, one of his reviews under the title "Indische Literaturgeschichte"[155] deserves special reference in which he scholarly analysed the first edition of Garcin de Tassy's Histoire de la litterature hindouie et hindoustanie[156] which shows that he was fully aware of the Persian biographical sources of the leading Urdu poets and also knew the varied influences of the Persian language and literature on the origin and early development of Urdu.



---

[153] Jahrbucher, vol. 111 (1845), pp. 1-80, vol. 112 (1845), pp. 45-144, "Indostan und Kaschmir "(review article of sixteen monographs on Indian history, religions and travels).

[154] Jahrbucherher, vol. 107 (1844), pp. 1-59, "Reisen in Afghanistan" (review article of nine monographs on India and Afghanistan); vol. 51 (1830), pp. 16-87, "Indische Literatur" (review article on six books relating to India); vol. I (1818), pp. 260-363, vol. 3 (1818), pp. 133.-203 (review article on "Asiatic Researches; or Transactions of the Society instituted in Bengal ... "); vol. 4 (1818), pp. 102-115 ( review on Pottinger's Travels in Beloochistan und Sinde); vol. 9 (1820), pp. 1-82, vol. 10 (1820), pp. 209-256 (review on The Shah Nama, Calcutta 1811, vol. 1 by Thomas Watley and Sohrab, a poem, Calcutta 1814, by James Atkinson); vols. 125/6 (1849), pp. 141-147 (review on Borhani Qatiu, ed. by Thomas Roebuck, Calcutta 1818 and 3rd ed., Calcutta 1834); vol:2 (1818), pp.87-119 (review on Ichwan-oos-Suffa, Calcutta 1812). vol. 65 (1834), pp. 59-96, "Ostindien" (review on three monographs); vol. 34 (1826), pp. 155-170, "Ueberlieferung und Sprichworter" (review on Mishkat al-Masabih, tr. by A.N. Mathews, Calcutta 1809 and A Collection of Proverbs, and proverbial phrases, in the Persian and Hindoostanee languages. Compiled by T. Roebuck. Calcutta 1824).

[155] Jahrbucher, vol. 120 (1847), pp. 126-147.

[156] 2 vols., Paris 1839, 1847; 2nd ed.,3 vols. Paris 1870=71 (Reprinted: New York: Burt Franklin, 1968).

Some rulers of the Muslim dynasties in this Subcontinent were very learned persons and their poetical collections and autobiographical works have been considered literary masterpieces. Among the ruling literati, it is perhaps a unique example that a king of Oudh, Ghaziuddin Haydar (r. 1819-1827), founded a royal typography in Lucknow at great expense with the technical assistance of an Englishman, named Russell, and printed a number of books in Persian and Arabic. He was deeply interested in Persian lexicography and before ascending to the throne he compiled a voluminous dictionary of Persian language entitled Haft Qulzum ('Seven Seas')[157] which was published beautifully from this press in 1822. Its authorship remains a controversial question and historians ascribe it to Mawlawi Qabul Muhammad who was deputed by the King himself for reshaping and recasting the whole script.[158]

Haft Qulzum, a dictionary and grammar of the Persian language, discusses rhetorics, poetry, prosody, etc. and displays clearly the compiler's incomparable knowledge of elegant nuances of the poetical artistry and the different rhetorical forms of the Persian language.

Immediately after its publication, several copies of this Dictionary were sent to the various European countries, as ordered by the King Ghaziuddin Haydar. One copy reached Vienna, and Hammer reviewed its first six parts in the Jahrbucher.[159] In the beginning, he described in brief the contemporary history of Oudh, its political relations with the East India Company and the Indian contribution to the Persian lexicography, He took a few years for

---

[157] Seven pts. in 2 vols., Lucknow: Matba' Sultani, 1237/1821 (pp. 1588 of the large size; seven pts. in one vol., Lucknow: Newalkishor, 1879 (pp. 1403 of the large size); 1308/1891 (pp. 1170); Prof. Sayyid Masud Hasan Rizwi Adeeb: "Shahaan-i-Awadh ka Ilmi wa Adabi Zauq" (in Urdu), in: Nazr-e-Zakir, New Delhi, 1968, p. 179; Dr. Shahriyar Naqvi: Farhang Nawisi Farsi dar Hind wa Pakistan. (in Persian), Teheran 1341 shamsi, pp. 317-320.

[158] Najm-ul-Ghani Rampuri: Tarikh-e-Awadh (in Urdu), vol. 4, Lucknow 1919, pp. 207-209.

[159] vol. 35-(1826), pp. 129-170; vol. 36 (1826), pp. 250-292; vol. 37 (1827), pp. 166-207; vol. 38 (1827), pp.19-51; vol. 39 (1827), pp. 110-128.

writing this detailed review, as he was engaged in cutting and casting a new Nastaliq character for Persian words. In an unpublished letter written to the Court of Directors, from Vienna on 31st July 1831, he writes:

In the letter by which I gave to the Directors of the Hon'ble the East India Company my most respectful thanks for the valuable present of the 'Haft Kolzoom' of His Majesty, the King of Oude, I promised to give a detailed account of this most useful Dictionary in the 'Vienna Review'. If seven years have elapsed since the cause of so long a delay is less to be looked for in the numerous interruptions of my reading and study of this Dictionary than in the toil of cutting and casting a new small Nestaalik character with which is printed the list of more than 3000 Persian words which are related to so many of germanic root.

As there existed at Vienna formerly no other Oriental Types but the old 'Naskhi' ones with which some words have been printed in the notes I was eager not to finish this notice till I could show off with my answer the first Nestaalik character cut and cast and used on the Continent. This type being finished for its greatest part I take the liberty to transmit to you, Sir, a separate copy of this notice printed in different years in different numbers of the 'Vienna Review'. I leave it quite to the decision of the Honorable Directors of the East India Company whether the book itself deserves to be forwarded by them to His Majesty the King of Oudh as a token of gratitude for the generosity with which European libraries and Orientalists have been favored with this literary gift of Royal munificence.[160]

At the end of his review, Hammer announced that the seventh part of Haft Qulzum would be translated and commented by Friedrich Riickert,[161]

---

[160] Board's Collections. 50503-50514 (1830-1831), vol. 1256, Nr. F/4/1256, Document Nr. 50514, India Office Library and Records (London).

The last paragraph of this letter is as follows:

"I take the liberty to enclose also a letter of thanks to the Committee of Fort William for useful instruction from which I received the present of some printed Arabic and Persian books noticed in the Literary Gazette of Leipzig."

his poetically competent former student. Riickert's ingenious translation and long analysis of this Dictionary were published in different volumes of the Jahrbucher[162] and almost half a century later Wilhelm Pertsch (1832-1899), a former student and great admirer of Ruckert, compiled these scattered parts in a book called Grammatik, Poetik and Rhetorik der Perser[163] with some emendations and copious notes. According to A, Schimmel, "The book that thus came into existence ... belongs to the most fascinating studies of the highly sophisticated art of Persian poetry as it was practised in the Subcontinent throughout the centuries."[164]

With the efforts of Hammer, this Dictionary attairvd a great celebrity in Europe than it enjoyed in India. While cataloguing the manuscripts of the royal libraries of the kings of Oudh, Dr. Aloys Sprenger found a large number of its copies which had been eaten by white ants. A relevant brief note in his Nachlass describes that "The book is not esteemed in Lucknow and certainly overrated in Europe. Hundred of copies are rotting in the Topkhanah [one of the royal libraries]. In the Furah Bakhsh [another royal library] are seven very neatly written lists of errata to the seven volumes of Haft Qulzum which have not been printed."[165]



---

[161] "Im nachsten Bande folgt die Anzeige des siebenten Bandes von Hrn. Prof, Ruckert, und nach Schluss derselben erst das Verzeichnfss der viertausend persischen mit germanischen verwandten Wörter (p. 128).

[162] Under the title "Persische Philologie": Fortsetzung der Recension des Siebenmeers." vol. 40 (1827), pp. 153-220; vol. 41 (1828), pp. 11-27; vol. 42 (1828), pp. 65-93; vol. 43 (1828), pp. 43-83; vol, 44 (1828), pp. 66-140.

[163] Grammatik, Poetik und Rhetorik der Perser. Nach dem 7. Bande des Heft Kolzum dargestellt, hrsg. Von W. Pertsch, Gotha 1874 (Reprinted: Osnabruck: 1966). Reviewed by H.L. Fleischer, in: Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenldndischen Gesellschaft (= ZDMG) 31 (1877), pp. 563-581;32 (1878), pp. 225-270.

[164] German Contributions to the Study of Indo-Pakistani Linguistics. Hamburg: The German-Pakistan Forum, 1981, p. 16.

[165] Nachlass Sprenger, in: Staatsbibliothek Preussischer Kulturbesitz (Berlin, West).

Hammer was an honorary member of the learned societies and institutions, functioning in the different parts of this Subcontinent, like the Asiatic Society of Bengal (Calcutta) and the two active branches of the Royal Asiatic Society in Bombay and Madras (1829)[166] The Proceedings and Transactions of their Journals, mostly after 1830, inform that he used to send the copies of his new books and the numbers of Jahrbucher for the libraries of these institutions and also asked for their publications in exchange.[167] Some of his letters have .also been reproduced in these Journals which he wrote either directly to the editors or indirectly to his friends like Aloys Sprenger and Nathaniel Bland (1803-1865).[168]

Here one of his informative articles can be referred which was published in five parts in the Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal from 1834 to 1839, in which he introduced and abridged a book named Mohit[169] (ocean), a

---

[166] The Royal Asiatic Society. Its History and Treasures. Edited by Stuart Simmonds and Simon Digby. Leiden and London 1979; O.P. Kejariwal: The Asiatic Society of Bengal and the Discovery of India's Past, 1784-1838. Delhi: OUP, 1988; JASB, Annual Report, 1848, pt. 1, p. XLI.

[167] Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal (=JASB), Proceedings, vol. II (1833), p. 547; vol. III (1834), pp. 525, 526 "Literary Communcations"; vol. V (1836), pp. 435, 756; vol. VI (1837), p. 708; vol. VIII (1839), p. 865; vol. XI (1842), p. 1198; vol. XIV (1845), p. XXXI; vol. XXIII (1854), p. 307.

[168] JASB, vol. XIV/2 (July - Dec. 1845), Proceedings, p. XCIV.

The last paragraph of the letter from His Highness Prince Esterhazy, Ambassador of His Imperial Majesty the Emperor of Austria at the British Court (London, 4 August 1835): "The enclosed letters and the Oriental works you have sent to the Aulic Councellor Von Hammer, have also been forwarded to their destination" (ibid., v (1836), p. 55).

[169] Extracts from the Mohit, that is the Ocean, a Turkish work on Navigation in the Indian Ocean.". (JASB 3/35 Nov. 1834), pp. 545-553; 5/56 (August, 1836), pp. 441-468; 6/70 (Oct.,1837), pp. 805-812; 7/81 (Sept. 1838), pp. 767-780 (James Prinsep: Note on the above chapter, pp. 774-780); 8/94 (Oct., 1839), pp. 823-830; Ibid., Proceedings, Dec. 1850, p. 568 and 1851, "Literary Intelligence", p. 621.

Reproduced in: Reprints of Studies on the Works of the Ottoman Admiral Sidi 'Ali (d. 1562).Edited by Fuat Sezgin in collaboration with M. Amawi, C. Ehrig-Eggert and E. Neubauer, Frankfurt a. M. 1992, pp. 1-68.

Hammer: "Notice and Extracts of the Miritolmemalik (Mirror of countries) of Sidi Ali Capoodawn" (in: Transactions of the Literary Society of Bombay (London), 2 (1820), pp. 1-14).

In the second part of Hammer's translation, the editor of JASB (James Prinsep) writes:

"The value set upon it [Mohit] by this eminent oriental scholar [Hammer], induced him to offer to translate the whole for the Oriental Translation Committee; but through some accident, (we can ascribe it to no other cause,) an offer so generous has remained unacknowledged. "Without doubt," our correspondent [i.e. Hammer] writes, "the book would deserve much more the care of the Committee than many of minor interest published by it; but although to my volunteer I got no more answer than to my offer of an edition and translation of Wassaf, agar hajat bashed, as the Persians say, and with the assistance and remarks of some Indian sea-faring gentleman on the parts already translated, I hope to send chapter after chapter to your Indian Journal, and thus we shall be independent of the Committee". (1836, p. 441).

On p. 442 there is a footnote on the world "Baron" which is as follows:

"It seems we erred in giving that designation to Counsellor Von Hammer in 1833; but our announcement proved prophetic; the Emperor having conferred, the title to him in December 1835, upon his succeeding to the little state of Hainfeld bequeathed to him and his male descendants by the late Countess Purgstall (Cranstoun). The present paper is a proof that this accession of honors will not detract from the zeal of his Oriental studies Ed."

See also, Die topographischen Capitel des indischen Seespiegels MOHIT, Ubersetzt von Dr. Maximilian Bittner. Mit einer Einleitung sowie mit 30 Tafeln versehen von Dr. Wilhelm Tomaschek. Festschrift zur Erinnerung an die Eröffnung des Seeweges nach Ostindien durch Vasco da Gama (1497). Hrsg. von K.K. Geographischer Gesellschaft in Wien. Wien 1897 (refers Hammer's above- mentioned translation, p. 4); M. Bittner: "Zum "Indischen Ozean" des Seidi All Celebi. Bemerkungen zu einer Ubersetzung aus dem Turkischen (in: Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde des Morgenlandes, 10 (1896), pp. 21-35).

Admiral Sidi 'Ali (d.1562).[170] In a letter of 31 March 1834, Hammer wrote that he was informed about this significant nautical work for the first time from Haji Khalifah's Kash/uz Zunun.[171] Fortunately, he found a manuscript from the library of the Museo Borbonico at Naples in 1825 and in 1832 he bought another manuscript from Istanbul and his analysis and translation are based on these two manuscripts[172] In the introductory remarks of this article,

---

[170] See, "Ancora del Muhit, o "descrizione dei mari delle Indie" dell'ammiraglio turco Sidi Ali detto Kiatib-i-Rum". By L. Bonelli (in: Rendiconti dell' Accademia dei Lincei, Classe di scienze morali, serie quinta, 3 (1894), pp. 751-777; 4 (1895), pp. 36-51); "Miroir des pays, au relations des voyages de Sidi Aly fils d'Housain, nomme Katibi Roumi, amiral de Soliman II, traduit sur la version allemande de H.P von Diez par M. Morris, in: Journal Asiatique 9 (1826), pp. 27-56, 65-97, 129.153, 193-217, 280-299; 10 (1827), pp. 46-53, 94-112.

[171] In the introduction of Mohit's translation, Hammer writes:

"My attention to the high interest of this nautical work having been first roused thirty years ago, by the article mentioning it in,Haji Calfa's Bibliographic Dictionary..."

(JASB, Nov. 1834, p. 545).

[172] Hammer explains that,

"., I spared no kind of exertion to find a copy of it (i.e. Mohit), whether in the libraries, or among the book-selles of Constantinople: but all my researches were baffled for more than twenty years, until at length I lighted upon it in the library of the Museo Borbonico at Naples, in the year 1825; and after an investigation of seven years more, I was at last fortunate enough to buy at Constantinople, the manuscript serving for this notice. It is written in the fair Neskhi hand, bearing the stamp of Sultan Suleiman'o age, and is stated to have been copied but four years after the composition of the original, which was finished at Ahmedabad, the capital of Gujerat, in last days of Moharram of the year 962 (December 1554), while the present copy was finished in the town of Amed or Diarbeker, in the first days of Rabi ul awal of the year 966, (December, 1558). The manuscript consists of 134 leaves or 238 pages, large octavo."

(JASB, Nov. 1834, pp. 545-546),

James Prinsep (1792-1878) criticised some of the conclusions drawn by Hammer and added some new material.[173]

(8)

Hammer was a prolific writer and a long list of his publications shows his prodigious energy as an eminent scholar. However, he devoted comparatively less space to the cultural contribution of the Indian Muslims. In spite of that he was probably the first German-speaking orientalist who drew the attention of his contemporaries to some major works of the Indo-Muslim tradition. In one of his oft-quoted works entitled Geschichte der schonen Redekiinste Persiens[174] he was the first to write a literary history of Persia and the countries under its cultural influence and devoted some pages to the leading Indian poets of Persian language. These poets were the representatives of the Indian style of Persian poetry which took a step towards innovation in the sphere of thought and content, in the sphere of imagery and also in the domain of the language of poetry[175] He refers to the early Muslim dynasties of India whose rulers were of Turkish descent and their patronage of the learned people, particularly the Mughal kings, like Babur and Jahangir, who wrote their own memoirs[176] He also mentioned

---

See also, "Sidi Ali Shelebi in India, 1554-1556 A.D." By C.E. A.W. Oldham (in: Indian Antiquary (Bombay), vol. LIX (Nov. 1930), pp. 219-224; Dec. 1930, pp. 239-241; vol. LX (Jan. 1931), pp. 5-8; Feb. 1931, pp. 26-30).

[173] JASB, vol. 7 (1838), pp. 774-780.

[174] Full title: Geschichte der schonen Redekünste Persiens vom. 4 Jahrhundert der Hedschra, das ist vom 10ten der christlichen Zeitrechnung bis auf unsere Zeit. Mit einer Blütenlese aus 200 persischen Dichtern. Wien: Volke, 1818. (Reviewed by M.— S. in: Jahrbucher I (1818), pp. 1-25); a major source of Goethe's Noten und Abhandlungen (cf. Ingeborg H. Solbrig, op. cit., pp. 165-191).

[175] Wilhelm Heinz: Der indische Stil in der persischen Literatur, Wiesbaden: Steiner, 1973 (pp. 122); G. Morrison (ed.): History of Persian Literature from the Beginning of the Islamic Period to the Present Day. Leiden/Köln: Brill, 1981 pp. 145-165, "Persian Literature (Belles - Lettres) from the time of Jami to the present day "by Shafi'i Kadkani.

[176] pp. 351-354; orignially written in Chaghatai Turkish and later translated into Persian.

Sa'ib (d.I669/70), a poet of the first order in the Indian style[177] Abu'l Fazl,[178] and his brother Faizi,[179] emperor Akbar's close friends, alongwith a German translation of some of their selective excerpts.[180] He remarked about a few Persian translations of the Sanskrit works, made during that period. Then in the 'Seventh Period'[181] he analyses the decline of the poetic art and historiography in Persia and in India and provides useful information about the epistolographical literature with bibliographical details and travelogues of the period (including the Travels of Abu Talib Khan).[182] At the end the editions and translations of the Persian histories and poetical collections, rendered by the English scholars, have been referred.[183]

Likewise, in another voluminous book under the title Gemäldesaal der Lebensbeschrezbungen grosser moslimischer Herrscher der ersten sieben Jahrhunderte der Hedschra,[184] Hammer wrote in detail about the political history of the early Muslim rulers of India like Mahmud Ghaznawi,[185] Qutb-

---

[177] pp. 393 f.

[178] pp. 395-399.

[179] pp. 400-410. Hammer was deeply impressed by his poetry and translated many of his ghazals.

[180] Mostly ghazals, version of the fables of the Anwar-i-Sohaili and the 'Ayar-i-Danish.

[181] "Siebenter Zeitraum. Verfall der Dichtkunst und Geschichte in Persien und in Indien" (pp. 411-416).

[182] "Abuthalibchan, den Dichter mehrerer Ghaselen, der seine Reise in England und von England zu Lande nach Indien beschrieb, hat der Verfasser dieses Werks bey seiner Durchreise zu Konstantinopel persönlich kennen gelernt, und dankt ihm eine ehrenvolle Erwahnung unter dem von englischen Uebersetzer verstummelten Nahmen Himru". Redekünste p. 414).

[183] The editions and translations of the well - known Persian books by Gladwin, Atkinson, Scott, Franklin and Lumsden have been referred (p. 416).

[184] 6 vols., Leipzig/ Darmstadt: Leske, 1837-1839.

ud-Din Aibak,[186] Ala-ud-Din Khalji[187] and Firoz Tughluq[188] and the whole material is based on the primary sources, mainly of the Persian language.

(9)

Dr. Aloys Sprenger (1813-1893), a renowned Austrian orientalist, is very rightly considered as one of the leading authorities of the literature of Muslim India.[189] He came to India and held very influential posts in the Muslim educational institutions in Bengal (Calcutta Madrasah etc.) and North India (Delhi College etc.) which played so decisive a role in refashioning Muslim thought in India. His fourteen years' stay in India (1843-1856) proved pivotal to his profound scholarship and comprehensive bibliographical knowledge of Islamic sources.

Sprenger was one of the 'favourite pupils of Hammer, when he was studying in Vienna in 1833 and seeing his passionate ardour for Oriental languages he was encouraged by Hammer. Sprenger was deeply impressed by his teacher's scholarship and methodology and throughout his life he tried to

---

[185] vol. IV (1837), pp. 101-160.

[186] "Kutbeddin Ibek aus der Familie Ghawri, Gründer der Reiches von Dehli" (vol. IV, pp. 161-186).

[187] Alaeddin der Cholodsche der dreiunddreizigster Herrscher von Dehli. " (vol. IV, pp. 187-223).

[188] "Firuz Toghluk, der dritte Herscher der Toghlukschahe zu Dehli. " (vol. IV, pp. 224-246).

[189] M. Ikram Chaghatai: "Dr. Aloys Sprenger. His Life and Contribution to the Urdu Language and Literature." (in: Iqbal Review 36/1 (Lahore) April 1995, pp. 77-79); Ibid.: "Dr. Aloys Sprenger and Delhi College" (forthcoming); Ibid. in: Austrian Scholarship in Pakistan - A Symposium dedicated to the memory of Aloys Sprenger. Islamabad 1997, pp. 9-33; Stephan Prochazka: "Die Bedeutung der Werke Aloys Sprenger für die Arabistik und Islamkunde", in: Tiroler Heirnatblätter Innsbruck, 69 Jg. 2/1994, pp. 38-42; Norbert Mantl: Aloys Sprenger. Der Orientalist und Islamhistoriker aus Nassereith in Tirol. Zum 100. Todestag am 19. Dezember 1993. Im Selbstverlag der Gemeinde Nassereith, 1993.

follow them. He admitted it openly when he was engaged in compiling the catalogue of the royal libraries of the kings of Oudh in 1848.[190]

After leaving Austria, Sprenger did not meet Hammer, but they remained in touch with each other through correspondence, especially when Sprenger was in India. Recently, Hammer's four German letters have been discovered,[191] written to Sprenger from 1844 to 1852, in which he congratulates Sprenger for having published the English translation of Mas ' udi (1841),[192] the Persian text of Saadi's Gulistan[193] (1851) and Biography of the Holy Prophet[194] (1851). Further, he asked Sprenger to help him in finding a manuscript of the Diwan of Abul Ma'ani,[195] a famous Persian poet, from any Indian library. In exchange, Sprenger also responded to Hammer and his

---

[190] JASB, XXII 6 (1853), "Catalogues of Oriental Libraries" by A. Sprenger, p. 539.

[191] Fritz Lochner v. Hüttenbach "Vier Briefe Hammer - Purgstalls an Aloys Sprenger. Ein Beitrag zu seinem lebhaften Interesse an orientalischer Dichtung," in: Im Bankreis des Alten. Orients. Studien zur Sprach-und Kulturgeschichte des Alten Orients und seines Ausstrahlungsraumes. Karl Oberhuber zum 70. Geburtstag gewidmet. Hrsg. von Wolfgang Meid und Helga Trenkwalder. Innsbruck 1986, pp. 143-151.

[192] Meadows of Gold and Mines of Gems (London 1841), Oriental Translation Fund)- Only 1st vol. of the translation was published and the second remained incomplete.

[193] The Gulistan of Sa'dy, edited in Persian with punctuation and the necessary vowel-marks for the use of the Collge of Fort William. Calcutta 1851, (pp. 241).

[194] The Life of Muhammad from original sources, Allahabad 1851. (upto the Hijrah). Afterwards, he completed this book entitled Das Leben und die Lehre des Mohammad in three volumes (Berlin 1861-1865, 2nd ed. Berlin 1869) in which he "attempted to establish the general laws governing the origin of Islam, and interpreted it in purely rational terms as a creation of the spirit of the time..."

(See, Johann Fück Arabische Kultur und Islam im Mittelalter. Ausgewahlte Schriften. Hrsg. von Manfred Fleischhammer, Weimar: Hermann Böhlaus Nachfolger, 1981, p. 318).

[195] JASB, 1851, "Literary Intelligence" by A. Sprenger, p. 621, see Hammer's Abu/ - Maanis' Juwelenschnüre das ist Bruckstücke eines bekannten persischen Dichters. Wien: A. Doll, 1822.

four German letters written to him during the years of 1844 to 1850 (?) are still available in the archives of Schloss Hainfeld (near Feldbach, East Styria) where the whole personal collection of Hammer is housed.[196] These letters are in Kurrentschrift; a very peculiar German handwriting and some of their parts are not readable. In these letters, Sprenger informed his teacher about his scholarly projects which he launched after coming to India and educational reforms introduced in. the Delhi College, when he was appointed its Principal. Besides, they have discussed some of their personal matters which furnish useful and new information about their lives.[197]

(10)

Apart from Sprenger, Hammer also corresponded with all the major European scholars of his time and his letters chronicle the development of Oriental studies in Europe. Among these continental orientalists, a distinguished British Sanskritist named Horace Hayman Wilson (1786-1860) was also included. He did much to promote a real knowledge of the very numerous branches of Indian learning. Commencing his oriental studies by learning Urdu, he switched over to Sanskrit in which his life long contribution shows his immense erudition. He was an employee of Bengal

---

[196] Sprenger wrote these four letters to Hammer from Dehli, Calcutta and Alexandria. Their photocopies are now available in the Institut fur ( vergleichende) Sprachwissenschaft der Karl-Franzens-Universitat (Graz); Alois Sprenger: Brief an Hummer - Purgstall. 5 pages. Separatabdruck (cf. Gesammtverzeichnis des deutschsprachigen Schrifttums, 1700-1910. vol. 137, Munchen & others, 1985, p. 2871); one of these letters (Calcutta, 6 July 1850) was also published in Sitzungsberichte der kaiser/when Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch - historische Classe. vol. 5 (Vienna 1850), pp. 799-802; see also, Bibliotheca Asiatica. Teilweise aus der Bibliothek des Prof. Dr. Alois Sprenger (Tiroler Landesmuseum, Innsbruck, in: Bibliotheca Tiro/ens Ferdinand, No. 11417)

[197] In a letter (Vienna, 25 Nov. 1845) Hammer writes to Sprenger: Eng. tr. "... I am in the pangs of death as regards my youngest promising son. Eight days ago he left with his two sisters for Venice so as to find recovery there in a milder climate. This makes me completely disconcerted and little disposed to working. After the greatest misfortune of my life, the loss of my 'slig' (means: now living in bliss) wife, may God prevent this new (Misfortune) from (hitting) your". (For original German text, see no. 66, op. cit., p. 144). Likewise, Sprenger narrates the experiences and observations of his extensive travelling in Ladakh and Kashmir and compares the climatic and botanical conditions of the Himalaya with the Alpine regions. (See, Sitzungsberichte, op. cit., p. 802).

Medical Service (1808-1834) and held the office of secretary to the Asiatic Society of Bengal (1811-1833). After going back to England, he was appointed the Boden Professor of Sanskrit in Oxford University.[198]

The correspondence between Hammer and Wilson continued more than forty years. It began when Wilson was the secretary of the Asiatic Society of Bengal and they were exchanging their journals and other publications. Presently, Hammer's eighteen letters addressed to Wilson are available in the Wilson Collection which was presented to the India Office Library and Records (London) in January 1969[199] All these letters are in English and the first letter'was written on 1st May 1815 and the last on 6 March 1855, about twenty months before his death in 1856. Three letters, including the last one, are written by his daughter, Isabella[200] Mostly Hammer comments on Wilson's books or discusses the activities of the Asiatic Society of Bengal. In one of his letters (14 March 1844) Hammer writes that he translated the passages concerning India from Al-Fihrist of Ibn Nadim and sent it to the journal of the Society in 1842 but he was still waiting for its publication.[201]

It would be interesting to note here that Wilson also responded to him and at present his ten letters written to Hammer (from 1st December 1813 to

---

[198] The Dictionary of National Biography. Edited by Sir Leslie Stephen and Sir Sidney Lee, vol. XXI, Reprinted: Oxford 1964-65 (1921-22), pp. 568-570, art. by Cecil Bendall.

[199] This Collection comprises letters dating from 1812 to 1860, addressed to H. H. Wilson, who was among the best known oriental scholars of his generation, and corresponded with all the major European and Indian Sanskritists. These lettes are chronologically arranged in fifteen volumes and the last one consists of Wilson's miscellaneous papers and undated letters. Prof. and Mrs. Gerald Sirkin presented this whole Collection to the India Office Library and Records in January 1969. (Nr. MSS Eur E 301).

[200] 1819-1872, married Freiherr von Trenk-Jondern (1812-1877): See, Erinnerungen, op. cit., p. 576. She wrote three letters, signed by Hammer, dated 2 May 1841, 16 December 1841 and 6 March 1855 and the first one was sent from Dobling near Vienna.

[201] Hammer writes: "I hope to find in the next the translation of the passages concerning India, translated from the Fihrist, transmitted two years ago to the Society. These extracts form a side-piece to those on the Sabians given in the Journal Asiatique of Paris," (Vienna, 14 March 1841),

15 March 1841) are extant, two in the Manuscript Section of the Austrian National Library[202] (Vienna) and eight in the archives of Schloss Hainfeld.[203] In one of these letters (June 1823) it is mentioned that Wilson sent seventeen pamphlets published by Ram Mohan Roy who was introduced to Hammer as the modern reformer of both the Hindu and Christian faiths[204]

All these letters are very important for the European history of Oriental studies and will be published separately.[205]

(11)

In comparison to Hammer's Turkish, Arabic and Persian studies, his contribution to Indology in general and to the cultural heritage of the Muslim India in particular is meagre. He did not write any book on this subject and most of his writings are published in the different European and Indian journals. He concentrated more on the political and literary history of Turkey, Central Asia and the Middle Eastern countries and it seems that his studies relating to the Muslim India is the continuation of his major work, as majority of the Muslim rulers in India were of Turkish extraction and their traditions influenced immensely the cultural life of the local people.

Besides, Hammer indirectly contributed to Indian languages and literature. As a pioneer of Islamic studies in German-speaking countries and the first president of the Academy of Sciences, he provided a momentum for accelerating the interest of his pupils and friends in varied subjects such as history, culture, art and architecture of this Subcontinent.[206] His scholarly

---

[202] Osterreichische Nationalbibliothek . (Vienna), Handschriftenabteilung Nr. 8/81-1, 8/81-2.

[203] See, Erinnerungen, op. cit., p. 569.

[204] From Calcutta, June 1823,

[205] A fully annotated edition of all these letters is in preparation.

[206] See, Richard Meister; Geschichte der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Wien, 1847-1947. Wien: Druck und Verlag Adolf Holzhausens NFG, 1947; Renate Wagner-Rieger: Das Haus der Osterreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Festgabe zur 125 l25-

efforts are.now culminated in the formation of the Hammer-Purgstall Gesellschaft (1958) which is also striving to highlight the literary and cultural achievements of the Muslim of the South Asian Subcontinent.[207]

Jahrfeier der Akademie. Wien: In Kommission bei H. Böhlaus Nachf. 1972; see also, Rede des Präsidenten der kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften bei der feierlichen Eroffnung derselben am 2. Februar 1848. By Hammer-Purgstall (first President of the Academy).

[207] Zwanzig Jahre Hammer - Purgstall - Gesellschaft, 1958-1978. Geleitet von Franz Sauer, Graz: Akademisch Druck u. Verlagsanstalt, 1978 (with articles by Dr. Carl Blaha, Dr. Herbert W. Duda and Dr. Herbert Jansky).

# THE SUFI TROBAR CLUS AND SPANISH MYSTICISM: A SHARED SYMBOLISM

**(Part I)**

Luce López-Baralt

Translated by Andrew Hurley

*The process of assimilating the aesthetics, the mysticism, and the narrative and metaphoric symbolic devices that were present in the literature of their Moorish neighbours went on among the Christians of Castille for hundreds of years; some day [the co presence of that literature in Spanish letters] will be talked about with the same naturalness as we say today that Virgil and Ovid were present in the literature of the sixteenth century.*

*Americo Castro*

After the vast work of the Arabist Miguel Asin Palacios, few of us will be surprised today by a study whose purpose is to link the Spanish mysticism of the Siglo de Oro to the mysticism of the Islamic Middle Ages. The present author has detailed, in more than one study, the close parallels between the two traditions. But the degree to which the mystical literature of Spain comes under the influence of Islam is much greater than we have seen to date,[208]

208 Cf the present author's studies on this subject: San Juan de la Cruzy el /slam; Huellas de Islam en la literatura espanota. De Juan Ruiz a Juan Goytisolo (also trans. to Arabic and English: cf bibliography); - Luce Lopez-Baralt,'ed., Miguel Asin Palacios, Saihilcies v alumhrados; Luce Lopez-Baralt and Eulogio Pacho, eds., San Juan de la Cruz, Obra comp/eta; Un Kama Sutra espaiol; Literaturcr hispano=semiticu comparada (with Marta Elena Venier), double number of Nueva Revista de Filo/ogia Hispbnica; El sol a medianoche. La experiencia mistica, tradition y actualidad; Asedios a to indecible San Juan de la Cruz can/a al extasis transformante (in press: Madrid: Trotta). In the volume I am now preparing, titled La literatura secreta de /os ultimos musulmanes de Espana, I include many articles on aljamiado-morisco literature, and in Nuevas huellas de/ Is/am en /a literatura espanola: de Juan Ruiz a Jorge Luis Borges (also to be published soon) I include my recent comparative studies nature on the literature of Spain and the Near East.

certainly greater than Asin Palacios was able to document in the essays in which for the first time he established the connection. Writers such as St John of the Cross and St Teresa of Avila (to mention but the two greatest figures) present us with a singular phenomenon: they share with their Islamic counterparts many of the same symbols and much of the most important technical language of mysticism. This fact is most significant, for (at least from the literary point of view) it implies that one must seek the precedents for much of St John's and St Teresa's vocabulary among the Sufis. We find ourselves dealing, therefore, with the phenomenon of a sometimes quite enigmatic European literary Symbolism that only keys from Arabic and Persian literature unlock.[209]

---

The present study is based on an earlier study, "Simbologia mistica islamica en San Juan de la Cruz y en Santa Teresa de Jesus" (.NRFH XXX (1981), 21-91), which I have corrected, expanded, and brought up to date. The present article compares the mystical Symbolism of Islam as it appears in the extensive Islamic literature with the surprising appearance of that Symbolism in the mystical belles lettres of Peninsular Spain, but does not deal at any length with the possible historical routes by which the Spanish mystics, and especially the Carmelite reformers St. John of the Cross and St. Teresa de Jesus, might have had access to the sophisticated contemplative culture of the Muslims. For essays specifically addressing the problem of the historical filiation between the two religious traditions (a problem which also occupied the great Muslim critic Miguel Asian Palaces until his death), cf. the present author's articles and books San Juan de la Cruz y el Islam, the Introduction to the Obra completa of St. John of the Cross (bibliographic reference above), and "Acerca de la enseñanza del arabe en Salamanca en tiempos de San Juan de la Cruz o de como el maestro Cantalapiedra 'Ieia el aravigo por un libro que se llama la .Jurrumia"" (in press, Colegio de Mexico). In this last article I discuss a recent discovery: contrary to what both Marcel Bataillon and I have been maintaining for some time. Arabic was indeed taught at the University of Salamanca when St. John of the Cross studied there.

209 A caveat needs to be inserted here about these Persian sources. Some parallels or congruences between the symbolism of Irani mystical literature and that of St. John and St. Teresa seem to me obvious, and I include them here. However, I do not believe that this is a case of direct influence, which\would clearly be historically difficult; I think, rather, that the examples of Persian Sufi Symbolism that I have documented bear a cultural relationship to the Sufism of Spain and Africa, which is then that line of 'Sufism that exerted more proximal influence on St. John and Spanish mysticism in general. Muslim mysticism in the Persian language implies a literary tradition distinct in certain senses from the Muslim literary tradition in Arabic; there is not space here to enlarge upon these variants but I do want to note that they exist.

Although Sufi poets and their commentators often employed a poetic language that we might call "open," with unlimited and arbitrary meanings (we might think of the extraordinarily free glosses to the mystical verses of lbn 'Arabi and lbn al-Farid, themselves so resembling the verses of St John of the Cross), still they respected a number of fixed conceits. They used, that is, a "secret language" to create a trobar clus avant la /ettre—one whose key, according to critics such as Louis Massignon and Emile Dermenghem, only Sufi initiates possessed:

> Les mystiques, dit Lahiji, commentateur du Goulcha-i Raz, Roseraie de Savoir, de Chabistari[,] ... ont convenu d'exprimer par des métaphores leurs découvertes et leurs états spirituels; si ces images parfois étonnent I'intention n'en est pas moins bonne. Les mystiques ont arrange un langage que ne comprennent pas ceux qui n'ont pas leur experience spirituelle, en sorte que lorsqu'ils experiment leurs etats.. . comprend le sens de leurs termes, mais celui que n'y participe pas le sens lui en este interdit... Certains initiés ont exprimé différentes degrés de la contemplation mystique par ses symboles de vétements boubles de cheveux, joues, grains de beaute, vin, flambeaux, etc. . . . qui aux yeux du vulgaire ne forment qu'une brillante apparence.. Ils ont signifié par la boucle la multiplicité des choses que cachent le visage de I'Aimé... le vin répresente ('l'amour, le désir ardent et I'ivresse spirituelle; le flambeau ('irradiation de lumière divide dans le coeur de celui qui suit la voie (Dermenghem, Foreword, Al Khamriyah 62-63).

---

On the other hand, I have employed numerous examples from the Persian tradition (even when I take the Hispano-African and Arabic tradition in general to be the more eloquent one) because documentation of and critical studies on this tradition are much more abundant and accessible. All in all, the reader will note that there are cases in which St. John of the Cross or St. Teresa seems closer to certain symbols characteristic of Persian-language mysticism. It is hard to say whether this is a case of our not having discovered the same symbol among the Sufis of the Arab world or whether it simply does not exist there. If this should be the case, then it would be legitimate to argue that St. John of the Cross is indeed close to Persian/non-Arabic literary sources. The entire phenomenon of Sufi mystical Symbolism and its repercussions in the West needs much further study.

This encoded or "secret" literature is of great antiquity; it has been a literary tradition at least since the tenth century. Farid al-din 'Attar gives us a conversation between lbn 'Arabi (d. 922) and his interlocutors:

> How is it with you Sufis," certain theologians asked Ibn Ata, "that you have invented terms which sound strange to those who hear them, abandoning ordinary language?".. .
>
> "We [have done] it because it is precious to us. . . and we desired that none but we Sufis should know of it. We did .not wish to employ ordinary language, so we invented a special vocabulary" (qtd. in Arberry, 237-8).

Islamicists constantly insist on that "special vocabulary": "the Ghazels or odes . . . are, to those who possess the key to their symbolic imagery, the fervent outpourings of hearts ecstasied…., intoxicated with spiritual love," says Margaret Smith (45), underscoring the mystical meaning beneath the erotic metaphors. "But as time went on certain words began to have a recognised meaning amongst themselves," notes Florence Lederer (5). And she is right: over time the trobar clus was indeed lexicalized and became an easily recognised literary convention. But we should recall that -these tropes were recognisable as conventions within Islam. So when we come upon that same secret symbolic imagery in the pious and unquestionably Christian pages of a St John of the Cross, a Francisco de Osuna, a Juan de los Angeles, or a St Teresa of Avila we cannot help taking the enigma of this presence as an authentic problem of literary history.

We can see immediately that the similarities between the Spanish and Islamic mystics do not lie simply in these shared cryptic conceits —whose origins within Islam (Massignon -Essai sur les origenes) are attributed to Qur'anic sources— but rather involve a broader, and perhaps even more significant, Symbolism, including the dark night of the soul and the lamps of fire found in St John of the Cross and the seven concentric castles of St Teresa. Asin Palacios' suggestion (cf. Escatologia musu/mana) that Islamic eschatological imagery may be detected in the Divine Comedy comes immediately to mind, and we take our .cue from him. Indeed, his book (widely attacked when it appeared in 1919) was the brilliant prelude to all the subsequent discoveries that we comparatists and Islamicists have been

granted as we have followed in Asin's footsteps and compared the two literatures.

Let me make one brief clarification before proceeding. Here, I am "lumping together,"_ as it were, two distinct phenomena: the technical equation of terms—which often borders on the "allegorical" or reminds us of the extended comparison of the European "conceit"—and symbols. Clear differentiation between "conceit" or "allegory" and "symbol," however, is extremely difficult and subtle, even when we are conscious of the many attempts that have been made, from Aristotle and Goethe to Henri Corbin and Seyyed Hossein Nasr, to draw the theoretical distinction between the two. But in this essay, what I propose to do is go to the heart of things and attempt to show that the mystical literature of Spain, and especially that of St John of the Cross and St Teresa of Avila, is fed by similes, metaphors, equivalences, and symbols—in a word, by a symbolic imagery—taken in large part from Islam. (We explore the historical routes by which this influence arrived in our study San Juan de la Cruz y el Islam, q. v.)

I should also note that although this essay will focus on the close parallels between many images and symbols in St John and St Teresa and those used for hundreds of years (so that they finally constitute a literary "tradition") by Islamic mystics, I do not thereby deny the fundamental influence of other, Western, literatures on the two Spanish writers. In the case of St John of the Cross, influences on his writings may be traced from Castillian poetry, the "cult of Italy," popular poetry, the cuncionero tradition, the "divine lyric," and the Song of Songs, as a number of scholars have pointed out. What I will attempt to show is that even when St John evidences having read these sources and closely imitates many lines and many turns of phrase, and even the style, found in those other traditions, the rich semantic content that his symbols hold coincides to a remarkable degree with the semantic content of those same symbols among the Sufis. Thus we will see how, even though St John of the Cross imitates lines from Garcilaso's Eclogue II ("hizo que de mi choza me saliese por el silencio de la noche uscura ": "made me leave my hut and go into the silence of the dark night"), he elevates the phrase to the level of symbol, and the details with which he presents the image seem closer to Niffari and Junayd than to the spiritual generalizations of Sebastian of Córdoba, whom we know St John of the

Cross read. St John is, of course, stylistically distant from the Arabs, and yet a substantial part of his Symbolism would appear to belong to the Islamic literary tradition. The case of St Teresa is similar: although she buttresses her conceit of the interior castle filled with "rooms" with Biblical passages ("In my father's house there are many mansions," John ' 14:2), the symbolic conception of seven concentric castles marking the mystic's progress through seven spiritual stations seems virtually a "direct quotation" from the frequent literary formulations of the same image presented for hundreds of years by Muslim sufi writers.

With that said, let us look at the work of these two Spanish Christian mystics. We will begin with St John of the Cross.

*St John of the Cross*

St John may be a somewhat surprising "Sufi initiate," yet he would seem to be quite familiar with the codes and "secret language" of the Islamic trobar clus, and to employ the same hermetic language that many Muslim mystical poets employed. We, like any elementary reader of Carl Jung, Evelyn Underhill, or Mircea Eliade, may take as a given that certain fundamental symbols or images (light, fire, darkness) recur in all religions. But that is not precisely my argument with respect to St John of the Cross. I will attempt to show that St John's knowledge of the semantic content of some of the most important Islamic symbols is altogether too specific, too detailed, to be merely a casual coincidence that one might expect in any religious person. Even in some cases in which the symbol under consideration might be the legacy of universal mysticism—such as the ascent of the mystical mountain or the transmutation of the soul into a bird—the particular way in which St John portrays the details of the image closely parallels the Sufi counterpart. As we might expect, there are divergences between St John and the Muslims—that is only natural—and yet I .have been able to document more than thirty of these fixed conceits or shared symbols. In this essay we will look at only a few of the most significant of these, while noting that I have chronicled in another essay the work of the medieval European mystics who in one way or another echo this Sufi symbolism that antedates them by hundreds of years.

*(a) Wine and mystical drunkenness.*

Although the Sufis were not the first to use wine or the vineyard as the archetype of spiritual wisdom—we find the association as early as Gilgumesh and the Mishna (Eliade, Patterns 284-6)—we are obliged to note that after several hundred years of its employment in the mystical literature of Is-lam, the conceit of wine, understood invariably as mystical ecstasy, becomes a very part of the language. It is probably this lexicalization of the image that explains the several cases of wine/vineyard symbolism that I have been able to document in a number of medieval European mystics; for this, cf. San Juan de la Cruz y el Islam. But no mystical tradition insists so greatly upon the trope of the wine of ecstatic drunkenness as the Muslim tradition does. St John of the Cross always uses the figure of wine in that same sense; he would appear to be aware of the Sufi "exegetical key" when he sees in his "seasoned wine" a "most great mercy which God makes to those souls who partake of it, for He intoxicates them with the Holy Spirit with a wine of soft love, . . which is that which God gives to those who are now perfect."[210] In other lines, in which there is obvious allusion to the wine and vineyards of the Song of Songs ("In the interior wine-cellar of my Beloved did I drink"[Spiritual Canticle, Il. 81-2]), we are once more in the presence of an ecstatic experience: "the soul becomes God" (CB 26:6; VO 700)

We find this same equation of wine and ecstasy among the Sufis, who are quite conscious of employing a technical vocabulary. In declaiming the verse from Ibn al-Farid, "Nous avons bu a la mémoire du Bien-Aline un vin dont nous nous sommes enivres avant la creation de la vigne," Biruni and Nablusi have this to say:

---

210 San Juan de la Cruz, Vida y ohms comp/etas, CB 25:7 (p. 697). We cite the edition by Crisogono de Jesus et al., Vida y obras comp/etas de' San Juan de la Cruz, Madrid: BAC, 1964, which we will abbreviate as VO. In addition, we will abbreviate the titles of the individual works as follows: —Cantico espiritual," redaction B or Jaen codex: CB; Noche oscura: N; Subida del Monte Carmelo: S; Llama de amor viva L. Where the works are divided into distinct books, chapters, etc. we so indicate. Where possible, we have quoted from the English translations of the works; for those, short titles are given, and the reader is referred to the bibliography. We also refer the reader to our own edition of the Obra comp/eta de San Juan de /u Cruz (edited in collaboration with Eulogio Pacho), in the introduction.to which we explore in detail some of the comparatist subjects that we engage in this article.

> *Biruni* — Sache que cette qacida est composee dans la langue technique des çoufis, dans le lexique desquels le Vin, avec ses noms et ses attributs, signifie ce que Dieu a infuse en leur ame de connaissance, de désir et d'amour. . . Le vin, ici, c'est la Connaissance de Dieu et le désir ardent d'aller vers Dieu (Dermenghem, L'Eloge 117).
>
> *Nabluei* — Le Vin signifie la boisson de L'Amour Divin qui resulte de la contemplation des traces de ses beaux Noms. Car cet amour engendre I'ivresse et I'oubli complet de tout ce qui existe au monde (119).

The Muslims tend to be more specific and more sophisticated in their employment of this symbol of the wine than St John of the Cross, who would appear to have a vague and distant, though accurate, memory of the invariable equivalences. Thus, for Ibn 'Arabi the manifestation of God occurs at four levels represented by images of drinking: the first is dawq (tasting), the second shurb (the drink itself, or the wine), the third is riy (extinction of one's thirst), and the fourth sukr (drunkenness). (Tarjunuin al Ashwaq, 75; hereafter TAA)[211]. If ever a lexicalized "conceit" existed in Sufism, it is'this one: wine understood as ecstatic drunkenness. The Persian poets Jalal al-din Rumi, Shabastari, and Hafiz devote entire poems to this drink, which was forbidden by the Qur'an but celebrated by poets at a new secret level throughout the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. In his "Wine of Rapture," Shabastari exclaims:

> Drink wine! For the bowl is the face of The Friend.
>
> Drink wine! For the cup is his eye.. .
>
> Drink this wine and, dying to self,
>
> You will be freed from the spell of self...
>
> What sweetness! What intoxication! What blissful ecstasy!

---

211 M. Gloton's French version of the Turjuman al Ashwaq, edited by Albin Michel (L'lnterprete. de desirs, Paris, I996), has just been published.

(Lederer, 34-35)

The impassioned Rumi, is quite close to St John: "the heat of the wine fired my breast and flooded my veins," Rumi exclaims (Nicholson 15), and St John appears to follow him almost word for word: "just as the drink spreads and flows through all the members and veins of the body, so does this communication from God spread in substance throughout the soul" (CB 26:5; VO 700).

But by this late moment of splendor in the poetry of Persia, the symbol of wine was already very old; the Persians had received it as a fully-worked-out trope from Sa'di (cf. Smith,Sufi Path 113), Semnani, AI-Ghazzali(cf. Pareja 295). One of the first times we find the figure documented is in the ninth century, when Bistami and Yabya ibn Mu'adh exchange impassioned mystical correspondence in code, employing, as Annemarie Schimmel points out, precisely the terminology of wine:

Sufi hagiography often mentions a letter sent to Bayezid [Bistami, d. 874] by Yabya ibn Mu'adh, who wrote: "1 am intoxicated from having drunk so deeply of the cup of His love--". Abu Yazid [Bayezid] wrote to him in reply: "Some one else has drunk up the seas of Heaven and earth, but his thirst is not yet slaked: his tongue is hanging out and he is crying 'Is there any more?'" (Abu Nu'aym al-Isfahani, Hilyat u/-awliya', Vol. 10, Cairo, 1932, p. 40, quoted in Schimmel, Mystical Dimensions 51)

Naturally, theorists of Islam give great weight to this simile, considering it to be of vital importance in the understanding of this mystical literature a clef and often devoting extensive commentary to it. Often, indeed, it is those critics, gleaning specific nuances from the symbol, who once again remind us, in a startling way, of the closeness of St John of the Cross and the Sufi mystics. Laleh Bakhtiar underscores the emanations received by God's mystic and changing his soul: "Wine is a symbol for the ecstasy which causes the mystic to be beside himself in the presence of a vision of emanation of the Beloved. . . . Wine is the catalyst which causes a motion between the mystic's soul and the spiritual vision" (Bakhtiar, Sufi Expressions 113, emphasis ours). Similarly, when St John comments upon his enigmatic lines "AI toque de centella, / al adobado vino, / emisiones de balsamo divino" (CB 25:5; VO 697), he alludes to the "exercise which these souls perform inwardly upon the

will, moved as they are by ... two mercies and inward visits which the Beloved makes to them, which are called here "the spark is struck and the seasoned wine is drunk" (ibid.).

In addition to these images, St John of the Cross employs the variant of the must [or dark wine] of the pomegranate to indicate ecstatic knowledge and rapture, noting how. under the apparent multiplicity of the grains of the pomegranate, there lies the absolute and indisputable unity of God, represented by the intoxicating drink:

> Because, just as from many grains of the pomegranate a single must emerges when they are eaten, so from all these marvels. . . of God infused into the soul there emerges a fruition and delight of love, which is the liquor of the Holy Spirit. . . divine liquor (CB 37:8; VO 730).

It is precisely this fruit—the pomegranate—that marks the Sufi's arrival at the fourth stage on the road or in the mystical garden, and that symbolises, Bakhtiar says, "the integration of multiplicity into unity, in the station of Union" (30). TheBook of Certainty, insists on the pomegranate as emblem of the essence and ultimate oneness of God: "The pomegranate, which is the fruit of the Paradise of the Essence... in the Station of Union.. . is the direct consciousness of the Essence (ash-shuhud adhdhati)" (27-28).

The consequence of imbibing this spiritual wine or must is, as we might expect, not only knowledge of the divinity but also ecstatic drunkenness. Once more, the mystical traditions of East and West converge. The "gentle drunkenness" (CB 25:8; VO 697), whose relatively prolonged duration is underscored by St John, occupies a very specific place on the mystical path of 'Ala' al-Dawla Semnani: number 87 of the ninth stage of degree of ecstasy (Bakhtiar 96). In his Kashf aI-Muhjub, Al-Hujwiri makes a distinction: "there are two kinds of intoxication: 1) with the wine of affections (Mawaddat) and 2) with the cup of love (Mahabbat)" (117). In his "Spiritual Canticle" St John celebrates drunkenness with fewer theoretical details but also without indirection: After drinking in the Bridegroom's (or Beloved's) "interior wine cellar," "when I walked out / over that wide plain / I no longer knew anything / and I lost the cattle [i.e., "livestock" and therefore prob. "sheep"] that once I followed." It is remarkable how close those lines are to Rumi's

Diwan-e-Shams Tabriz): "I have no task but drunkenness and clamour." And yet St John finds this spiritual drunkenness an important task. He acquires through it a most prudent and advisable lucidity, for it implies a forgetfulness of and oblivion to the world: "that drink of God's most high wisdom which it [the soul] drank there makes it forget all things of the world, [which] in comparison with that taste is purest ignorance" (CB 26:13; VO p. 701). In his Kashf al-Mahjub, AI-Hujwiri had expressed the same insight in virtually the same words: drunkenness is "the lover's closing his eyes to the things of the world, in order to see the Creator in his Heart."

Yet as we noted earlier, the literature that the Sufis produce shows them to be generally more sophisticated and detailed in their elaboration of these technical conceits than St John is. Thus. we find in the Sufis the extreme delicacy (not found in John) of distinguishing between two types of mystical states: the mystical state of drunkenness (sukr.) and the mystical state wherein one is sober (sahw). AI-Hujwiri (11th c.) reviewed the long debate over which of the two states should be preferred. Al-Bistami and his followers preferred drunkenness, while Al-Hujwtri, following Junayd (who in turn is following his teacher). opts initially for sobriety. The arguments by which the distinction is made are of great subtlety, and they lead us to a curious question: Would St John of the Cross be classified among the "drunkards," like Al-Bistami? In an unexpected and moving apotheosis, Al-Hujwiri discovers that at the highest level of ecstasy, the apparent difference between the two states is obliterated:

> In short, where true mystics tread, sobriety and intoxication are the effect of difference (ikhtila/) and when the Sultan of Truth displays His beauty, both sobriety and intoxication appear to be intruders (tufayli), because the boundaries of both are joined, and the end of the one is the beginning of the other. . . . In union all separations are negated, as the poet says:
>
> When the morning-star of wine rises,
>
> The drunken and the sober are as one (180).

But let us return to the ecstatic drunkenness celebrated by St John of the Cross and most of the Muslim mystics. A drunkard speaks incoherently; likewise, a mystical drunkard will speak delirious words which somehow translate the untranslatable aspects of his spiritual experience. Once again, the Christian saint would appear to follow in the footsteps of the Sufis mystics who preceded him. From the martyr Ilallaj[212] to the late Spanish-American Sufi sect of the Shadhilites, there is an insistence that the true mystic is not the master of his own language:

> If the drinking persists and continues until the veins and joints of the lover are swollen with the mysterious lights of God, then comes the saturation, which sometimes causes [the drinker] even to lose consciousness of all things sensible and intelligible, and the subject becomes no longer aware of what others say or what he himself says, and this is drunkenness (Asin, Shadhilis 298).

The problem of incoherence becomes more acute when the spiritual delirium of these drunkards is translated into poetry, for it often becomes unintelligible, like that of lbn 'Arabi or lbn al-Farid. (We should note that in the Middle Ages the Sufis were producing a poetry which today we would consider "surrealistic.") The enigmatic lines of Ibn 'Arabi's Tarjuman, like St John's, often elude rational understanding, and the author, lbn 'Arabi himself, meditating upon the difficulties of human language in translating the Godhead, admits that many passages are mysterious even to him. For his delirious (or rapturous) verses— that "non-sense" that St John so staunchly defended in his own behalf (in the prologue to the "Spiritual Canticle" he tells us that his images "seem more nonsense than words set into reason") — the Sufi mystic employs the technical term shath], and the fact is that such verses are a very common literary phenomenon. In his Kitab al-Lum'a, AI-Sarraj (10th century) explains the origin of the term:

---

212 I,Iallaj's ecstatic exclamation "ana 7-haqq" ("I am the Truth For God]"), is famous in the Islamic world, and it brought him if not execution at least severe theological censure. Cf. Louis Massignon, Essui .sur les origines 283, and La Passion de Hallaj.

> Just as a river in flood overflows its banks (shataha 'l-ma' fi'I-nahr) so the Sufi, when his ecstasy grows strong, cannot contain himself and finds relief in strange and obscure utterances, technically known as shath (Nicholson, Kitab 100).

Delirium is a universal phenomenon, but St John of the Cross would appear somehow to be familiar with the specific image associated with that Arabic word shath.] ("that which is excessive or exceeds its proper bounds; excess," according to the Arabic-English Dictionary), which signifies "that which overflows its normal banks":

> Who could write that which He allows loving souls to understand? No one can, not even the souls themselves can; for that is the reason that figures, comparisons, and similes overflow something of what they feel and out of the abundance of the spirit pour secrets and mysteries that appear to be nonsense (VO 626).

(b) The dark night of the soul.

The symbol of the dark night of the soul. St John's most famous and most complex figure, left the distinguished St John scholar Jean Baruzi perplexed. Baruzi could never discover the sources that might have inspired this trope, and so he asserted St John's originality: "Aucun tradition n'avait besoin d'etre invoquée pour que nous puissons suivre le poete" (147). Baruzi explained that the "night"—a metaphorical night[213]—would be the way that particular spiritual moment of mystical experience would naturally have imposed itself on St John's intuition and his language.[214]

---

213 We say "metaphorical night" because there are many instances of evidence that St John meditated at night in the solitude of the outdoors. He also prayed with his face uplifted into the night, which he looked out upon from the window of his cell. Baruzi notes in this regard that "le poete mystique adherait au silence des espaces nocturnes ou s'abimait en une perception limitee, perception soudain exaltee et devenue comme un signe de I'univers" (288).

214

The clues that St John himself offers to this figure of speech are quite enigmatic. In Dark Night I:viii, after dividing the mystical state into a "sensual night" and a "spiritual night," he announces that he will speak briefly about the "sensual night" or (more precisely) "night of sense": "since more is written of it, as of a thing that is more common; and we shall pass on to treat more fully of the spiritual night, since very little has been said of this, either in speech [platica] or in writing, and very little is known of it, even by experience" (Peers, Dark Night 61).

It is hard to say what concrete sources St John might be thinking of here, hard to know whether he is recalling authors who either allude to the "bitter and terrible" spiritual stage or "dwelling" [morada] whose specific technical name is "night" or just describe the same experience that St John has called dark night. What is certainly the case is that given the subtle distinction that St John establishes between the "night of sense" and the "night of spirit," and given also his indirect but clear allusion to both oral and written sources, we are allowed, I think, to suspect that St John is acknowledging a spiritual tradition for his symbol.

This tradition is not easy to document, but certain partial antecedents for this enigmatic night have been found. A number (some close, some not so close to St John's figure) have been proposed by critics. Dámaso Alonzo (La poesia de San Juan de la Cruz. Desde esta laden') points out the sketchy symbolic outlines of the night in Sebastian de Córdoba and the stylistic traces of Garcilaso (perhaps through a recasting of Córdoba's formulation) that seem to be "recalled" by St John. In his book St. John of the Cross: The Poet

---

Evelyn Underhill (Mysticism 412) describes the spiritual state of the "dark night": "Psychologically... the 'dark night of the soul' is due to the double fact of the exhaustion of an old state, and the growth towards a new state of consciousness. it is a 'growing pain' in the organic process of the soul's attainment of the Absolute. . . . Parallel with the mental oscillations. upheavals and readjustments, through which an unstable psycho-physical type moves through new centres of_ consciousness, run the spiritual oscillations of a striving and ascending spiritual type. . . . (386) [Thel travail of the 'Dark Night is all directed towards the essential mystic act of utter self-surrender; that fiat voluntas tnu which marks the death of selfhood in interest of a new and deeper life." Significantly, Underhill titles the chapter describing this mystical dwelling of purificatory undoing "The Dark Night of the Soul." There seems no doubt that she borrows the term from St John of the Cross, for although many mystics go through the same spiritual process, none of those mentioned by Underhill employ the technical term "dark night."

and the Mystic, Colin Peter Thompson explains that the "dark night" is associable in the last analysis with the divine caligo or "luminous darkness" of the Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite, although Thompson admits that the symbol is much more elaborate in St John and that there are fundamental differences between the two writers: "[St John's] dark night is an intimate personal experience compounded of many features, whereas Dionysius is concerned primarily with the metaphysical gulf which lies between the human and the divine" (8).

Other critics agree to simply accept the differences: "the mystics. . . speak of the darkness of the night of purgation, and the dark night of the soul, but the Divine Darkness is in a different category from these."[215]

Indeed, despite the fact that St John quotes the Pseudo-Dionysius directly, and despite his undeniable general familiarity with the Areopagite's doctrines, with the Divine Darkness and "lightning-bolt of darkness"—that darkness which is an excess of light and which implies the transcendental knowledge of God that one cannot achieve through discursive reason—the problem of the apparent artistic originality of St John's "dark night of the soul" is still apparently unresolved.

Perhaps we can feel that we are somewhat closer to St John when we read St Gregory's Moralia, in which St Gregory does not limit himself, as the Pseudo-Dionysius does, to images of darkness and light, but rather includes interpretations of the sporadic mentions of "night" in Job and the Psalms (Psalms 42:8 and 16:7 [King James] and Job 3:3 and 3:23, for example) in terms of a spiritual experience, a spiritual process. It must be pointed out that the symbol of the dark night in St Gregory's -biblical commentaries is a variable thing, whose semantic content changes from one moment to the next—but the same can be said of St John of the Cross. St Gregory sometimes under-stands the biblical night as an "excess of light" whose power blots out the natural light of the intellect (and here we are very close to the Pseudo-Dionysius), sometimes as the dark night of this corporeal life,

---

215 See Dionysius the Areopagite, The Mystical Theology and the Celestial Hierarchies, London, 1949, p. I. The commentary "Darkness of Unknowing" appears to be anonymous, and is only credited as "Commentaries by the editors of the Shrine of Wisdom."

sometimes again as the tribulationis noctent which (we fully agree with Fr. Lawrence Sullivan's asessment) are quite close to those same tribulations in St John: "The Nox of Psalm 41:9 [New Catholic Bible; 42:8, King James] is. . . applied by Gregory (II 284) to a period in the spiritual life of all souls wherein they feel the withdrawal of God's protection, the loss of former consolation, spiritual weakness and emptiness and overwhelming sadness and darkness. This is a passive purification of the soul" (Sullivan 62-3).

Without in the slightest denying these probable Christian influences, we are forced, I think, to concede that St John's complex night overflows the boundaries of its supposed sources. We should recall—without entering into the small details that have so occupied the critics—that St John semantically expands and unfolds his symbolic "night," glossing it variously as a "movement which the soul makes toward God," a "deprivation of the savor in the appetite of things," a "faith," and "straits and sorrows," among many other senses. Sometimes we are close to the Pseudo-Dionysius: the night darkens the spirit but so as to give it light, for it empties the soul of the Created World in order that the soul may enjoy the Heavenly (N III: 9:1; VO 580). So plural are the meanings of the symbol[216] in St John that he seems to want two distinct treatises—the Ascent of Mount Carmel and The Dark Night of the Soul—to simultaneously explain his poem "On a dark night." And yet at least some of the modalities of his complex symbolic night (such as "straitness" versus "breadth" understood. as alternate spiritual states) are simply not to be found among the possible sources adduced by critics up to now. Once again: when we turn to Islamic literature, many of the enigmas of St John's most famous symbol are resolved.

Asin Palacios brilliantly' initiated the explorations into this literature. In his essay "Un precursor hispano-musulman de San Juan de la Cruz" and his posthumous book Shadhilis y alumbrados, Asin (somewhat timidly and, as we all know, under heavy attack from the critics of his time—when not utterly ignored by them) associated St John's "dark night" of the soul with that of lbn 'Abbad of Ronda and Abu 'I-Hasan al-Shadhili. Asin was the first

---

216 For an excellent study of the semantic richness of "darkness" in St John of the Cross, see Maria Jesus Fernandez Lebgrans, Luf i' oscuridad en la mist/ca espanola, Madrid, 1978.

to allow the possibility of a common source that would help to explain certain coincidences between Islamic mysticism and its Christian counterpart—such coincidences as the "dark night of the soul" conceived as a stage on a spiritual journey. Although the notion of Islam's being influenced by Western, Christian monasticism, an idea defended by Asin in his Islam cristiani;ado, is still controversial, we should recognise that some Sufis may in fact have been influenced by such authors as the Pseudo-Dionysius. But still, even supposing that medieval Muslim mystics might have received the rudiments of the symbol of the "dark night" from primitive Christianity, they elaborated upon it obsessively for hundreds of years, making it their own and endowing it with complex nuances that are not only immediately recognisable as Islamic but also—as Asin himself admits—impossible to trace to neoplatonic sources in the West. And it is some of these "untraceable" nuances of the dark night that we find in the writings of St John of the Cross, who would appear to have received the symbol--which could conceivably be of ancient Christian origin--in its now-Islamicized incarnation.

In his early essay, Asin studied the dark night as the mystical image employed by such latter-day Sufis as the Shadhilites of the eighteenth century; he did not explore the widespread occurrence and complexity of the symbol in Muslim mystics of earlier times. As we explore the symbol, however, we will find in those earlier writers and religious men several different modalities of the symbol, and those modalities are also to be found, as we have noted, in St John. And in almost all these, variants from the earlier centuries we find a presage of the spiritual night that St John of the Cross later moulded as no one in the sixteenth century had done.

As early as the twelfth century, Rumi celebrated his spiritual night in impassioned verses: "Into my heart's night / Along a narrow way / I groped, and lo: The light, / and infinite land of day" (Arberry, Sufism 1 17).

Abu al-Muwahib al-Shadhilt makes much the same ecstatic exclamation in his Maxims of Illumination:

> Oh night of love and happiness at home

> Its joy drove our steeds to dancing gaits in merriment... (48)
> Obscurity is not disgraceful to the man of perfection.
>
> For the "night of Power" [Koran, s. 97]
>
> is concealed while of all the nights 'tis the best (Jabra Jurgi 59).

The night is not, however, always a phenomenon to be joyously celebrated by the Muslims; often it is seen in terms of grief, pain, and anguish. Thus the author'of the Book of Certainty points out "the complete absence of the Lore of Certainty [that] corresponds to the darkest of nights" (67) and Lahiji (conceiving the night much as St Gregory does) feels it to be the night of our condition humaine: "Assumer la condition humaine, c'est se trouver dans cette nuit, ou plutót, c'est etre cette nuit" (Corbin, Trilogie 38).

One of the most complex theorists of Sufism, the thirteenth-century Najm ad-din al-Kubra_, whose treatise Fawa ih al-jamalwa-Fawatih al-Jalal (which I have translated into Arabic) Henri Corbin discusses in his book L'homme de lumiere dans le soufisme irannian, makes the distinction (and by so doing reminds us of the subtlety of St John's formulation) between the "Nuit lumineuse de la sur-conscience et la Nuit tenébreuse de I'inconscience. La Tenebre divine... Ia 'Nuit des symboles' au sein de laquelle l'ame progresse, ce n'est nullement la Tenebre" (20-21). Sa'di, on the other hand, says that he—exactly like St John--can "appreciate the prolongation of the long, dark night" (Smith 113) as a hard but necessary spiritual stage, and in a formulation still closer to St John Shabastari's famous Secret Rose Garden contains a line that is-known to every Sufi: "Nuit lumineuse, midi obscur!" (Corbin, Trilogie 117) (This is the counterpart of St John's "brighter than the light of midday."[217]) Shabastari's line has been the object of countless

---

217 The metaphorical play with a "luminously bright" night of mysticai experience would seem to be quite common in Muslim mysticism. This is Rumi's variant: "And the beloved is the moon beyond the horizons[.] which takes its resting place (qonug) in the lover's heart for just one night, since the night regards itself as white and luminous during full moon, the lover, dark night himself, becomes enlightened by the moon-like beloved" (Schimmel, Triumphal Sun 343).

commentaries, 'among them that by Lahiji, which is as complex and profound as St John's itself: .

> Comment enoncerai-je ce qu'il en est d'un cas si subtil? Nuit lumineuse, Midi obscur! (v. 125), s'scrie encore le poête de la Roserai du Mystere. Son commentateur le sait; pour qui a experiments cet etat mystique, una allusion suffit. . . . Et Lahiji s'enchante de cette Nuit lumineuse (hab-e roshun) qui est Midi obscur, mystique aurore bóreale... . C'est bien une Nuit, puisque lumière noire et abscondite de la pure Essence, nuit de puisqu'elle est en meme temps la théophaniques de / 'absconditum, en la multitude infinie de ses formes théophaniques... Midi, milieu du Jour... c'est-adire plein jour de lumisres suprasensibles... que Ies mystiques perçoivent par leur organe de lumière, leur I'oeil interieur... ; et pourtant Midi obscur, puisque la multitude de ces formes théophaniques son aussi Ies 70,000 voiles de lumière et de ténèbres qui occultant la pure Essence.... Null de la pure Essence, sans couleur ni determination, inaccessible au sujet connaissant. . . et pourtant Nuit lumineuse, puisqu'elle est celle que fait être ce sujet en se faisant voir par lui, celle qui le fait voir en le faisant étre midi obscur des formes théophaniques, certes, puisque Iivrées a elle-memes elles seraint tenèbres et non-êtres, et que dans leur manifesation meme, "elles se montrent cachees!" (Corbin, Trilogie 177)

This "divine night of the unknowable" ofSuhrawardi (ibid.) and Avicena (ibid., 20) marks distinct dwellings or stages (moradus) on the pathway to God. For Semnani, it is the sixth stage, the stage of "aswad nurani' or "black light"; for the critic - Corbin the "luminous night" is "I'etape initiatique la plus perilleuse" (151). For both Lahiji and Najm Rail, the night implies the ecstatic culmination of the mystical experience—the seventh and final stage, which is that of black light and which is "envahissante, anéantissaiite" (161), just as it is for St John. (We are close here, too, to the "lightning-bolt of darkness" of the Pseudo-Dionysius; we should note how the Sufis appear. to gradually adapt and reinterpret the ideas of the earlier mystic in terms of a spiritual process, and how this brings them closer to St John.) Niffari, from

the early tenth century, six hundred years before St John of the Cross, and with a theoretical intention that is clear enough to remind us inevitably of St John, also sees his personal "dark night" as a milestone on the pathway that leads to ultimate ecstasy:

> II me posa dans la station de la Nuit, puis II me dit: quand te survient la Nuit tiens-toi devant Moi et saisis en ta main la Nescience (gahl): par elle tu detourneras de Moi la science des cieux et de la terre, et en la detournant, tu verras Ma descente (Mawaq (Nwyia, Ibn 'Ata Allah 105).

The Persian poet Rumi envisions how in concrete terms the mystic should embrace and accept this "night" which will lead him to precisely that intuition of the essential oneness of God:

> Take the Leyla 'Night' (layl) on your breast, o Majnun.[218]
>
> The night is the secret chamber of tawhid [oneness of God], and the day idolatry (shirk) and multiplicity. . . (Schimmel, Triumphal Sun 346).

In the thirteenth century, Ibn 'Arabi repeated the theoretical assertion made by so many of his fellow Sufis (the assertion that was somehow to be picked up by St John of the Cross in the Renaissance): the "night" marks a stage or dwelling on the mystical road, and this stage is very close to the longed-for stage of Union, Oneness. It is the station of nearness (TAA 146) that is closest to the "risings of the dawn" or final possession of God. For Ibn 'Arabi, as for so many other Sufis, and St John as well, the ecstatic night is illuminated by lightning-bolts, abrupt manifestations of the divine essence. Often the parallels between St John and the Eastern mystics are quite close: in his thirteenth-century Ta' iyyat al Kubra (The Greater Poem Rhyming in T ), Ibn al-Farid makes poetry out of a trope which St John will employ in the sixteenth—the night of the senses: "And thou, illumined, knowest by His light / Thou find'st His actions in the sense's night" (Schimmel, Mystical Dimensions 277).

---

218 Rumt is playing with the Arabic word/name "Ley/a," which both means "night" (the "Thousand and One Nights" is "Ley/a Alf Ley/a") and is the name of a famous lover, one of the couple Leyla and Majnun, as famous in Islam as Romeo and Juliet in the West.

So important is this symbolic night for the Sufis that the author of The Book of Certainty associates the name of the most famous female lover in Islamic literature, the Muslim Beatrice or Juliet, Layla, with the spiritual dark night.[219] Little wonder: "Layla" means "night" in Arabic: "in Arabic stories and lyrics the beloved is so often named Layla (Night) for the night is above all a symbol of the Passive Perfection of Beauty. . . . [The] lover's desire may ... he taken to represent . . . his aspiration to the Truth Itself' (63-64).

Given this almost inevitable equivalence, we should not be surprised that even among the Spanish Moriscos of the sixteenth century, a group whose culture was being slowly strangled, we should hear the last echoes of this special spiritual night, with the night still.clearly understood as a stage of spiritual or moral suffering, as we see in these lines from a zajal to Muhammad, a version of which in aljatnlado has been transcribed by Julian Ribera and Asin Palacios:[220]

Quien quiera buena ventura  Let him who wishes good

---

219 One motif in secular Arabic poetry that clearly needs further study is the frequent figure of the lover who surreptitiously creeps through the night to find and meet his beloved. Some critics believe that this motif has been used in the "divine" sense in mystical literature. If that is true, we would, doubtlessly be quite close to St John of the Cross's poem "En una noche oscura...," which has that "plot" and which must certainly be understood under its divine aspect. James T. Monroe alludes to the secular Arabic poetic tradition in the following way: "In one section of his Risalah, the poet [Abu 'Amir ibn Suhail, 922-1035, writing under the Caliphate of Cordova] attends a gathering of literary critics who were discussing poetry. The discussion revolves around the topic of how a theme (ma 'na) can gradually be refined by successive poets. A theme is proposed: That of the lover who creeps softly through the dark to visit the beloved, doing so as quietly as possible in order to avoid being heard by her guardians. A good example by Imra'u 'I-Qays is cited, followed by a bad one by 'Umar ibn AN Rabi'ah" (Hispano-Arabic Poetry" 142). For'hrs own surreptitious nocturnal excursion, St John had used the "secret ladder." One of Rumi's favourite symbols, "again in tune with Sana'i's imagery, is that of the ladder or stair case (nardaban) which will eventually lead the lover to the roof, where the beloved is waiting" (Schimmel, Triumphal Sun 289).

220 Manuscritos arabes y aljamiados, mss. XII and IX. James T. Monroe cites the same zajal, collected also by Saavedra and Moragas, and associates it with St John's dark night; see Islam and the Arabs I l 1.

| | |
|---|---|
| Alcançar grada de altura | fortune |
| Porponga en la noche escura | |
| | and to reach a stage of |
| | highness |
| I'aççala sobre Mahommad. | |
| | propose in the dark night |
| | a prayer to Mohammad. |

Curiously, even the words that rhyme with "noche oscura" in the poems ("buena ventura" in the anonymous zajal, "dichosa ventura" in the famous lyrics of St John) are the same.

We have seen that the Sufis, in their widespread employment and elaboration of the symbol of the "dark night," would appear to foreshadow the sudden reappearance of the elusive "dark night" of St John of the Cross into the Spain of the Siglo de Oro—in fact make the appearance of the figure in St John seem not so strange or original as Western criticism has so long thought it to be. But the parallels or "coincidences" between the two employments go further yet. Asin Palacios (and it is only fair to repeat his words) has already explored how as part of St John's explanation of or glosses on the dark night, the poet uses a precise terminology that would seem to repeat very closely the terminology used by the Shadhilites hundreds of years before: The Shadhilites associated,hats-or expansion of spirit, which is an emotion of spiritual consolation and sweetness, with the day, and the qabd or "straitness / contraction" of spirit, the state of anguish or desolation, with the night, and particularly with the dark night of the soul (Asin Palacios, "Un precursor" 262, 272) wherein God plunges the mystic into despair so as to separate him from all that is other than Him. Surprisingly (because it seems so counter-intuitive), St John prefers the night or qabd to the day, as

the Shadhilites did, and Asin discovered that St John repeats in precise detail the nuances that the two technical terms possess in Arabic:

> The technical term gabd which as we have seen is the axis on which all Shadhili theory turns, derives from the Arabic root qabada, which has the following direct or metaphoric senses: "to take," "to bind," "to squeeze or make tight," "to pick up" or "grasp," "to contract or shrink," "to feel disgust," "to be sad," "to experience anguish," "to have a tightness at the heart." The term, then, functions in Arabic texts with the same rich variety of ideas that St John of the Cross expresses with the following Spanish words, repeated over .and over in The Dark Night of the Soul: "aprieto" ["straits"], "apretura" ["tightness"], "prisión" ["prison"], "oprimir" ["oppress"], "poner en estrecho" ["'constrain, put in a tight spot"], "tortura" ["torture"], "angustia" ['anguish"], "pena" ["sorrow"].
>
> Its opposite, the term bast, which in Arabic has the direct meaning "to extend," "to widen," "to dilate or stretch," "to open the hand," and, metaphorically, "to become happy," "to be comfortable," "to enjoy or take delight in," "to feel a sense of well-being," "to be glad," is also a synonym of the Spanish word anchura, "breadth," which with its two values, direct and figurative, is also used by St John of the Cross, though less frequently than "straitness" (Asin, Shadhills 117-118).

And in attempting to anticipate his critics' possible objection that there may have been a common early-Christian source for both the Shadhilites' and St John's use of these terms, Asin notes. referring mainly to qabd and bast, that "[eliminating] . . . the technical terms and the metaphorical images common to both schools because deriving from the same Christian and neoplatonic tradition, there still remains a not inconsiderable residue of common symbols and words that lack precedent in that tradition and that are exclusive to the Shadhilite school and the mysticism of St John of the Cross" (270-1).

The close parallels between St John and the Shadhilites do not end even there, for St John's "dark night" contains within itself and communicates the precise triple figuration of the Sufi qabd the "straits of the soul" because of the soul's purgation both passive and active; "spiritual desolation"; a "dark night" in whose darkness God reveals Himself to the soul more often than during the day of illumination or breadth.

Asin limits his study to the case of the Shadhilites, but it is important to note that the presence of the terms gabd and bast in Islam is much, much older. Massingnon points out that they are part of the Qur'anic lexicon, for they are in surah II, 246 of the Book ("God is close, but He is open-handed also"). We might ponder the literary significance of being able to document the technical vocabulary of St John of the Cross in the Qur'an of the Muslims, of the fact that the Qur'an may be one of St John's literary "contexts". . . But there is yet more: several Sufi commentators of different times and traditions repeat and comment upon these technical terms, among them, Al Ghazzali(cf. Asin, Esp rituulidad III: I65), Ibn 'Arabi (Tarjuman 56). Qushayri (cf Nwyia, Ibn,Allah 261-262), AI-Sarraj, Ibn al-Farid (cf Pareja, Rcligiosidad musulmanu 320). For the theorist Semnani, qabd / and bust correspond to stages 85 and 86 of the ninth register or list of the mystical path (Bakhtiar 96-97), while for the more poetic Kubra (Fawa'ih al-Jamal wa-Fawaiih al-.Jalal 43) "straitness and breadth are the heart's savor [or delight]," (al-qabd wa 7- bast dhait'y fi' 7- qalb ).

Annemarie Schimmel points out that the predilection for the state of qabd comes to Ibn 'Abbad of Ronda from "Junayd as well as by the school of Abu Madyan" (Mystical Dimensions 253). Junayd defended his strange preference in this way: '"when He [God] presses me through fear He makes me disappear from myself. but when He expands me through hope He gives me hack to myself' (ibid., p. 129). In the eleventh century, other mystics, such as Al-Hujwiri. alluded to the debates between the shaykhs (masters or teachers) over which of the two states. (qabd and bast, was preferable.[221]

---

221 Qabd (contraction) and bast (expansion) are two involuntary states which cannot be induced by any human act or banished by any human exertion. God hath said: 'God contracts and expands' (Kor. 11,246). Qabd denotes contraction of the heart in the state of being veiled, and bast denotes the expansion of the heart in the state of revelation (Kashf ).

When all is said and done, St John of the Cross's preference for straitness brings him closer to Junayd, lbn 'Abbad, Abeu 'I-Hasan al Shadhali, and even St Gregory, who in the Moralia briefly makes the association between day and spiritual peace. night and suffering.[222]

In the light of all the above, it does not seem reckless to suggest that the curious parts into which St John divides his mystical night—the three clearly delimited moments "beginning of night," "midnight," and "end of night" or "period preceding the dawn" (S ll: 2:1; V() 395)—may also be derived from Muslim or Arabic sources. In Arabic, the term atamah means "first third of the night" (Cowan, Arabic-English Dictionary) and some Muslim mystics such as Dhu '1-Nun make mention of a tripartite night. St John and Ibn 'Arabi are very similar in this also: for both, "the last third of the Night" (Tarjuman 95) implies the nearness of the dawn of divine knowledge.[223]

---

Both states proceed from God without effort on the part of Man... . Some Shaykhs hold that qabd is superior in degree to bast for two reasons: (1) it is mentioned before bast in the Koran, (2) qabd involves dissolution and oppression, whereas bust involves nutrition and favour. ... Others, again, hold that bust is superior to qabd The fact, they say, that qabd is mentioned before bust in the Koran shows the superiority of bast, for the Arabs are accustomed to mention in the first place that which is interior in merit.... Moreover, they argue that in bust there is joy and in yand grief' (Kushf al-Mahjub 374-375).

222 "Job's enjoyment of spiritual peace and prosperity is likened to Day, but in his sufferings he entered into a Night: 'Unde bene per prophetam dicitur: "In die mandavit Dominus misericordiam suarn, et in nocte declaravit" (Ps. 41:9). Misericordia enim Domini in die mandatur, quia in tranquilo tempore cognoscendo percipitur; in nocte vero declaratur, quia donum, quod in tranquillitate sumitur, in tribulationibus manifestatur'" (Sullivan, "St. Gregory's Aferal/a" 62).

223 St John of the Cross employs Biblical arguments to support his "three parts" of the night, but would appear to interpret the tripartite night of Tobias from fundamentally Islamic assumptions. The night is a purificatory spiritual path which culminates in the possession of God: "In the book of the holy Tobias [6:18-22] these three kinds of night were shadowed forth by the three nights which, as the angel commanded. were to pass ere the youth Tobias should be united with his bride. In the first he commanded him to burn the heart of the fish in the fire, which signifies the heart that is affectioned to, and set upon, the things of the world.... On the second night the angel told him that he would be admitted into the company of the holy patriarchs, who are the fathers of the faith.... On the third night the angel told him that he would obtain a blessing, which is God; Who, by means of the second night, which is faith, continually communicates Himself to the soul in such a secret and

Such stubborn insistence on this secret and initiatory night among the Sufis could perhaps have its origin in—or at least bear some relation to—the legend of the night-journey or isra' which Muhammad, "de nocte et nullo vidente" in the words of undo Martin (Asin. Escatalogia 583), makes to the seventh heaven. The origin of the legend is, once again, Qur'anic. Although sura XVII:1 refers very specifically to the experience of Muhammad the Prophet, the Sufis (as both Massignon [Passion 312] and Asin point out), "appropriate the legend and have the audacity to arrogate to themselves the role of protagonists" (Asin, Escatalogia 76). Annemarie Schimmel agrees: "The Night-Journey, the ascension to heaven to which the Koran (Sura 1711) alludes[,] ... has been interpreted from at least the days of Bayazid Bestami as the prototype of the mystic's flight into the immediate Divine presence and thus as a symbol for the highest spiritual experience" (Triumphal Sun 285). In the Book of Certainty, we see precisely how Sufis would comment upon and transform the Qur'anic verses into personal

spiritual experience:

> Verily we sent it down in the Night of Power. / And how canst thou tell the Night of Power? The Night of Power is better than a thousand months. / The Angels and the Spirit descend therein from the source of all decrees by the leave of their Lord. Peace it is until the break of dawn. (Qur'an. XCVII).
>
> [The] Chapter of Power, which if interpreted with reference to the microcosm may be taken as a hymn of the

---

intimate manner that He becomes another night to the soul, inasmuch as this said communication is far darker than those others. . . [and is] the complete accomplishment of the communication of God in the spirit, which is ordinarily wrought in great darkness of the soul, [and] there then follows its union with the Bride, which is the wisdom of God" (Ascent 1:2:2-4). Tobias 6:18-22 reads as follows: "But thou, when thou shalt take her, go into the chamber, and for three days keep thyself continent from her, and give thyself to nothing else but to prayers to her. And on that night lay the liver of the fish on the fire, and the devil shall be driven away. But the second night thou shalt be admitted into the society of the holy Patriarchs. And the third night thou shalt obtain a blessing that sound children may be born of you. And when the third night is past, thou shalt take the virgin with the fear of the Lord, . . . that... thou mayest obtain a blessing in children."

perfect soul's marriage with the Spirit, the "Night of Power" being the soul of the Saint, into which alone descends the

Spirit (62).

Such mystical and-allegorical commentaries on the mi'raj or ascent by Muhammad into heaven as this one—we should recall also lbn 'Arabi's Book of the Night-Journey to the Majesty of the Most Generous (Asan, Escatalogia 77) and perhaps Suhrawardi's Treatise on the Night-Journey (Nasr, Three Muslim Sages 59)—form a consistent tradition which once again strengthens the symbol of the dark night within Islam. Specific details of this tradition bring to mind St John. Bakhtiar's description (84) of this divine "Night of Might" of the Sufis might almost be a comment on the poem in which the soul of St John goes out on a dark night "without being observed": "The ascent of the Sufi occurs in what is known as the Night of Power, when the Heavens open. . . . [His] soul is as the darkness of night [like St John: "in the darkness. . . without [other] light or guide"]. [his] Heart, now full, totally reflects the sun [in the midst of the darkness, St John's heart gives off light .in the same way: "without light or guide, save that which burned in my' heart. / This light guided me More surely than the light of noonday."] which brings tranquillity, until the break of dawn." St John, too, in his night "more lovely than the dawn," at last sinks into a limitless peace: "I remained, lost in oblivion, . . . all ceased, and I abandoned myself' (VO. p. 363).

The work in which the Prophet's mi'raj is described' (a work translated into Latin and the Romance languages under King Alfonso X the Learned [cf. Munoz Sendino, Ewalt', and Metlitzki, Matter of Araby). is of course titled the Liber Scale Machometi (ms. Lat. 6064. fols. I05v/126v, Paris). Might there be distant echoes in this ascent of Muhammad to the ascent in the poem of St John of the Cross?—though of course this is a fairly common spiritual leitmotif which St John himself associates with St Bernard and St Thomas (cf.' above, note ?). Whatever the case, it is simply impossible that the word ascent, within the specific context of a secret and nocturnal "rising-up" of the spirit into the heavens, not remind one of the Muslim mi'raj St John of the Cross traces the general lines of the legend when he equates his own night-ascent with the "secret contemplation" during which "the soul ascends and climbs up to [lit. "rises to scale, know and possess] a knowledge

and possession of the good things and treasures of heaven" (N 11:18:1 (Dark Night 164); VO 601). Of heaven—curiously, St John here would seem closer to the legend of Muhammad's ascent into heaven than to the Sufis who transformed the myth into mysticism.

This mystical night of St John of the Cross and the Sufis becomes, last of all, the desired dawn of the beginnings—still hazy---of divine knowledge. In her essay titled "San Juan de la Cruz y Algazel: paralelos," Maria Teresa Narváez notes that Asin Palacios seems to have missed the close parallel between AI-Ghazzali and St John of the Cross in this aspect of the trope. Asfn's comments on Al-Ghazzttlf"s use of the image are as follows:

> Sometimes in his diva' adapting the conventional technical terminology of the Sufis, [AI-Ghazzali] calls the emerging lights and splendors of divine intuition "levantes" or "auroras" ( Tawali') [sunrises or dawns]. [He says that] the brilliance of' these splendors, though still slight, is nonetheless enough to blot out on the horizon of consciousness those things that are not God, just as the Sun with its still-pale splendor blots out the light of the stars (Espiritualiclad 279),

But let us look at how closely St John follows Al-Ghazzalf 's version of the image when St John glosses his lines "la noche sosegada / en par de Ios levantes del aurora" ("night sunk in a profound / hush, with the stir of dawn about the skies" in the Nims version) St John's words on this image make the schematic dawn a la divine in Sebastian de C6rdoba pale by comparison:

.. [Just] as the eastern breezes of the morning sweep away the obscurity of the night and reveal the light of day, so this spirit, calmed and quiet in God, is raised from the darkness of natural knowledge to the morning light of the supernatural knowledge of God [which is] not bright but rather (as the - saying is) dark. . . . Like night en par de los levantes [at the stirring of the dawn], all is neither night nor day, but, as they say, "between two lights" (CB 15; VO 670, quoted in Narvaez 87-88).

Even the peace and tranquillity of this morning-state upon which St John lays such insistence was foreshadowed by the Sufis: "The break of dawn

is the moment when the peace is annihilated in the Light of the Absolute, leaving only the Absolute Peace of Unity" (Bakhtiar 84), Thus St John of the Cross, after the dark night of his soul which culminates in the light that is brighter than midday, becomes one with God and leaves his cares "forgotten among the lilies.'.

**(To be Continued)**

# INFORMATION & COMMENTS

## 1. MUHAMMAD IQBAL AND THE ASIAN RENAISSANCE

Report: Muhammad Suheyl Umar

❋

## 2. CONFERENCE ON *ISLAMIC THOUGHT IN ANATULIA IN THE 12TH - 13TH CENTURY* — IN KAYSARI AND VISIT TO QUNYA AND ISTANBUL.

Report: Muhammad Suheyl Umar

### Muhammad Iqbal and the Asian Renaissance

"Poet, philosopher, social reformer and political activist, Iqbal was a multi-faceted genius in the tradition of Al-Razi, Ibn Sina and Al-Ghazali. Iqbal has also made a major contribution to the awakening of Asia after decades of colonial rule.

As an awakened Asia continues its humble journey of rediscovering its poets and philo sophers, its social reformers and political leaders, Muhammad Iqbal will be a shining light guiding Muslims and non-Muslims alike into the twenty first century because the life and thoughts of Iqbal embody the spirit of the Asian Renaissance.

It is to honour that life and those thoughts that the Institute of Policy Research (IKD) is holding this International Conference on Iqbal".

This is how the Institute for Policy Research articulated the motivating idea and basic concept which materialised into the grand event of a three days conference and four different events-exhibitions that accompanied the conference and enhanced its overall impact on the intelligentsia while making a successful outreach to the uninitiated masses. Here is a brief report on the salient features of the Conference/exhibitions.

The conference opened with the introductory speech of Dato Kamaruddiri Ja afar, Chairman, Institute of Policy Research, (See Anx. I) Kuala Lumpur. Dr. Ja' afar, introduced his Institute and its charter and gave details of the Renaissance Project that it had undertaken in connection with a civilization dialogue in which the rich traditions of Asia, that is, our histories, cultural and religious heritage should be first rediscovered and then recovered. According to him "This international conference-exhibitionscultural event on "Muhammad Iqbal and the Asian Renaissance" is a part of our efforts to deepen our understanding of the great contribution that Asia has made to world civilisation".

The Introductory speech was followed by the Keynote address H. E. Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif the Prime Minister of Pakistan, read by Dr. javid Iqbal.

The address met with a great applause from the gathering especially when it came to its concluding part which reads as 'follows:

It is primarily and above all a matter of civilizational and intellectual issues as the East has always been the repository of wisdom and spirituality and it is through focusing on the protagonists of this wisdom and spirituality that the East can make a significant contribution to the civilizational dialogue. It is in this respect that the Conference "Muhammad Iqbal and the Asian Renaissance" is to be regarded as an extremely important step toward this all important goal and I whole-heartedly associate myself with the present theme, which is directly related to us, and to the forthcoming events

in the series and pray that it would be helpful in creating a just and peaceful world order.

Keynote address of the Acting Prime Minister of Malaysia Dato Siri Anwar Ibrahim eloquently articulated his vision of the future of South East Asia and his admiration of Iqbal as a guiding force in the rediscovery of the Asian Self.

After his Keynote address the Acting Prime Minister inaugurated the three exhibitions mounted as parallel events to the academic proceedings of the conference, namely:

- Exhibition of the Iqbal Memorabilia
- Art of Aslam Kamal
- Book Sales

His keen interest in these was evident from the time he spent at each of these exhibitions and the queries he made about each and every exhibit and the themes of the paintings.

MUHAMVMMAD IQBAL AND THE ASIAN RENAISSANCE

*Academic Session*

The proceedings of the conference started on the. same day after the tea break. Twenty three delegates from 13 countries of the world attended the conference, contributing to a rich atmosphere of scholarly debates and active participation from the local audience. Details of the proceedings are as follow

Day One: 2 June 1997

| | |
|---|---|
| AM/PM | Arival of Participants |
| 8pm | Welcome Dinner for Conference Speakers |
| | Hosted by Hon. Anwar Ibrahim |
| | A cting Prime Minister, Malaysia |

DAY TWO: 3 JUNE 1997

| | |
|---|---|
| 8-9am | Registration. |
| | OPENING OF CONFERENCE |
| | Venue: The Ballroom, Pan Pacific Glenmarie |
| | Resort, Shah Alam |
| 9.00am | Introduction |
| | Dato' Kamarudin Jaffar, Chairman, Institute for Policy Research, Malaysia |
| 9.10am | KEY ADRESSES |
| | H.E. Nawaz Sharif, Prime Minister, Islamic Republic of Pakistan |
| | Hon. Anwar Ibrahim, Acting Prime Minister, Malaysia |
| 9.45am | OPENING OF EXHIBITION OF IQBAL MEMORABILIA AND THE ART OR ASLAM |
| | KAMAL |
| | BREAK |
| 10.30am | PANEL ONE: THE WORLDVIEW OF THE |
| | POET-PHILOSPOHER |
| Chairperson: | Dr. Surin Pitsuwan, Member of Parliament, Thailand |
| Speakers: | Iqbal: His Life and Worldview: |

Shan Yun, Professor of Urdu, Department of Oriental

Studies, Peking University, China.

Iqbal: His Metaphysical Ideas

Dr. Sheila McDonough, Professor, Department of

Religion, Concordia University, Canada

Iqbal's Relationship to Mysticism:

His Reconciliation of Science and Religion

Associate Prof. Dr. Azizan Baharuddinm, Visiting Fellow,

Institute for Policy Research, Malaysia

11.30am DISCUSSION

12.30PM LUNCH

2.00pm PANEL TWO: THE POETRY OF IQBAL

Chairperson: Philip Jeyaratnam

Advocate & Solicitor, Singapore

Speakers: The Poetry of Iqbal

Dr. Liu shuxiong

Deputy Dean, Graduate School, Peking University

Poetry of Iqbal

Muhammad Suheyl Umar

Director Iqbal Academy

Lahore, Pakistan.

Poetic World of Muhammad Iqbal

Professor Natalia Prigarina, Institute of Oriental Studies, Russian Academy of Science, Moscow, Russian Federation

3.00pm DISCUSSION

4.30pm BREAK AND END OF PANEL TWO

8.00PM DINNER

Hosted by Dato' Kamarudin Jaffar

Venue: Poolside, the Pan Pacific Glenmarie Resort

DAY THREE: 4 June 1997

9.00AM PANEL THREE: IQBAL AND THE QUEST FOR REFORM

Chairperson: Dr, (Fr.) Raul J.Bonoan, S.J. President, Ateneo de Naga University, Philippines.

Speakers: Iqbal as a Social Reformer

| | |
|---|---|
| | Mahmood Esmail-Nia, Diplomat, Tehran, Iran |
| | Iqbal's Quest for Social Justice |
| | Djohan Effendi, Jakarta, Indonesia |
| | Iqbal and the Concept of an Islamic Polity |
| | Seyyed Vali Reza Nasr, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of San Diago, U.S.A |
| | Iqbal and the Struggle for Freedom in the Muslim World |
| | Dr. Abdul Karim Soroush |
| | Kiyan Cultural Institute, Tehran, Iran |
| 12.30am | BREAK |
| 11.00am | DISCUSSION |
| 12.30PM | LUNCH |
| 2.00PM | PANEL FOUR: THE MUSLIM, CIVIL SOCIETY AND THE GLOBAL ORDER |
| Chairperson: | Professor Dr. Syed Hussain Alatas |
| Speakers: | The New World Order within the Iqbalian Framework |

Dr. Hafeez Malik, Professor of Political Science

Villanova University, U.S.A.

Iqbalian Idealism and its Impact on the Muslim World Today

Senator Dr. Javid Iqbal, Retired Judge of the Supreme Court of Pakistan

Iqbal and Reform in the Muslim World

Professor Dr. Chandra Muzaffar

Driector, Centre for Civilizational Dialogue

University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur

Iqbal's Views on the Occident:

The Relevance of a Vision for Europe's Muslim Communities

Professor Yahya Michot

Brussels, Belgium

3.30pm' BREAK

4.00PM DISCUSSION

5.00PM END OF PANEL FOR FOUR

8.00PM QUICKENING OF THE SELF:

A Celebration of Iqbal in Drama and Music

Venue: Dewan Tun Hussein Onn, Putra World Trade Centre

DAY FOUR: 5 June 1997

| | |
|---|---|
| 8.30am | PANEL FIVE: SYMBIOSIS OF CIVILISATIONS |
| Speakers: | Iqbals Critique of the "East" |
| | Suroosh Irfani, Senor Research Fellow, |
| | The Institute of Strategic Studies, Pakistan |
| | Iqbal's Evaluation of the "West" |
| | Professor Barbara D. Metcalf |
| | Dean, College of Letters and Science, |
| | University of California, Davis, U.S.A |
| | Iqbal and the Renaissance in Asia |
| | Professor Datuk Dr. Osman Bakar |
| | Deputy Vice Chancellor, University of Malaya |
| 9.30am | DISCUSSION |
| 10.30am | BREAK |
| 11.00am | PANEL SIX IS THERE AN ASIAN RENAISSANCE? |
| Chairperson: | Professor Dr. Chandra Muzaffar |

| | |
|---|---|
| | Director, Centre for Civilisational Dialogue |
| | University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur |
| Panelists: | Francisco Sionil Jose |
| | Editor and Publisher, Solidarity |
| | Manila, Philippines |
| | |
| | Senator Dr. Javed Iqbal |
| | Retired Judge of the Supreme Court of Pakistan |
| | Professor Pabitra Sarkar |
| | Vice Chancellor, Rabindra Bharati University |
| | Calcutta, India |
| 12.40pm | END OF PANEL SIX |
| 15.45PM | CLOSING REMARKS |
| | |
| | Abdul Rahman Adnan |
| | Director, Institute for Policy Research, Malaysia |

## EXHIBITION OF IQBAL MEMORABILIA

Exhibition of the Iqbal Memorabilia was the second part of the conference events, envisaged as a visual outreach to the non-academic and uninitiated masses informing them about the life and achievements of the poet-philosopher through a systematic display of various exhibits. It was unmatched by any attempt of its kind that went before it in the past. Unique it was in terms of its comprehensiveness and the impact it created through intelligently selected exhibits, displayed in an artistic and attractive manner. I

had a chance to arrange International conferences before, in 1986 (Tehran) and 1991 (Cordoba, Spain) and these were successful events in their own right. But these were purely academic pursuits with little or no interest for the local populace. Present exhibition, on the contrary had a much broader scope in that it succeeded in riveting the attention of a large number of visitors through a variety of mediums.

A large hall was allocated for the exhibition. Except for the entrance door all the three walls were covered by huge panels lighted with adjustable lamps. These panels were then used for mounting the photographs of Allama Iqbal in chronological order starting from the photographs of his father and his early life. Most of the photos were in 20 X 24 inch size. Left corner of the room displayed the turban which Iqbal used while his hookah was displayed in the right_corner. In the middle, beside the wall, stood a small table on which Iqbal's wrist watch and eye glasses were displayed. Centre of the room was occupied by two large tables. The first, lying in front of the entrance door, was used to display original manuscripts of Javid Nama, Asrar-i-Khudi and Rmmuz-i-Bekhudi, flanked with 11 original letters in Urdu and English. In the row. next to the MSS., first editions of Iqbal's Urdu, Persian and English works were displayed. The table adjacent to the it displayed representative samples of translations of Iqbal's works in more than 18 languages of the world. A small table on the right hand side of the entrance door displayed Iqbal's works in current editions as well as copies of the journals of the Academy (5 languages) and selected works on Iqbal studies.

The passage leading to the entrance of the exhibition hall was decorated by large sized panels displaying "A day from Iqbal's life", a narrative drawn from the memories of All Baksh, the faithful servant who served Iqbal till his last days. On one side of these panels a large Video Screen was installed which was used to continuously play several short documentaries on Iqbal's life and works and documentaries about the art of the leading Iqbal painters. These were:

1) Sha'ir Mashriq --- Beareu of Film and Publications

2) M. Iqbal --- prep. by Mr. Anis Nagi

3) Lala-i-Sahra --- prep. by Mr. M. Tariq

4) Ta'bir-i-Sukhan --- prep. by P.T.V.

5) Aslam Kamal and His Art.

The Audio System was used to play the musical rendering of selected Urdu/Persian poems form Iqbal provided by the Academy to augment and enhance the visual displays. The same cassette was used to provide the background music which continuously went on in the exhibition halls entertaining the ears of the visitors as well.

The exhibition was visited by a large number of scholars, students, statesmen, and people from all walks of life.

## BOOK SALES EXHIBITION

Outside the conference hall a special corner was allocated to exhibit and sell books of Iqbal and selected books on Iqbal studies and journals. The number of books sold and demands for move reflected that it was a success in terms of introducing Iqbal and disseminating basic materials of Iqbal Studies.

## MUHAMMAD IQBAL AN ARTIST'S PERSPECTIVE

The exhibition of Paintings and Drawings was given the title that we mentioned above. In a large hall, adjacent to the exhibition of the Iqbal Memorabilia, 36 paintings and 14 drawing of Aslam Kamal depicting various selected themes of Iqbal's poetry through a variety of mediums were mounted and displayed in an elegant manner. Aslam Kamal has painted and illustrated Iqbal for almost three decades and has won world wide recognition. The works displayed were among his best. The spell binding impact of the beauty of his art combined with the force and grandeur of Iqbalian themes captivated the visitors and they stayed on. The Acting Prime Minister, when he inaugurated the exhibition, became so interested and occupied with the masterpieces that he stayed on in the hall for a detailed survey of each and every piece. Conducting the chief guest, Aslam Kamal explained, briefly, each art work and the theme or themes it illustrated. At the end of this conducted art-tour of the gallery a special gift was presented to the Acting Prime Minister by the Iqbal Academy and the Artist. It was a large oil painting of Iqbal, nicely framed and captioned for the occasion. The

exhibition was visited by crowds of art lovers and admirers of Iqbal.Aslam Kamal was all the time busy in his exhibition in accepting congratulations, signing autograph looks and imparting the exciting experience of mysteries of painting the poetry of Allama Iqbal. Everyone of the delegates from 13 countries was keen to see him personally and to pay homage to his mastery It was amazing for Aslam Kamal himself that by virtue of his creative commitment to Allama Iqbal his name had been spread to these parts of the world alongwith the name and thoughts of the great poet philosopher. The appreciation and admiration it received is reflected in the following comments of Dr. Natalia Prigarina from USSR which is but one of the many comments made during the exhibition:

> ***I am deeply impressed by the work of the well known artist Aslam Kamal.. I was always fond of his portraits of Muhammad Iqbal which I met in the books, illustrated by this painter. One may say that he created an image of Iqbal's spirituality by laconic and elegant means.***
>
> ***His vision of Iqbal and his poetry is of high artistic merit, it combines the precise interpretation of Iqbal's poetic world and the free imagination of the master of art. His black and & white graphics are full of energy and expression.***

## QUICKENING OF THE SELF

### *A Celebration of Iqbal in Drama and Music*

Putra World Trade centre was the grand setting in which the events of the cultural evening "Quickening of the Self" took place. It was yet an other attempt to reach out for the common man through popular modes of entertainment. Staged on the two consecutive days of 4th and 5th June, this event of 2 hours length was divided into three parts. First part of the show started with a Tableau Drama in Malay and English languages based on the selections from Iqbal's Persian works, Asrar-i-Khudi, Rumuz-i-Bekhudi and Javid Namah; an interplay of light and sound, action and dialogues, alternating in Malay and English, it was performed by accomplished actors

and vocalist. It conveyed the salient themes of Iqbal's thought through the medium of drama and music in such an enchanting manner that the audience, which consisted of the high-ups of the Govt., including the Acting P.M., were visibly spellbound.

The second and third parts of the cultural evening comprised of a performance of Pakistani ghazal singing interwoven with recitations from Iqbal's Urdu/Persian works in translation. The vocalists from Pakistan were Salamat Ali and Azra Riaz supported by four musicians playing sitar, tabla, harmonium and violin. The performance was extremely impressive and musicians were both very well prepared and quickly achieved such a level of excellence in their performance that the whole assembly was greatly moved. The quality of pronunciation and style of delivery of the English recitations was equally superb. The show ended with the performance of the art of the four musicians, without any singing or recitation, enhancing the already elated mood of the audience and bringing the show to its close with its culmination in a magnificent blend of emotions and exquisite auditory pleasure. The Acting P.M., after a long interval of roaring applause, concluded the session with his appearance on the stage and congratulating the artists and performers. The same show was repeated for the general public the next day and with an equal level of success.

To conclude our report we would like to quote from the remarks made by Kamar ud Din Ja'afar, Chairman, IKD, which speek of their gratitude and reflect our contribution.

"Let me end by thanking the following persons and

organization who made this meeting possible.

The Rt. Honourable Nawaz Sharif, Prime Minister of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for his support;

The Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports of the Government of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for giving us all the support, particularly the loan of thee original manuscripts and personal belongings of Allama Iqbal to be displayed at this conference;

The Iqbal Academy, the Iqbal Museum, and the Lok Virsa for their co-operation during the preparations of this meeting;

Our special thanks to Mr. Muhammad Suheyl Umar of the Iqbal Academy for his advice and assistance; and to the Pakistani painter, Aslam Kamal, for his exhibits .

The Malaysian High Commission in Islamabad and the Pakistan High Commission in Kuala Lumpur for facilitating our organisation."

Report: Muhammad Suheyl Umar

**Conference on *Islamic Thought in Anatulia in the 12th - 13th Century* in Kaysari and visit to Qunya and Istanbul.**

Anatulia (now forming the central region of the Turkish Republic) was an area famous for its centres of learning and outstanding literary and religious figures in the Seljuk period. Foremost among the illustrious scholars and literary giants of that age — to mention just a few — are Jalal ud Din Rumi, Sadr al-Din Qunyawi, Dawood Qaysari. It was with a view to pay its tribute to this remarkably rich intellectual heritage of Islamic philosophic and literary tradition that the local government of Kaysari (a historic place in Anatulia) organized a 3 day Symposium on Islamic Thought in Anatulia, with special focus on Dawood al-Qaysari, the most illustrious son of Kaysari.

The Mayor of Kaysari invited the Director Iqbal Academy to participate in the symposium and give a paper on the influence of Dawood al-Qiaysari. with special reference to his commentaries on Ibn Arabi's Fusus al-Hikam. The symposium was very well attended. Delegates from various contries of the world as well as the Turkish scholars presented their papers and exchaned views in an atmosphere imbued with receptivity, understanding and geniun academic interest.

After the symposium, the Director Iqbal Academy travelled to pay his homage to the great sufi poet Mawlana Jalal al-Din Rumi. The invitation from the Mayor of Qunya, therefore, was gratefully accepted which resulted

in a remarkable two days stay in Qunya and the visit to the shrines of Rumi, Shams Tabriz and Sadr al-Din Qunyawi,

Bilim ve Sanat Vakfi (Science and Arts Foundation) a leading foundation for higher studies in Istanbul, had asked to devote a full day for them in order to give a talk on "Significance of Iqbal's poetry" and to lead a group discussion with the Executive Members of the Foundation. Flying back from Qunya, Director Iqbal Academy managed to spare two days in Istanbul, giving the talk and exploring the possibility of mutual cooperation and shared publications, especially Iqbaliyat (Turkish). The Turkish language issue of Iqbaliyat was not published, after its first appearance in 1993, during the intervening years. Agreement was reached to collaborate in the following three areas of activity.

1). Assistance in contributing/ translating/ composing the Turkish issue of Iqbaliyat.

2). Introducing Iqbal Studies (short courses) in their forthcoming academic programme.

3). Exchange of books/Journals.

4). Fascilitation and promotion of study and research in Iqbal Studies in Turkish.

**(Muhammad Suheyl Umar)**

## BOOK REVIEWS

# THE WIDENING BREACH

## EVOLUTIONISM IN THE MIRROR OF COSMOLOGY

**BY WHITALL N. PERRY**

Reviewed by: Dr. Muzaffar Iqbal

# CONFLICT BETWEEN ISLAM AND MODERN SCIENCE

Reviewed by: Marryam Jameelah

***The Widening Breach Evolutionism in the Mirror of***

***Cosmology*, Quinta Essentia, P.O. Box. 842, Bartlons**

**Cambridge, CB1 6PX, England, ISBN 1870196139**

Billion of years ago, primal 'cosmic dust; arrived at a tropismatic molecular organization of the amino acid constituents of protein, providing us the biochemical components of protoplasm. Then either through sophisticated filter-passing viruses or some other mechanism, the inanimate matter went through the mysterious transformation and became animate. Through evolutionary process and after passing through several stages, this matter became bacteria—the immediate ancestor of protozoa. Thus life started.

This is how evolutionists start the long story of creation. Different evolutionary theories differ in details, in the routes and paths that this inanimate object takes but they are all based on the same general principle that this matter enjoys an unlimited autonomy in space and time. Thus for the evolutionists, the inanimate matter as 'object' exists without the pole "subject'.

This theory has been challenged from so many perspectives, The Widening Breach challenges it from a cosmological standpoint. This refutation is based on the simple fact that Evolutionism suffers from a missing link and that there exists "no prerogative, cosmic principle or law by which this inanimate and subjectless hence limited___-pristine stuff could from its inception maintain over measureless time a perfect self-containment". The author asks:

> The point of all this is to ask simply, why should the pair subject_.—object alone, on the plane of manifested existence not be a 'pair', but be free form the tyranny' of interdependence or linkage to which all the other listed and unlisted terms without exception are subjected?

Twenty four years after the publication of his monumental A Treasury of Traditional Wisdom, Whitall Perry has come up with an intricate refutation of one of the most prevailing "scientific" theories of our times—a theory which has far reaching implications. Drawing on the spiritual resources of traditional wisdom, the author takes apart the whole edifice of evolutionism, as if piece by piece, refutes it and reconstructs the traditional worldview in a clear but, at times, complex prose. The book is divided into six chapters ("The Missing Link"; "Creation ex Nihilo"; "Contours of the Primordial Tradition"; "Realism to Nominalism: The Watershed" and "The Sundoor") and contains a list of suggested reading.

Using a wide range of traditional sources, the author attempts to place the subject/object polarity in its proper frame of reference. He affirms the primordial truth that the Being of all beings is but only one Being and that polarities appear only at the manifest plane of reality. This subject/object relationship is essentially the linchpin for the whole argument against evolutionism for there can be no object without a subject. Evolutionists may claim that one pole of a duality can exist in the total and unqualified nonexistence of its corollary or counterpart but such claims can not be valid for the simple reason that in the whole of manifest universe, not a single example can. be found to support this claim. On the other hand, the manifest universe is full of Subject/Object relationships which are expressed in numerous phenomena.—the regularity with which the heavenly objects move, the unerring functioning of all the laws of matter according to their properties and the inter-play of a wide range of dualities to produce logical result in the phenomenal, world.

Our world is merely one level of existence characterized by manifestation, individuation and action and the prototype for this polarity is Subject/Object. At another level, man himself is seen in the form of soul and body duality the long between the inward consciousness (the subject) and the outward body (the object) being Life. Since a total separation of subject from

object would mean immediate death, one cannot conceive of a universe (object) without a Creator (Subject). Quoting the words of the Welsh bard, Dafydd ap Gwilym (c. 1340-1400), the author puts it simply: 'A world without God is a world of nothing.'

Traditional Wisdom has always maintained that in this manifest world, the flow is from the higher to the lower and not otherwise. Evolutionists envision the process in the inverse direction, from below upwards, 'outwards to inwards, ascending from quantity towards quality, the higher evolving from the lower, The traditional view of creation has no room for any kind of mutation of the created beings. The Creator created man by a simple process: He breathed life into the 'dust' out of which Adam was formed; or in other words, He said Be and it was. At a later stage, Adam is exteriorized into man-and-woman polarization and they remained in that state as long as they obeyed God by abstaining form the fruit of the Tree. Thus cosmologically speaking, if one were to accept the claim of evolutionism then one would have to revers the whole scheme of things: "the Gospel of St. John inverted to read: And the flesh was made Word."

"Realism to Nominalism: A Watershed", the fourth chapter of the book, is a sweeping account of the history of the emergence of the modern perspective and the problems that have arisen due to the disappearance or transformation of the traditional worldview. Focusing on the loss of the traditional perspective and providing a brief account of the emergence of 'modern' worldview, the author recounts several instances of the reversal of sacred images, mutation of the beliefs hald by the ancients and the loss of the traditional reciprocal perspective of inwards/outward polarity. Even Realism meant exactly opposite to what the word connotes today: For the Schoolmen or Scholastics, the word meant that all seeming reality in our world is entirely infused by the sole ultimate Reality of the Universals or Ideas a propounded by Plato. In other words, for the Scholastics Realism was 'an assertion of the rights of the subject'; this axiom shows the primacy accorded to the subjective pole over the objective. In later times, Realism has come to signify the opposite: that matter and sense objects have a concrete reality in their own 'right'—a position that can be called 'an assertion of the rights of the object'.

The brief survey of the developments in the 'religious sphere' is followed by a short description of the philosophical currents which gave rise to the emergence of modern 'scientific' worldview: The last great Scholastic, St. Thomas Aquinas (1225?-74), was followed by the nominalist English Franciscan theologian William of Ockham (c1285-1349) who is like a "watershed in the separation between 'Light' and 'Darkness' in the Middle Ages" but even before him, the tendency to take the concrete fact for the final reality was apparent in persons like Roscellinus of Compiegne (c1122) who taught that the three persons of the Trinity are necessarily separate entities. Others have designated Ockham's tendency to reduce everything to the perceivable reality as Ockhm's Razor: "Entities are not to be multiplied beyond necessity". This angle of vision, later to be called the 'Law of Parsimony' functioned as "a fissure opening onto the quantitative and exterior pole of manifestation a breach that over the centuries would unloose the whole form of scientific mentality on which the modern world is fabricated."

Once the Pandora's Box was opened, there was no shortage of theories and slowly science lost the metaphysical and cosmological foundation which had been its home for centuries. The author correctly points out that the role of philosophers in the development of materialistic worldview was merely that of 'antennas' which captured the cosmologically induced intellectual obscuration. Francis Bacon (1561-1626), Thomas Hobbes (1588-1679), Rene Desecrates (1596-1650), William Harvey (1578-1657) and the British physicist Robert Boyle (1627-91) all contributed to the development of a mechanistic philosophy which reduced or attempted to reduce the reality to its outward signs only. But there were always those few who pointed out the dangers in reducing the traditional cosmic worldview to a quantitative, utilitarian worldview. Quoting Jami (d. 1492), the author sums up the wrong approach of these philosophers and scientists:

"Philosophers devoid of reason find

This world a mere idea of the mind;

Tis an idea — but they fail to see

The great Idealist who looms behind," (p. 70)

* * *

If the journey from Realism to Nominalism was the watershed between the two worlds.__the one still in contact with the Traditional sources and the other on the verge of breaking all ties with the Tradition_Nominalism to Atomism: The Outer Darkness, the fifth chapter of the book, describes the path that has pushed the modern man into the full grip of a distorted perception of reality so that now he feels quite comfortable with evolutionism.

> This capacity for gravitating towards the irrational seen as rational is the result of man's loss of contact with his inward center, combined with his innate sense of centrality notwithstanding. This, plus centuries of conditioning by bad philosophical systems, culminating in the dialectical materialism of Karl Marx (1818-83) and Frederick Engels (1820-95), a construction which holds that the observable world is real without any transcendent origin, a world independent of the mind of man, since 'matter by their perspective is logically and temporally prior to mind, itself being judged as nothing but an outgrowth of this matter. (p. 87)

Drawing an analogy from ' Melencolia'—an enigmatic copper engraving of Albrecht Durere (1471-1528), the master craftsman and artist of Nuremberg, living at the threshold of transition between the Middle Ages and our present world—the author describes how Durer's painting was a representation of the thought of his times as well as a witness to the things still to come. The heliocentric system of Copernicus appeared in print in 1543, just fifteen years after the death of Durer but it took another sixty seven years for Galileo to come up with his Sidereus Nuncius (The Starry Messenger), a book which opened up the vistas of outward vastness of the physical cosmos. But it was Johannes Kepler (1571-1630) who perhaps succeeded in 'eliminating the last vestiges of a vertical perspective' by providing a mechanical explanation of the universe and by replacing "Spirits" and "celestial intelligences" with forces.

Thus the stage was set for the appearance of Sir Isaac Newton (1642-1727) with his gravitational forces operating a 'clockwork' universe put into motion by god. He claimed in his Opticks, that "God in the beginning formed matter in solid, massy, hard, impenetrable, movable particles, of such sizes and figures, and with such other properties, and in such proportion to space, as most conduced to the end for which he formed them. ""This placed the physical world on a 'scientific footing' to which but not in which God is present.

But science has failed to come up with an explanation of the ultimate workings of the universe. No matter how strongly modern man my believe, at least theoretically, that the world is no more than a speck of dust scattered through the universe, he still has a strong sense of centrality of his own space and time. This breeds the illusion that the past was somehow inferior to the present_a particular condescension is associated with this illusion and words like 'undeveloped', 'simplistic' and 'naive' are used to describe previous eras. It is this 'chronologic snobbery' that has made it easier for the Theory of Evolutionism to gain converts. Charless Darwin (1809-82) was merely putting into words what was a already an established attitude. In the author's words:

> Reaching into the unknown depths of the Outer Darkness, Darwin with his inherited background of bad European philosophy could thus materialize an amazing progression of 'upward' emanations, beguilingly flattering to a contemporary humanity now supplied with all the arguments necessary for unabashedly presuming itself superior even to Caesar and Christ by the circumstances alone of chronological succession. (p. 87)

Drawin was not alone in voicing what had become a general attitude of his age. Hebert Spencer (1820-1903) filled in the moral and philosophical overtones. Still others joined to produce the corrosive mechanism through which modern man lost all concept of the Absolute. The role of Evolutionism in this process has been to provide the illusion that this' downwardness is actually a 'progress upwards' towards greater and greater mastery of the forces at work in nature and within man himself.

But the book ends on a positive note. The author feels that the world has cyclically passed beyond its materialistic peak of greatest objectification and even science is coming to recognize this change. Referring to the work of British physicist John Stewart Bell, he points out that Bell's Interconnectedness Theorem is a good point of departure. However, our present moment cyclically is described in the words of a Moroccan holy man:

> From now until the end of time, all the doors
>
> are wide open_the gates of heaven and
>
> the gates of hell.

The book is rich in anecdotes ranging from aboriginal people of the Americas to allusions to the Balinese temples. At times the persuasive prose soars into the realm of poetic deduction of truths:

> As for a diamond, a cedar, or a lion, how can one imagine there being a need or initiative tc 'mutate' into something 'higher'? Do nightingales sing and eagles soar better today than did their first progenitors?

Review by: Dr. Muzaffar Iqbal

# RELIGION AND SCIENCE

Maulana Wahiduddin Khan,

Translated by Dr. Farida Khanum, Dar ul Ishaat,

Urdu Bazar, Karachi-1. 1996, pp. 93. Rs. 45.00

*Islam Creator of the Modern Age*, Maulana

Wahiduddin Khan, translated by Dr. Farida

Khanum, Dar ul Ishaat, Urdu Bazar, Karachi-1.

1996, pp. 128, Rs. 51.00.

The author of both these booklets is a well-known Indian Muslim writer whose score of works on Islamic subjects has been translated form the Urdu original into Arabic and English. First published in India, his books quickly gained popularity in Pakistan. The significance of the two under review lies in the fact that the view expressed by the writer can be considered unfortunately to represent the dominant thinking of mainstream Muslim scholarship in Muslim countries today on the question of the relationship between the modern scientific outlook and Islam.

Wahiduddin's Religion and Science convincingly shows the futility of leaders of the modern scientific outlook, such as the late Alexis Carrel, Julian Huxley and Bertrand Russell, to successfully construct all by themselves a godless man made scientific "religion" to replace the so-called "obsolete" traditional religions of the past. He shows why science in its present form can never discover absolute truth or ultimate Reality because its gaze, based on reductionism, it fixed in the opposite direction. Religion embraces the whole of invisible reality while science dissects matter into tiny pieces for observation and experiment. There would be no conflict between the two if only science confessed its limitations and demanded recognition as legitimate only facts discovered within its own restricted, narrow domain. Trouble arises when the modern scientific outlook claims to be the only truth and explicitly denies any worthwhile knowledge beyond sense perception.

Darwinian evolution — the pseudo-scientific theory propagated in every school, college and university has resulted in the most wide-spread disbelief and irreligion throughout the world on a massive scale. Although effectively refuted scientifically by some of the most reputable and distinguished of western scientists, their findings, -proving the fallacy of evolution, are deliberately ignored and disparaged because evolutionary progress happens to he the ideological pillar of modern western civilization without which it could not continue to exist in its present form. Wahiduddin says that, though evolution can never be proven by observation or experiment, even if accepted, it does not necessarily prove the absence of God since creation could not exist without the Creator. Much more convincingly, he could have argued that life can never be transformed from inanimate matter, no group of life has ever been known to have arisen from any other species, that quality can never arise from mere quantity nor the greater from the lesser. Mere animal instinct has never been known to becomes human intelligence. Darwinianism has been most eagerly accepted and propagated, not because it is scientifically proved, which is impossible, but because it offers the most attractive explanation for atheism and materialism.

Unfortunately, these merits do not apply to the second booklet under review, Islam, Creator of the Modern Age which can be fairly judged as no more than a mediocro apologetic tract filled with distortions and errors.

Here Wahiduddin propagates the monstrous fallacy of the whole of ancient mankind living in pitch-black darkness, his thought only a crude mass of superstition. Today, he exclaims ecstatically, we are living in the dazzling sunshine of scientific enlightenment. The key to this historic transformation was the Holy Prophet and Holy Qur'an which replaced the superstition of polytheism with the truth of monotheism. He says, polytheistic superstition invests nature and natural phenomena with misplaced sanctity and awe. As long as nature was regarded as sacred, it could not be investigated, exploited and conquered for the welfare of man. He claims that Islam, regarding nature as profane and natural phenomena as ordinary events, provided the incentive for the spectacular development of Arab science and learning under the Abbasids and especially Muslim Spain. All of this was transferred to Europe in Latin translations which eventually inspired the Renaissance, the Enlightenment, the French and American democratic revolutions and the

industrial and technological revolutions which were to follow. Then he makes the sweeping claim that without Islam, there could be no "progress": thus Islam as creator of the modern age!

All of this is an absurd ludicrous retrospection of present-day thinking into the distant past where current concepts of "progress" were conspicuous by their total absence. Even Ibn Khaldun's concept of history was cyclic and not progressive, Muslim scholars pursued a disinterested quest for knowledge for its own sake while to modern scientists and technocrats, it is a purely utilitarian enterprise for purposes of control, domination, power and conquest. Furthermore, the natural sciences in traditional Islamic civilization were never central as they are today but peripheral status while the best minds were concentrated on the study of Shar'iat or sacred law and tassawuf (Sufism).

Any idea of the conquest of nature was foreign to pre-colonial Muslims. For example, although the principle of the steam engine was well known to them, as it was to the ancient Greeks, complex machines were restricted to toys for purposes of amusement only; it was unthinkable to employ them for industrial production. Likewise, printing was deliberately suppressed, not being accepted by Muslims until after being subjected by the West for fear that the mass printed word might desecrate Holy Qur'an and other sacred writings. Although al-Biruni knew long before Copernicus that the earth revolved around the sun, this was not propagated lest the spiritual, social and cultural equilibrium be disturbed. Even if under Muslim domination progress in natural sciences 'is conceded, these studies were always subjected to severe restraint while modern science refuses to recognize any limit, on its activities or applications with the catastrophic results we daily see all round us,

The fact that none of the learned Muslim scholars dared profane nature to the extent that the scientific or technological revolution could take place, It was impossible for Muslims to do so without betraying Islam. So it did not and could not happen there, being wholly a product of the modern West. Furthermore, the sciences as pursued by these Muslim scholars were totally different in aims and ideals from modern science as we know it today, By identifying the latter as merely a continuation of the former and Islamic civilization the parent of the European Renaissance, Wahiduddin misrepresents history.

Contrary to Wahiduddin's claims the early Muslims had a profound respect for virgin nature and the natural phenomena in which they saw the "signs" and presence of God. The deep compassion and respect with which the Holy Prophet treated animals is proof of this. Once a man carelessly plucked some leaves from a tree, The Holy Prophet rebuked him, saying "Every leaf glorifies Allah." The Holy Qur'an says that the seven heavens and all creatures on earth sing the praises of Almighty Allah, including the birds in flight, though we poor humans understand not their praise. Pre-colonial Muslims never attempted any "conquest of nature" but tried their utmost to live in harmony and equilibrium with it. In so doing they were innocent of modern science's attempts to dehumanize man and destroy the earth,

Wahiduddin commits his more serious errors in his unquestioned assumption that modern science and technology is an unmixed blessing for mankind. He has nothing to. say about the ugliness and degradation of modern industrialism or the acute environmental crisis which threatens the continuation of all life on earth, At least, the pre-colonial Muslims cannot be blamed as responsible.

Contrary to Wahiduddin's claims, the modern age could not originate in Dar ul Islam because its civilization was traditional and orthodox, in harmony with the rest of humanity beyond the boundaries of North-Western Europe. Modernity was wholly foreign to Islam and Muslim until forcibly imposed upon them by European colonialism and imperialism.

The sad result of this hook's apologetic misrepresentation and distortion 'of history for the emotional gratification of his readers is nothing short of intellectual dishonesty_ in short, making the complete westernization of Muslim lands and peoples appear legitimate, thus unintentionally guilty of utmost disservice to the cause of Islam.

Reviewed by:

**Maryam Jameelah**